

Project No. F-14

**ADDRESSING CRITICAL SHORTFALLS: RECRUITMENT,
DEVELOPMENT, AND RETENTION OF HIGH-QUALITY MANAGERS
FOR PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS**

FINAL RESEARCH REPORT
WEB DOCS

Prepared for TCRP
Transportation Research Board
of
The National Academies

Dr. Lance Anderson, Dr. Candace Blair Cronin, Ms. Michelle Pohl, and Dr. Brian Cronin
ICF International, Inc.
Fairfax, Virginia

in association with
Mr. Ream Lazaro, Mr. Jim Caton, Ms. Annabelle Boyd, and Ms. Ann Singleton
Boyd, Caton & Grant Transportation Group
Earlysville, Virginia

February 2009

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	2
Phase I of TCRP Project F-14	
I. Task 1: Literature Review	3
1. Define the Scope	3
2. Identify Source Documents	3
3. Create Database and Annotated Bibliography	4
4. Summarize Literature Review Findings.....	5
II. Task 2: Develop Model Position Descriptions and Job Announcements	6
1. Identify Existing Position Descriptions	6
2. Review O*Net Data.....	7
3. Identify Essential Job Functions	7
4. Conduct Linkage Exercise.....	8
5. Prepare Job Documents.....	9
III. Task 3: Identify and Assess Current Practices in Public Transportation	12
1. Collect Case Study Data.....	12
2. Identify Strengths and Weaknesses in Practices.....	15
3. Identify Components of Best Practices	15
IV. Task 4: Identify and Assess Current Practices in Related Industries	16
1. Review Existing Benchmark Data.....	16
2. Conduct a Benchmarking Study of Public and Private Sector Agencies	16
2.1 Identify Partners for our Sample.....	16
2.2 Benchmarking Study Methodology	17
2.3 Construct Benchmarking Study Protocol	17
2.4 Recruitment of Partners for Interviews	18
2.5 Analysis of Benchmarking Data.....	22
2.6 Benchmarking Study Results	22
2.6.1 Recruitment Challenges and Strategies	22
2.6.2 Training and Development Challenges and Strategies	25
2.6.3 Retention Challenges and Strategies.....	27
IV. Task 5: Prepare Interim Report.....	31
Phase II of TCRP Project F-14	
VI. Task 6: Assess Opportunities and Barriers to Implementation.....	32
VII. Task 7: Prepare Recommendations	33
VIII. Task 8: Prepare Final Guidebook.....	34
Appendix A: Literature Review Report	
Appendix B: Members of Each Job Title Cluster	
Appendix C: Method Used to Develop Job Description Guides	
Appendix D: Sample Job Descriptions	
Appendix E: How to Use Job Description Guides	
Appendix F: Case Study Protocol	
Appendix G: Focus Group Study Description	
Appendix H: Focus Group Confirmation Email	
Appendix I: Benchmarking Case Study Focus Group Protocol	

Introduction

TCRP F-14 was initiated to provide resources to transit systems bus fixed-route, demand response, and ADA paratransit systems throughout the United States to improve the recruitment, development, and retention of managers. Because the challenges of public transportation systems are changing and evolving and because many upper-managers in transit systems who are “Baby Boomers” will retire during the next ten years, new managers and new management capabilities are needed by many transit agencies. Further, there is a general shortage of qualified fixed-route and paratransit managers in transit systems, which makes the need to identify high-quality transit managers even more pressing.

This project was conducted by ICF International in collaboration with Boyd, Caton & Grant Transportation Group. The objective of the project was to draw on the experience of innovative transit systems and other industries to identify effective strategies for recruiting, developing, and retaining high-quality managers that can be adopted by or adapted to fixed-route bus, demand response, and ADA paratransit systems. Although this project was specific to bus systems, other transit systems may find valuable information by adapting the content to fit their unique structure, services, and challenges. For example, the Model Job Description Guides provided in the Web Docs for this project are specific to bus transit manager jobs but some of the content may be applicable to rail and other modes of transit. The results are intended to serve large, medium, and small urban and rural public, private-for-profit, and private-nonprofit bus transit systems. This research project was divided into eight tasks; the work performed for each task to date is presented in the following sections.

