# HIGHWAY RESEARCH BOARD 

Bulletin 178

## Vehicle Performance

As Affected by

Pavement Edge Lines and Traffic Signals


National Academy of Sciences-

## HIGHWAY RESEARCH BOARD

## Officers and Members of the Executive Committee

## 1958

## OFFICERS

C. H. Scholer, Chairman<br>Pyke Johnson, Second Vice Chairman<br>Fred BurgGraf, Director<br>Elmer M. Ward, Assistant Director

## Executive Committee

Bertram D. Tallamy, Federal Highway Administrator, Bureau of Publec Roads (ex officio)
A. E. Johnson, Executive Secretary, American Association of State Highway Officials (ex officio)
Louis Jordan, Executive Secretary, Division of Engineering and Industrial Research, National Research Council (ex officio)
Rex M. Whitton, Chief Engineer, Missouri State Highway Department (ex officio, Past Chairman 1957)
K. B. Woods, Head, School of Civil Engineering, and Director, Joint Haghway Research Project, Purdue Universtty (ex officio, Past Chairman 1956)
R. R. Bartlesmeyer, Chief Highway Engineer, Illinois Divzsion of Highways
J. E. Buchanan, President, The Asphalt Institute
W. A. Bugge, Director of Highways, Washington State Highway Commission
C. D. Curtiss, Special Assistant to the Executive Vice President, American Road Builders Association
Harmer E. Davis, Director, Institute of Transportation and Traffic Engineering, Universety of California
Duke W. Dunbar, Attorney General of Colorado
Francis V. du Pont, Consulttng Engineer, Washington, D. C.
Pyke Johnson, Consultant, Automotive Safety Foundation
Keith F. Jones, County Engineer, Jefferson County, Washington
G. Donald Kennajy, President, Portland Cement Association

Burton W. Marsh, Darector, Traffic Engineering and Safety Department, American Automobile Association

Glenn C. Richards, Commissioner, Detroit Department of Public Works
C. H. Scholer, Head, Applied Mechanics Department, Kansas State College

Wilbur S. Smith, Welbur Smith and Associates, New Haven, Conn.

## Editorial Staff

Fred Burggraf
2101 Constitution Avenue

Elmer M. Ward
Herbert P. Orland
Washington 25, D. C.

## HIGHWAY RESEARCH BOARD

## Bulletin 178

## Vehicle Performance

As Affected by

# Pavement Edge Lines and Traffic Signals 

PRESENTED AT THE
Thirty-Sixth Annual Meeting
January 7-11, 1957


1958
Washington, D. C.

# Department of Traffic and Operations 

Donald S. Berry, Chairman<br>Professor of Civil Engineering<br>Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois

David M. Baldwin, Executive Secretary, Institute of Traffic Engineers, Washington, D.C. Maynard Beebe, New York State Department of Public Works, Albany
Don Blanchard, Society of Automotive Engineers, New York
Lloyd M. Braff, General Manager, Department of Traffic, Los Angeles
James S. Burch, Engineer of Statistics and Planning, North Carolına State Hıghway Commission, Raleigh
J. Douglas Carroll, Jr., Director, Chicago Area Transportation Study, Chicago
F. B. Crandall, Traffic Engineer, Oregon State Highway Commission, Salem
J. E. P. Darrell, Traffic and Planning Engineer, Minnesota Department of Highways, St. Paul
Bruce D. Greenshields, Traffic Engineer, Transportation Institute, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor
E. H. Holmes, Assistant Commissioner for Research, Office of Research, Bureau of Public Roads
George W. Howie, Director of Public Utilities, Cincınatti, Ohio
Fred W. Hurd, Director, Bureau of Highway Traffic, Yale University, New Haven
Norman Kennedy, Assistant Director, Institute of Transportation and Traffic Engineering, University of Califorma, Berkeley
Eugene Maier, Director, Department of Traffic and Transportation, Houston, Texas
Alger F. Malo, Director, Department of Streets and Traffic, Detroit
Burton W. Marsh, Director, Traffic Engineering and Safety Department, American Automobile Association, Washington, D. C.
Adolf D. May, Jr., Department of Civil Engineering, Mıchigan State Unıversity, East Lansing
Harold L. Michael, Assistant Director, Joint Highway Research Project, Purdue University, Lafayette, Indiana
D. Grant Mickle, Director, Traffic Engineering Division, Automotive Safety Foundation, Washington, D.C.
William J. Miller, Jr., Deputy Chief Engineer, Delaware State Highway Department, Dover
J. P. Mills, Jr., Traffic and Planning Engıneer, Virginia Department of Highways, Richmond
Harry Porter, Jr., Director, Inventory Division, National Safety Council, Chicago
C. A. Rothrock, Engineer of Preliminary Location and Design, Preliminary Engineering Section, Ohio Department of Highways, Columbus
Wilbur S. Smith, Wilbur Smith and Associates, New Haven, Connecticut
H. P. Stockton, Jr., Manager, Texas Highway Planning Survey, Texas Highway Department, Austin
K. A. Stonex, Assistant Director, General Motors Proving Grounds, Milford, Michigan

George M. Webb, Traffic Engıneer, California Divisıon of Highways, Sacramento
Edward G. Wetzel, The Port of New York Authority, New York

## CONTENTS

PLATOON MOVEMENT OF TRAFFIC FROM ANISOLATED SIGNALIZED INTERSECTIONBrian J. Lewis ..... 1
PAVEMENT EDGE LINES ON TWENTY-FOUR FOOT SURFACES IN LOUISIANA
I. L. Thomas, Jr. ..... 12

# Platoon Movement of Traffic From an Isolated Signalized Intersection 

BRIAN J. LEWIS, Civil Engineer, Skidmore, Owings and Merrill San Francisco, California


#### Abstract

The paper discusses an investigation of the extent to which motor vehicles remain bunched together when traveling freely down a semi-expressway type of facility after having been formed into platoons by an isolated signalized intersection. Observations of space-time data were made at five different locations downstream from a signalized intersection at distances up to 0.65 mi . The subsequent analysis shows that a definite pattern of vehicle performance prevails, and a method is suggested for coordinating the timing of a second traffic signal, placed at any distance up to 0.65 mi , to afford less delay to the traffic stream than if the signal were allowed to operate in some entirely random manner.


- THE TIMING of traffic signals to produce a coordinated progressive system on an urban street has been the subject of considerable attention by traffic engineers (1, 2), but there appears to be a dearth of literature on the subject of the mantenance of vehicle platooning on urban streets (3), and none on the extent to which vehicles remain together on an open road after leaving a signalized intersection. The Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (4), section 211, infers that it is impractical to coordinate two signals if the distance between them is more than $1,200 \mathrm{ft}$, and the Traffic Engineering Handbook mentions that sometimes signals as far apart as $2,500 \mathrm{ft}$ may be coordinated. However, it should be remembered this is for an urban street where a speed limit is in force, and the vehicles are not free flowing in the fullest sense.

The platooning of vehicles (the extent to which vehicles remain in a compact group) has not been defined in terms of any exact parameter, and the attempts that have been made by some workers (5) led to the conclusion that examination of space-time data in the laboratory, to decide when a platoon ceased to be a platoon, by different workers led to different conclusions. The personal equation had not been satisfactorily resolved.

It is not the purpose of this paper to define a measure of platooning but to examine the space-tıme distribution of free-flowing vehicles on a semi-urban street after they had been effectively formed into platoons by a signalized intersection. Thereby it is hoped to show that a definite pattern of vehicle performance prevails, and a traffic signal placed some distance down the highway from the issuing intersection could afford less delay to the traffic stream of coordinated in some way with the first signal than if allowed to operate in an entirely random maner.

This investigation was prompted by an existing traffic situation in Richmond, Califorma. Free flowing traffic on a major 4-lane highway passed through a signalızed intersection, and, 0.81 mi farther along, the highway passed through another signalized intersection which had only a very small volume of side street traffic. Casual observation made it appear that far too often the second signal, which was vehicle actuated, turned to main street red just before a platoon of vehicles arived thus delaying the main body of the platoon. The signal had been "held" on main street green by the "tailenders" of the previous platoon and "had no way of knowing" the main body of the platoon was about to approach. Had the signal been coordinated with the previous intersection, the main street red could have been injected to delay only one or two tallenders, rather than waiting for a predetermıned gap in the traffic stream before switching to side street green. The investigation was, therefore, to determine whether the platooned vehicles arrived at a point some 0.81 mi distant from the issuing signal in any relatively constant pattern.

## LOCATION OF TEST SITE

The site chosen for the investigation was the intersection of East Shore Highway and

Carlson Boulevard at Richmond. The signal at this intersection is 3-phase trafficactuated.

Traffic moving southwards on East Shore out of this intersection has a virtually clear run for 0.81 mi to the next signal at Central Avenue. Several minor residential streets intersect the highway in this section, however, the volume of turn-on and turn-off traffic is very small and for all practical purposes the flow may be considered to be uninterrupted. There are two lanes in each direction, designated the curb lane and the center lane, with a 4 ft wide painted center dividing strip. The road is posted with a 45 mph speed limit.

The highway rises slightly to the south with the crest of the rise at 0.55 mi south of the signal. The signal at Central Avenue is 2-phase traffic-actuated, and is first seen by the driver of a southbound vehicle when about 0.60 ml south of Carlson Boulevard. The traffic on Central Avenue does not usually exceed 150 vehicles per hour, and at peak periods the traffic on East Shore is about 2,000 vehicles per hour.

## COLLECTION OF DATA

The following data were recorded with a 20 channel Esterline-Angus recorder, the pens being actuated by the observers: (a) the time at the beginning and end of the green and red signals southbound on East Shore Highway at Carlson Boulevard, (b) the time when vehicles passed a station at a known distance south of the intersection, (c) a distinction was made between cars and trucks and whether vehicles were in the curb or center lane, (d) a separate record was made of the first vehicle in each platoon.