Phase I of TCRP Project F-14

I. Task 1: Literature Review

In this task, the research team conducted a literature review to identify and assemble information from published research, technical reports, conference presentations, and case studies on ways workforce challenges with management jobs have been addressed successfully. We reviewed 37 independent articles, including six meta-analytic studies that together covered over 100 primary research studies.

1. Define the Scope

The goal of the literature review was to develop a deeper and broader understanding of the issues and proven solutions to hiring, developing and retaining highly competent managers. The research team structured the literature review to identify and assemble information from published and unpublished research, technical reports, conference presentations, and case studies on the methods through which workforce challenges with management jobs have been successfully addressed. The research took into account several factors including:

- Antecedents/factors that impact recruitment and retention efforts for managers
- The various ways recruitment is defined. For example, recruitment may refer to the development and promotion of staff internal to the organization (high potential employees) as well as identifying talent in the external labor market
- How recruitment activities should be categorized. For example, recruitment may include active (cold calls) and passive (branding) approaches
- Components of development:
 - Types of programs (e.g., on-the-job v. course-based)
 - Relationship to performance management (e.g., annual reviews; IDPs)
 - Frequency of programs (i.e., periodic v. continuous)
 - Degree of intentionality (e.g., structured career paths v. happenstance)
 - Other related initiatives (e.g., succession planning)
- Applicability of concepts and programs to management jobs

Accounting for these factors, the research team conducted a literature review that was intentionally broad in scope to identify and analyze the issues from multiple angles. The broad scope of the literature review also allowed our team to capture information that is relevant to transit systems of all sizes and types of service.

2. Identify Source Documents

The research team delineated the literature search into specific topic areas within the three major areas of interest: recruitment, development, and retention practices. Team members were then assigned a topic area to cover in the review. These team members used research based search engines (e.g., Elton B. Stevens Company (EBSCO) Host) to locate articles in their topic area. To identify practical, effective practices, our review included industry publications and TRB reports, specific project reports and agency releases, and organizational models. We evaluated materials specifically created by and for transit services as well as materials derived from other similar

agencies. Additionally, we used databases such as the Department of Labor's Occupational Information Network (O*NET) to identify comparable industries and determine whether they are facing similar workforce issues (Anderson, 1999).

Although search engines such as EBSCO Host were utilized to locate articles, the literature search was heavily grounded in research identified as applicable to applied transportation settings by expert practitioners. The literature review was used as an organizing framework to guide the search of innovative workforce practices implemented by public transportation agencies as well as military, local governments and other organizations with a similar profile to bus paratransit and fixed-route agencies.

3. Create Database and Annotated Bibliography

The research team developed an easily searchable database of our materials using Zotero. Zotero is a user-friendly Firefox extension that allows users to collect, manage, and cite research sources right in the Firefox web browser. We used this database not only to store materials, but also to create the annotated bibliography for each source. The following characteristics were captured from our literature review sources to describe the studies and reports:

- Title
- Author(s)
- Document type (e.g., journal article, press release)
- Reference
- Key words
- Abstract

Each literature review team member reviewed the articles obtained with his/her search fields and summarized the content of the article that is relevant to the goal of this project. This allowed team members to identify effective practices in the recruitment, development and retention of managers. Each reviewer was also asked to write an annotated bibliography for each article reviewed. The bibliography included a summary of the article and components such as the following:

- Content of the article
- Type of study (e.g., empirical, case study)
- Description of the type of practices reviewed in the article
- Factors that facilitated or inhibited implementation
- Research sample used (e.g., employees, students)

4. Summarize Literature Review Findings

The research team reviewed and identified trends in the literature with public transportation and across industries in the areas of recruitment, development, and retention. Our review identified practical managerial tools across a range of topics and specifically addressed the following eight workforce challenges:

- Recruiting diverse management staff
- Selection and placement
- Restructuring of benefits and policies
- Job classification and job design
- Retaining staff
- Succession planning
- Educating, training and developing staff
- Developing knowledge management systems

The literature review results are reported by each of these eight workforce challenges in the Literature Review Report located in Appendix A. We also incorporated Panel feedback from the Draft Literature Report Review that was provided in the first Quarterly Progress Report. Our findings indicate that all eight topics are highly interrelated—success in one area impacts the others—which is reflected in our summary. For each workforce challenge, we provide potential challenges, best practices, and solutions supported by research and strategies for continued success.