Records were taken at 5 different stations south of the signal, at $0.03,0.21,0.34$, 0.50 , and 0.65 mi . These stations were designated $1,2,3,4$, and 5 , respectively. Care was taken to ensure that similar climatic conditions prevailed on each afternoon that data was collected. Data were taken only between $1 \mathrm{p} . \mathrm{m}$. and 5: $30 \mathrm{p} . \mathrm{m}$. on middle weekdays in an effort to reduce possible variations.

## ANALYSIS OF THE DATA

Data were transcribed from the recorder charts by single signal cycles. Although


Figure 1. Frequency distributions of vehicle arrival times at 5 stations.


Figure 2. Frequency distributions of arrival times of first vehicle in a platoon at 5 stations distant from the signal.
the number of vehicles in each station sample was approximately the same, the number of cycles showed slightly greater variation (Table 1).

TABLE 1
SAMPLE SIZES

| Station | No. in Sample | No. of Cycles | Veh. per Cycle |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 2,082 | 120 | 17.35 |
| 2 | 2,334 | 175 | 13.32 |
| 3 | 2,113 | 120 | 17.61 |
| 4 | 2,390 | 136 | 17.57 |
| 5 | 1,951 | 104 | 18.75 |

Although not a rigorous measure of replication of conditions, the number of vehicles per cycle is fairly constant. The low figure for station 2 is explained by the fact that a larger number of the cycles investigated were in the off-peak period.

It was not known what effect the presence of trucks would have on the behavior of the general traffic stream; therefore, a distinction was made, in recording, between trucks and automobiles. A Chi-squared test was conducted on the ratio of trucks to cars for each afternoon to see if there was any significant difference between days in the nature of the traffic. The calculation revealed a probability of 4.93 percent, which satisfies a 2.5 percent level of significance. There was not a difference, as the probability falls just short of the 5 percent level. In the light of later analysis it was felt that the level of 4.93 percent was high enough for it to be assumed that the variation of car-truck ratio for different afternoons would
not have any significant effect on the phenomenon under investigation. The average proportion of trucks was 12.6 percent of the total number of vehicles.

It was noticed that there was a tendency for vehicles to change lane with increasing distance from the signal. A Chi-squared test showed that the movement of cars from the curb lane to the center lane with increasing distance was significant for automobiles, but that the distribution of trucks between the two lanes was constant regardless of the distance from the signal. A Chi-squared test on the distribution of all vehicles by lanes showed the movement from curb to center lane with increasing distance to be significant (the proportion of cars to trucks was sufficiently great for the effect of the cars to completely outweigh the effect of the trucks). It was concluded that slight variations of the car-truck ratio would not have any effect on the over-all traffic performance, and hence the 4.93 percent level of probability was acceptable.

Reduction of the data gave traffic distribution by $1-s e c$ intervals, and it was felt that as the data were already available in this form accuracy would be lost if the vehicles were grouped into say $2-$, $3-$, or $5-\sec$ intervals. However, 1 -sec intervals led to "uneven" frequency diagrams-accordingly all frequency diagrams were plotted as smoothed frequency polygons. This method employs moving averages and is acceptable for obtaining an approximation to the probable frequency curve or theoretical law being measured (6).

In all tables and graphs frequencies quoted are the smoothed values obtained by summing the frequencies in the particular interval and the two adjacent intervals and dividing by three. The area under the curve remains unaltered by this adjustment.

The frequency curves of arrival times of all vehicles at each of the five stations are shown in Figure 1 as a percent of total vehicles in 1 -sec frequency intervals. Near the signal the distribution is sharply peaked with little or no tail, but at greater distances the curve 1 s less peaked with a long tail. This is because the fastest and slowest vehicles do not have an opportunity to become appreciably detached from the main body of the platoon until about a quarter of a mile has been traversed. In every case the complete range of arrival times at a particular station is about 100 sec , which is


Figure 3. Frequency distributions of arrival times of nth vehicle in a platoon.
the average length of the signal cycle during the peak period. However, the majority of these "end" vehicles in the distribution are either turn-on vehicles or "free right turns" at Carlson Boulevard, neither of which were accounted for separately on the record.

Single vehicles are, in effect, very short platoons; therefore, the frequency distributions of the arrival times of the nth vehicle in a platoon were evaluated. Bartle (3) has reported that for higher values of $n$ the frequency polygon is adversely affected by light volumes (small platoons). However, as the average number of vehicles per cycle southbound on East Shore was approximately 17, a study of the arrival times of the nth vehicle at the five stations for values of $n$ of $1,2, ` 3,6$ and 8 would yield useful information that would not be biased by any small cycles or small platoon parameter. The smoothed frequency polygons are reproduced in Figures 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7.


Figure 4. Frequency distributions of arrival times of nth vehicle in a platoon.
By comparing the frequency polygon for the arrival time of the first vehicle at each of the five stations (Figure 2) with the frequency polygons for all the vehicles (Figure 1), the single car diagram exhibits the same decay tendency with increasing distance, and this effect is also found to be present if a comparison is made between frequency diagrams for the 2nd, 3rd, 6th and 8th vehicles.

The mean arrival time of the nth vehicle at each of the five stations was also calculated and plotted with respect to distance (Figure 8). A linear relationship existed between mean arrival time of the nth vehicle and distance. Statistical analysis showed the degree of correlation to be very significant for each of these lines.

Bartle has discussed the study of the percentile ranges in the arrival time distribution for traffic proceeding along an urban street with a coordinated signal system. He thought that the standard seml-inter-quartile range, the difference between the 25th and the 75th percentiles, was not entirely satisfactory because the distribution of the first 25 percent of all vehicles is important. He decided more or less arbitrarily that


Figure 5. Frequency distributions of arrival times of nth vehicle in a platoon.


Figure 6. Frequency distributions of arrival times of nth vehicle in a platoon.
the difference between the 5th and 55th percentiles was a representative range, although it was not capable of rigorous statistical use. The first 5 percent are likely to be exceptional drivers, probably driving well in excess of the speed limit, and, if considered, are likely to prejudice any judgment made on the average driver in the main body of the platoon. Therefore, this range, which has an added advantage of containing half of the arrival times, was investigated.

The 55th, 50th, 5th and 0 (the latest time after the green signal up to which no vehicles have arrived) percentiles were calculated from the vehicle arrival time frequency distributions for each of the five stations. These times were plotted with respect to station and a linear relationship was found to obtain for time for each percentile with respect to distance (Figure 9). The time increment between the 0 and 5 percent lines is much greater than that between the 50 and 55 percent lines, supporting the theory that the first 5 percent should probably not be catered to in timing a signal progression. From Figure 9 the time for the $P_{x}$ percent of vehicles in a platoon to pass a given point was abstracted, where $x$ is the value of the range either 0 to 50 percent or 5 to 55 percent (Figure 10). Though both lines include 50 percent of the vehicles passing a given station, the time increment for the 0 to 50 range is as much as 8.38 sec greater at 0.65 mi from the signal. The slope of either of these lines, but preferably the 5 to 55 percent range, could be taken as a measure of rate of decay of platooning. If the slope of the line were zero the vehicles would be platooned to the same extent at 0.50 mi as they were at 0.10 mi , however the line shows nothing about the extent of platooning at any one point. Definition of this latter phenomenon was not within the scope of the examination. The linearity of the relationship between time for the range ( $P_{5}$ to $P_{55}$ ) to pass a given point versus distance was examined, the correlation coefficient gave a probability level of 1.12 percent, which is significant.


Figure 7. Frequency distributions of arrival times of nth vehicle in a platoon.
Examination of the frequency diagrams of the arrival times of the nth vehicle at each of the stations does not reveal any reason why these distributions should be other than normal. If the equivalent normal distributions are fitted to the data for each of these points perhaps a relationship between them can be determined ( 7,8 ).

For a given distribution, say for the nth vehicle at the mth station, with mean $\mu$ and
standard deviation $\sigma$, the equation of the equivalent normal curve is given by

$$
y=\frac{1}{\sigma \sqrt{2 \pi}} \cdot e^{-1 / 2}\left(\frac{x-\mu}{\sigma}\right)^{2}
$$

The maximum value of $y$ at the mode is given when $x=\mu$ hence

$$
\begin{equation*}
y=\frac{1}{\sigma \sqrt{2 \pi}} \tag{2a}
\end{equation*}
$$

or

$$
\begin{equation*}
y=\frac{0.399}{\sigma} \tag{2b}
\end{equation*}
$$

that is,

$$
\begin{equation*}
y=\frac{\text { constant }}{\sigma} \tag{2c}
\end{equation*}
$$

For each distribution $\sigma$ is known, hence a curve of $\frac{\text { constant }}{\sigma}$ can be plotted against distance for each station for a given value of $n$. For ease of computation and graphical presentation the value of the constant was arbitrarily taken as 10 and


Figure 9. Time for the Pth percentile of vehicles in a platoon to pass a point at a given distance.


Figure 8. Mean arrival time of nth car versus distance.
curves were plotted of ( $y=\frac{10}{\sigma}$ ) versus distance (d) for each value of $n$.

It was found that a linear relationship obtained between y and d. Analysis of the correlation coefficient for each line showed a high degree of significance for each line except for $n=6$, where the level of probability was 10.01 percent which is not significant. Inspection of the data shows that this rejection is probably due to the value of the standard deviation for station 2. The correlation of the line for $n=8$ is good, with a probability level of 1.30 percent, which is significant. There does not appear to be any particular reason why the correlation for $\mathrm{n}=6$ should not be as good as for other values of $n$.