II. Task 2: Develop Model Position Descriptions and Job Announcements

1. Identify Existing Position Descriptions

As a starting point for Task 2, the research team reviewed the results of TCRP Synthesis 71 and TCRP Report 127 in which the requirements for transit managers were identified through a review of position descriptions. Furthermore, we identified existing position descriptions (PDs) currently used by a selection of fixed-route and other paratransit agencies. This list included job titles that, based on our experience with transit agencies, covered the gamut of management jobs. We also included nine positions identified by TCRP Panel members in their comments regarding our Amplified Work Plan. A representative sample of PDs across small, medium, and large urban and rural transportation agencies was identified. The PDs identified were for middle and upper transportation management jobs with exempt FLSA status and included variations of the job titles. All PD titles are provided in Exhibit II-1.

Exhibit II-1 Initial List of Management Job Titles for Transit Agencies	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● General Manager/CEO ● Transportation/Operations Manager ● Maintenance Manager ● Human Resource Manager ● Financial Manager ● Administrative Manager ● Risk Manager/Safety Manager ● Procurement Manager ● Planning Manager ● Marketing Manager ● Security Manager/Emergency Preparedness Manager ● Training Manager ● Public Information Officer/Manager ● Labor/Employee Relations Officer/Manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Contract Services Manager ● Information Technology Manager ● Scheduling and Dispatching Manager/Supervisor ● Transportation/Operations Supervisor ● Maintenance Foreman ● Director of Scheduling & Service ● Director of Accessible Services and Contract Compliance ● Paratransit Administrator ● Director of Paratransit Service ● Regional Manager – Paratransit ● Special Services Manager ● Paratransit & Rideshare Director ● Chief – Paratransit Operations ● Mobility Manager

The research team categorized the transit agencies listed in National Transit Database according to number of vehicles in service: small (1-25 vehicles); medium (26-100 vehicles); and large (100+ vehicles). The purpose of these categories was to ensure that we obtained PDs across transit agencies of different sizes.

We then searched for nine PDs for each of the titles listed in Exhibit II-1; three PDs per each of the three different size categories. To locate the PDs, we conducted a comprehensive search of all transit agency websites for position descriptions, conducted exhaustive Internet

searches for transit agency management position announcements, and searched our internal databases of job descriptions. We also contacted transit agencies, used a job description online search tool, and examined job description reference materials (JobDescriptionManager.com, 2009; Plachy & Plachy, 1998).

2. Review Department of Labor Data

After identifying existing PDs for managerial transit positions, the research team identified general duties, knowledges, skills, abilities (KSAs), and the work context for each job. We did this by aggregating the information provided by each PD assigned to each job cluster. We validated and supplemented this information with data from the Department of Labor's O*NET (<http://online.onetcenter.org/>) (2009) and the Office of Personnel Management's (2008) Handbook of Occupational Groups and Families.

3. Identify Essential Job Functions

Once the research team obtained the PDs, we looked for commonalities across the PDs to identify positions that naturally clustered together. Together, these clusters cover all management positions in public and private transit agencies. First-line supervisory positions were not included unless the position was an upper management position at the agency. Although many of the job titles remained similar to those identified in Exhibit II-1, after a comprehensive search for PDs, there were some changes. Some job titles were merged together (e.g., Transportation/Operations Manager and Maintenance Manager became Director/Manager Operations/Transportation & Maintenance), while other job titles were divided (e.g., Human Resources Manager became Director/Manager Human Resources, Manager/Supervisor Compensation & Benefits, and Manager/Supervisor Personnel) to accurately reflect the position descriptions we found. Our team took care to ensure that the PDs we found represented actual managerial positions in the transit industry. The resulting 32 job titles are listed in Appendix B along with the position titles they represent. Exhibit II-2 shows applicability of the titles across types of organizations.