## ESTABLISHMENT OF A SIGNAL TIMING DIAGRAM

The analysis shows that it would be possible to construct a signal timing diagram for the highway similar to the type used for signal progressions on urban
streets (1). Although it would not be possible to cater to a smooth progression of all vehicles àt the greater distances, it is possible to arrange the timing of main street green to coincide with the time of greatest vehicle flow density. From the distributions of arrival times of all the vehicles at the five stations, the shortest intervals were calculated in which 50, 70, and 85 percent of the vehicles in a platoon could pass a given station. The lower and upper limits of this interval were designated $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ respectively. For a given percent interval, say the 50 percent interval, the values of $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$


Figure 10. Time for $P_{x}$ percent of vehicles in a platoon to pass a point at a given distance.
at each of the five stations were linearly related with respect to distance, that is, the shortest interval in which 50 percent of the vehicles in a platoon would pass a given point was a "band" which widened out as the distance away from the issuing


Figure 11. Distribution of traffic by lanes.


Figure 12. $10 / \sigma_{1}$ versus distance for nth vehicle.


Figure 13. Progression timing bands. Lower and upper limits of smallest period in which $50 \%, 70 \%$ and $85 \%$ of platoon vehicles will pass a point at a given distance.
signal was increased. Correlation coefficients for each of the lines for $t_{1}$ and $t_{2}$ for the 50,70 , and 85 percent intervals were determined, the levels of probability were all significant. These bands, when reproduced graphically (Figure 13) are in effect a progression diagram. If, at some future date, a signal were required 0.50 ml south of Carlson Boulevard, the timing could be so coordinated that the main street green went on 43 sec after green at Carlson and went off 74 sec after beginning of green at

Carlson. This would ensure free passage of 70 percent of the vehicles on East Shore Highway. For example, a 60 -sec fixed-time cycle at Carlson Boulevard could have 30 sec green on East Shore and 30 sec for left turn and green on Carlson Boulevard, at the same time a signal 0.50 mi south of Carlson, also fixed time, could have 31 sec main street green and 29 sec main street red and would not delay 70 percent of the main street vehicles.

## SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Frequency diagrams of the arrival times of all vehicles at given points distant from an issuing signalized intersection were determined. Frequency diagrams of the arrival times of the nth vehicle were also calculated and plotted. Analysis showed: (a) the maximum ordinates of the equivalent normal distributions of the arrival times of the nth vehicles were linearly related to the distance from the signal, (b) the mean arrival time of the nth vehicle was linearly related to distance from the signal, (c) the time for the Pth percentile of vehicles in a platoon, and the time for the ( $\mathbf{P}_{55}$ to $\mathbf{P}_{5}$ ) interval were linearly related to distance from the signal, (d) that a progression diagram for distances up to 0.65 mi could be plotted for all vehicles which would allow greater success in timing the main street green of a signal downstream from the intersection than might be anticipated from random selection.

Under similar traffic conditions, with vehicle speeds up to 45 mph on high speed urban expressways, it appears that at least the same and probably less delay can be achieved with two coordinated fixed-time signals than with two independent traffic actuated signals, the latter being considerably more expensive to purchase and install.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author would like to express his appreciation to L. M. K. Boelter, Dean of the College of Engineering, and J. H. Mathewson, Assistant Director of the Institute of Transportation and Traffic Engineering, University of California at Los Angeles, for authorizing this work on the Berkeley campus, and to D.S. Berry, formerly Assistant Director of the Institute of Transportation and Traffic Engineering, University of California, Berkeley, for advice given during the investigation.

## REFERENCES

1. Institute of Traffic Engineers, "Traffic Engineering Handbook," Institute of Traffic Engineers, New Haven, Connecticut, 1950.
2. Herwald, N., "Further Aspects of Traffic Control with Particular Reference to the 'Autoflex' Progressive System, " Journal of Scientific Instruments, Vol. 15, No. 8, Aug. 1938.
3. Bartel, R. M., "Platoon Formation on Signalized Streets, "Institute of Transportation and Traffic Engineering, Los Angeles, unpub.
4. Public Roads Administration, "Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices for Streets and Highways," P. R. A. , Washington, D. C. , 1948.
5. Forbes, T.W., "Speed, Headway and Volume Relationships on a Freeway," Proceedings. Institute of Traffic Engineers, 1951.
6. Greenshields, B. D. , and Weida, F. M. , "Statistics with Applications to Highway Traffic Analyses," Eno Foundation, Saugatuck, Connecticut.
7. Davis, O. L. , "Statistical Methods in Research and Production," Oliver and Boyd, London, 1949.
8. Dixon, W.J., and Massey, F. J. , "Introduction to Statistical Analysis, " McGrawHill Book Company, Incorporated, New York, 1951.
9. Proc., Institute of Traffic Engineers, 1951. Greenshields, B. D., "Some Space-Time Relationships of Traffic in Urban Areas," Proc., Institute of Traffic Engineers, 1946.
10. Conley, R.A., "Effect of Grade on Starting Headway Time," Traffic Engineering, Vol. 22, No. 4, January 1952.
11. Herrey, E. M. J., and Herrey, H. , "Principles of Physics Applied to Traffic Movements and Road Conditions, "American Journal of Physics, Vol 13, No. 1, February, 1945.
12. Lewis, B. J., "Platoon Movement of Traffic From an Isolated Signalized Intersection," Thesis submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree M. S. in Engineering, University of California, Los Angeles.

# Pavement Edge Lines on Twenty-Four Foot Surfaces in Louisiana 

I. L. THOMAS, JR., Traffic and Planning Engineer<br>Louisiana Department of Highways

- THE MAINTENANCE SECTION of the Louisiana Department of Highways, since May 1955, has used pavement edge stripes on a limited mileage of 2-lane rural roads with 24 -ft bituminous surfaces. The stripes are reflectorized $4-\mathrm{m}$. solid white lines placed approximately 12 in . from the edge of the pavement. No effort has been made previously to determine the effect, if any, of the stripes on the lateral placement of vehicles.

Some advocates of edge striping contend that the stripes tend to move vehicles to the center of the travel lane or toward the outer edge of the surface; others insist that the solid line acts as a barrier and moves vehicles toward the center line, or at best, has no effect on their lateral placement and are an expensive investment without dividends. Proponents of this latter position contend that it does not make sense to paint 1,980 linear feet of line to mark a mile of center line and then add 10,560 linear feet of line as edge delineators. All of these opinions are well represented among the department's engineering staff.

Regardless of the controversy among the engineers the reaction of the public and the press was extremely favorable to the experimental stripes. So much so that the Board of Highways by resolution indicated a desire that the department adopt edge lines as a standard.

## THE STUDY

The problem of reconciling the divergent department views was given the Traffic and Planning Section. Fortunately, the Bureau of Public Roads had available in an adjoining state an electro-mechanical speedmeter and placement detector which, with the operating technician, could be borrowed for a short time.

The primary purpose of the study was to determine the effect, if any, that a broken or continuous line at various distances from the pavement edge has on the lateral placement of vehicles. A secondary objective was to find a pattern of broken line giving maximum contrast to the standard center line with minimum cost. The study was conducted on four test sections each being on tangent alignment in a rural area with little or no adjacent culture. There were three $4-\mathrm{mi}$ sections and one $\mathbf{2 . 5 - \mathrm { mi } \text { section. Observations }}$ were made at approximately the midpoint of each section with test equipment concealed from the approaching motorist. Locations were on U.S. 71 (Fig. 1).

Figure 2 shows the roadway cross-section representative of each of the study locations. The cross-sections of Locations 2, 3 and 4 are in general comparable and the cross-section of Location 1 is a high embankment with deep borrow pits on each side. This section is representative of Location 1 from a point approximately 1.5 mi south of the guide levee of West Atchafalaya Spillway and continuing southeasterly on U.S. 71 to the junction of U.S. 190.

The study was made on weekdays (Monday through Friday) between May 28 and June 14, 1956. Hours of observation were 12 noon to 12 midnight excluding the twilight hour from 7 to 8 p . m .

Placement and speed by type of vehicle were observed separately during day light and darkness by various maneuvers (free moving, meeting, passing, etc.) at each of the locations. All stripes were 4 in . wide, white, and reflectorized.

Observations were made under the following conditions:
Location 1. (Fig. 3)
(a) No pavement edge stripes.
(b) Continuous stripe 18 in . from pavement edge.

Location 2. (Fig. 4)
(a) No pavement edge stripe.
(b) 5-ft stripe on $40-\mathrm{ft}$ centers, 12 in . from pavement edge.


Figure 1. Map showing location of vehicle placement studies (Louisiana Department of Highways, 1956).


Figure 2. Crossmsection of roadways at 4 study locations (U.S. 71 near Lebeau, La.).
(c) $10-\mathrm{ft}$ stripe on $40-\mathrm{ft}$ centers, 12 in . from pavement edge.
(d) Continuous stripe 12 m . from pavement edge.

Location 3. (Fig. 5)
(a) No pavement edge stripe.
(b) 10 -ft stripe on 40 -ft centers, 6 in . from pavement edge.
(c) Continuous stripe 6 in . from pavement edge.

Location 4. (Fig. 6)
(a) No pavement edge stripe.
(b) 2-ft stripe on $12-\mathrm{ft}$ centers, 12 in . from pavement edge.
(c) Continuous stripe, 12 in . from pavement edge.

Figures show the test sections without edge stripes and with various types of edge striping.

## STUDY RESULTS

Results of the observations are shown graphically in the two sets of placement charts for Locations 1 through 4 (Figs. 7-14). The first set shows the lateral placement of free moving passenger cars under the various striping conditions for each direction of travel during day and night. The second set of charts shows the same information on free moving trucks. Lateral placement shown are the distance of the inside edge of the vehicle from the pavement center line. Width of the composite passenger car being considered as 6 ft and the truck as 8 ft .