Exhibit II-2					
Applicability of Job Titles Across Types of Organizations					
Job Title	Organization Type				
	Small	Medium	Large	General Public Service	ADA Para-transit
1. CEO/Executive Director/General Manager	X	X	X	X	X
2. Director/Manager- Administration-Finance		X	X	X	
3. Director/Manager- Human Resources		X	X	X	
4. Director/Manager- Marketing/Public Relations		X	X	X	
5. Director/Manager- Operations/Transportation & Maintenance	X	X	X	X	X
6. Director/Manager- Planning/Transit Development		X	X	X	
7. Director/Manager- Information Technology		X	X	X	
8. Manager/Supervisor- Accounting/Payroll		X	X	X	
9. Manager/Supervisor- Compliance		X	X	X	X

Exhibit II-2					
Applicability of Job Titles Across Types of Organizations					
Job Title	Organization Type				
	Small	Medium	Large	General Public Service	ADA Para-transit
10. Manager/Supervisor- Customer Service	X	X	X	X	X
11. Manager/Supervisor- Dispatching & Scheduling	X	X	X	X	X
12. Manager/Supervisor- Engineering & Capital Programs			X	X	
13. Manager/Supervisor- Finance/Budget	X	X	X	X	X
14. Manager/Supervisor- Grants/Contract		X	X	X	
15. Manager/Supervisor- Legislative Affairs			X	X	
16. Manager/Supervisor- Marketing	X	X	X	X	
17. Manager/Supervisor- Media & Community Relations			X	X	
18. Manager/Supervisor- Mobility Management		X	X	X	
19. Manager/Supervisor- Paratransit Services		X	X		X
20. Manager/Supervisor- Personnel	X	X	X	X	X
21. Manager/Supervisor- Planning		X	X	X	
22. Manager/Supervisor- Procurement		X	X	X	
23. Manager/Supervisor- Risk Management		X	X	X	
24. Manager/Supervisor- Service Design & Schedules			X	X	
25. Manager/Supervisor- Special Projects			X	X	
26. Manager/Supervisor- Training, Safety & Security	X	X	X	X	X
27. Manager/Supervisor- Vehicle Maintenance	X	X	X	X	X
28. Manager/Supervisor- Facility Management and Maintenance		X	X	X	
29. Manager/Supervisor- Compensation & Benefits		X	X	X	
30. Manager/Supervisor- Employee & Labor Relations		X	X	X	
31. Manager/Supervisor- Civil Rights			X	X	
32. Manager/Supervisor- Transportation	X	X	X	X	X

4. Conduct Linkage Exercise

The research team, consisting of doctorate level Industrial/Organizational Psychologists with specific expertise in job analytic processes, provided linkage ratings between the KSAs and job duties identified for each of the transit manager jobs. Our team also identified KSAs needed to perform each of the job duties listed.

Through analysis, the research team removed KSAs with no linkages to the core manager duties. The purpose of this linkage exercise was to identify critical KSAs and to ensure only relevant KSAs were included in the job information used for each job title. Furthermore, this process helps to reduce the likelihood that individuals will be selected into management positions based on extraneous, non-job relevant information. Identifying job-relevant KSAs is an important step in establishing the legal defensibility of position descriptions and any personnel decisions that will be based upon the contents of those descriptions.

All job information for each job title was placed into a logical structure and reviewed by team-members with transit agency and/or human resources experience.

5. Prepare Job Documents

For each of the 32 job titles, we developed a Job Description (JD) Guide that integrates the job specific information with the guidance organizations need to customize their job descriptions. The Job Description Guides provide a structure for job descriptions, guidance on each part of the job description, and examples of the title-specific content that would likely be found in each section of the job description. All 32 Model Job Description Guides and Sample Employer Information (to be inserted into a job description) are provided in subsequent TCRP Web Docs. Job descriptions based on these guides will be useful for a variety of human resources management functions including: recruiting, development, compensation, succession planning, clarifying worker roles, and structuring work among several workers.