Examination of these charts indicates the following:

1. Vehicle placement during daytime is not appreciably affected by edge striping.


Figure 3. Study location No. l-(a) Normal, with centerline only; (b) Continuous stripe 18 in. from edge of pavement.


Figure 4. Study location No. 2-(a) Normal, with centerline only; (b) 10 ft stripe 12 in. from edge of pavement.


Figure 5. Study location No. 3-(a) Normal, with centerline only; (b) Continuous stripe 6 in. from edge of pavement.


Figure 6. Study location No. 4-(a) Normal, with centerline only; (b) 2 ft stripe 6 in. from edge of pavement.
2. Vehicle placement on edge striped sections, as compared to unstriped sections, is little if any affected by the position of the edge stripe in any of the 3 positions studied.
3. The pattern of broken edge stripes has little or no effect on vehicle placement.


On the basis of these conclusions comparable data was combined from Locations 2, 3 and 4 to obtain the summary chart (Fig. 15). Data from Location 1 is not included in the summary chart since the lateral placement chart for Location 1 shows an abnormal variation in the lateral placement of northbound and southbound vehicles. This is attributed to the distance these traffic streams travel on the high embankment in reaching the point of observation. Southbound traffic has been on the $15-\mathrm{ft}$ embankment for about $1,000 \mathrm{ft}$ while northbound traffic has been on the fill for over 4 ml .

Examination of Figure 15 indicates that there is no difference in the effect of dashed and solid edge lines. Both tend to move the vehicles toward the center line of the pavement, however the movement does not appear sufficient to be hazardous on 24 -ft pavements.



Figure 11.
Figure 12.

The consistency of vehicle placement under all conditions is obvious when speed is related to placement as shown in Table 1 for all passenger cars. Results are shown for passenger cars only by day and by night under each condition studied. In this table the average placement represents the distance from the center of the vehicle to the centerline of the surface. The composite passenger car is assumed to be 6 ft in width.

Previous studies by others have shown that as speeds increase there is a tendency for the vehicle to move toward the center line. Figure 16 shows a scatter diagram of passenger car placement as found by this study with a center of gravity drawn by observation which indicates a definite movement toward the center line as speeds increase.

lateral plagement of free moving trucks
(a) NO EDGE STRIPE
(b) WITH $10^{\prime}$ STRIPE ON $40^{\prime}$ CENTERS $6^{\prime \prime}$ FROM EDGE
(c) WITH CONTINUOUS STRIPE G" FROM EDGE OF PAVEMENT

lateral placement of free moving trucks
(a) NO EDGE STRIPE
(b) WITH $2^{\prime}$ STRIPE ON 12 ' CENTERS 12 " FROM EDGE
(c) WITH CONTINUOUS STRIPE $12^{\prime \prime}$ from edee of pavement


LOCATIONS 2,3 AND 4
lateral placement of free moving vehicles
(a) NO EDGE STRIPE
(b) DASHED STRIPES
(c) CONTINUOUS STRIPE

Figure 15.

## ACCIDENTS

Among the sections experimentally edge-striped are 65.5 mi , in lengths of 2 ml and more, on which a comparison of accidents can be made for periods of 6 months before and after the edge stripes were applied. The sections are all 24 - ft bituminous surfaced and the edge stripes are reflectorized $4-\mathrm{in}$. solid white lines applied 12 in . from the edge of the pavement.

In the "before" study 12 head-on or sideswipe accidents were reported; the "after" period showed 14 such accidents. Accidents involving vehicles out of control and running off roadway were 15 in "before" and 22 in the "after" study.

Although it cannot be said that the edge stripes caused the increase in accidents, it can be said that edge stripes did not improve the accident picture.

## PSYCHOLOGICAL EFFECT

The study up to this point has dealt with the behavior of the vehicle; however, the psychological effect of edge striping on the driver is an important consideration. In order to determine if drivers are aware of the stripe, and their opinion of striping, a driver interview study was conducted at two points on U.S. 71 from 12 noon to 12 midnight excluding the 7 to 8 twilight hour. Northbound motorists had been traveling 12 mi over an edge-striped section while southbound motorists had been traveling 6 mi over a striped section prior to entering the non-striped zone where they were interviewed. Edge striped were reflectorized $4-\mathrm{in}$. White solid lines in the outer 12 in . of the surface.

All motorists were stopped and asked: (a) Were you aware of the line painted on the edge of the pavement on the highway from Bunkie south or from U.S. 190 to LeBeau; (b) do you know the purpose of these lines; and (c) are these lines of any help to you in driving?

A total of 1,417 motorists were interviewed, 1,141 in daytime and 276 at night, of these, 89 percent were aware of the lines while 11 percent stated they had not noticed

TABLE 1
AVERAGE SPEED AND AVERAGE PLACEMENT OF ALL PASSENGER CARS (PASSING VEHICLES EXCLUDED) UNDER ALL CONDITIONS STUDIED AT FOUR LOCATIONS BY DIRECTION DURING DAYLIGHT AND DURING DARKNESS

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { Study } \\ & \text { Location } \\ & \text { No } \end{aligned}$ | Type of Marking | Average Speed (mph) |  |  |  | Average Placement ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Day | Nıght | Day | Night | Day | Night | Day | Night |
| 1 | No strıpe | 62.1 | 65.4 | 59.1 | 56.1 | 4.6 | 4.3 | 5.9 | 5.6 |
| 1 | Continuous stripe 18 in . from edge | 58.7 | 598 | 616 | 59.8 | 4.5 | 36 | 5.6 | 5.5 |
| 2 | No stripe | 56.0 | 58.2 | 59.0 | 59.4 | 50 | 4.3 | 50 | 4.8 |
| 2 | 5-ft stripe on 40 -ft centers 12 in . from edge | 59.6 | 54.1 | 61.0 | 60.2 | 5. 1 | 4.3 | 5.2 | 4.8 |
| 2 | 10-ft stripe on 40-ft centers 12 in . from edge | 582 | 59.4 | 60.7 | 60.0 | 5. 0 | 4.4 | 5.0 | 4.7 |
| 2 | Continuous stripe 12 m . from edge | 59.4 | 579 | 59.0 | 59.9 | 51 | 3.8 | 4.8 | 4.5 |
| 3 | No stripe | 612 | 66.0 | 61.1 | 59.5 | 5.3 | 4.8 | 5.4 | 4.8 |
| 3 | 10-ft stripe on 40-ft centers 6 in . from edge | 60.6 | 59.7 | 59.5 | 55.5 | 4.9 | 4.5 | 5.4 | 4.7 |
| 3 | Contınuous stripe 6 in . from edge | 592 | 58.8 | 62.8 | 59.8 | 5.0 | 4.9 | 5.3 | 4.5 |
| 4 | No strıpe | 574 | 56.0 | 590 | 54.8 | 50 | 4.5 | 5.5 | 5.4 |
| 4 | 2-ft stripe on 12 -ft centers 12 m . from edge | 57.2 | 570 | 58.0 | 53.3 | 47 | 4.4 | 5.4 | 5.3 |
| 4 | Continuous stripe 12 m . from edge | 58.3 | 586 | 573 | 53.3 | 49 | 45 | 5.4 | 5.2 |

a Center of vehicle to centerline of highway (in feet)


Figure 16. Placement of free-moving passenger cars at various speeds on 24 ft highways, 1956.
them. During daylight 88 percent observed the stripe, while at night 93 percent of the drivers saw them.

Of those observing the line, 97 percent were of the opinion that the stripe helped them in driving. A majority of the drivers volunteered the comment that the edge stripe was especially helpful at night and during rain or under other adverse driving conditions. Considering all motorists, including those who did not notice the line and were not qualified to give an opinion of its effect, 86 percent of the drivers believed they derived some benefit from the edge striping. The motoring public seemed to have a good idea of the purpose of the stripe. Almost all of those who noticed it thought that its purpose was to help the driver stay in his lane, or to act as a guide line for his protection.

## CONCLUSIONS

1. The psychological effect on a majority of vehfcle drivers is the only benefitfrom pavement edge lines found by this study.
2. The tendency of vehicles to move toward the center of edge striped pavements does not appear sufficiently large to create any abnormal hazard on a 24 -ft surface however this may not be applicable to narrower pavements.

THE National Academy of Sciences-National Research CounCLL is a private, nonprofit organization of scientists, dedicated to the furtherance of science and to its use for the general welfare. The Academy itself was established in 1863 under a congressional charter signed by President Lincoln. Empowered to provide for all activities appropriate to academies of science, it was also required by its charter to act as an adviser to the federal government in scientific matters. This provision accounts for the close ties that have always existed between the Academy and the government, although the Academy is not a governmental agency.

The National Research Council was established by the Academy in 1916, at the request of President Wilson, to enable scientists generally to associate their efforts with those of the limited membership of the Academy in service to the nation, to society, and to science at home and abroad. Members of the National Research Council receive their appointments from the president of the Academy. They include representatives nominated by the major scientific and technical societies, representatives of the federal government, and a number of members at large. In addition, several thousand scientists and engineers take part in the activities of the research council through membership on its various boards and committees.

Receiving funds from both public and private sources, by contribution, grant, or contract, the Academy and its Research Council thus work to stimulate research and its applications, to survey the broad possibilities of science, to promote effective utilization of the scientific and technical resources of the country, to serve the government, and to further the general interests of science.

The Highway Research Board was organized November 11, 1920, as an agency of the Division of Engineering and Industrial Research, one of the eight functional divisions of the National Research Council. The BOARD is a cooperative organization of the highway technologists of America operating under the auspices of the Academy-Council and with the support of the several highway departments, the Bureau of Public Roads, and many other organizations interested in the development of highway transportation. The purposes of the BOARD are to encourage research and to provide a national clearinghouse and correlation service for research activities and information on highway administration and technology.