While each guide provides a comprehensive set of information for the title of interest, we strongly recommend that the job information be tailored based on the findings of a job analysis (cf., Harvey, Anderson, Baranowski & Morath, 2007). The Model JD Guides should not be used “as is” without first conducting a job analysis to identify the job relevant duties and knowledge, skills and abilities needed to perform those duties for a specific job within a specific agency. Specifically, when utilized for assessment purposes, the information included in a JD must be demonstrated to have job relevance for that specific job in order to ensure legal defensibility of the assessment process.

Transit agencies should take particular care in developing Minimum Qualifications. Minimum Qualifications (MQs) should be tied to specific KSAs needed on the first day of the job. Employers should avoid using general degree requirements (e.g., college degree required) as these requirements do not necessarily relate to the minimum competence required and may inadvertently discriminate against groups protected by Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA), the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990 and the ADA Amendments Act of 2008. MQs relating to education should cite specific types of coursework needed, and should state ways that experience can substitute for education.

To effectively use the Model Job Description Guides we suggest that users:

- Select the job description that best matches the content of the job for which the system is targeting to fill
- Review the Job Description Guide to identify the types of information that needs to be gathered on the job of interest
- Gather data on the job of interest by observing the job, reviewing past job descriptions, interviewing job incumbents or stakeholders, or conducting a variety of job analysis techniques. (For more guidance on job analysis, see Harvey, Anderson, Baranowski, & Morath, 2007.)
- Use the guidance provided in each section of the Model Job Description Guide to develop specific information relevant to the organization and the job of interest

The main source of content for the job description should be the content of the job as obtained through a job analysis. Extraneous information in a job description such as the type of person the company would like to hire can be distracting and worse yet, legally challenged by applicants if the information leads to discrimination. While two transit systems may have jobs with similar titles, the type of information provided in each of their job descriptions may vary based on the services of that system, the resources of the system (e.g., compensation offered) and number of staff, which in turn, impact the job duties and knowledge, skills and abilities required to perform the work. Exhibit II-3 provides a list of tips for developing job descriptions.

Three appendices were developed to provide more information on the job descriptions. Appendix C describes the method used to develop the Model Job Description Guides. Appendix D provides five Sample Job Descriptions that demonstrate what job descriptions should look like after the Employer Information (found as a Web Doc) and the relevant Model Job Description Guide (Web Doc) have been integrated. The five Sample Job Descriptions were developed for real jobs within actual transit systems with the company name changed to protect identity. Appendix E provides a detailed description of how to use the Model Job Description Guides.

Exhibit II-3
Tips for Developing Job Descriptions

- **DO give specifics.** For example, rather than stating that a maintenance worker "keeps up equipment," it is better to spell out the position's requirements, which might include performing routine maintenance on assembly machines, including adjusting settings; cleaning and lubricating shafts, gears, and bearings; and dismantling and replacing defective parts.
- **DO use result oriented language.** As an aid in communicating performance expectations, job descriptions should be results-oriented. Results-oriented job descriptions include: 1.) the outcome/results to be accomplished; and 2.) the tasks/duties that must be performed to accomplish those duties.
- **DO use accurate adjectives.** Include adjectives that describe the pace of work ("deadline-driven," "fast-paced") or the work environment ("enclosed area," "noisy setting"), but avoid flowery and overly long descriptions ("cozy but comfortable work environment that encourages creativity").
- **DON'T use subjective terms.** Avoid using words that are subject to differing interpretations. Instead of saying you seek a certain attitude, cooperation, or initiative, describe expected outputs, different constituencies with whom this position interacts, and the nature of those relationships (such as "reports to," "provides support to," "supervises").
- **DON'T rely on abbreviations or jargon.** A job description should be clear to applicants and employees. Abbreviations and jargon that are specific to your organization, and not to your industry, should be avoided or explained.
- **DON'T use words that raise a question of discrimination.** Avoid language that would be questionable in a job listing. For example, don't use words such as "youthful" or "able-bodied."
- **DON'T list unreasonable expectations.** Most managers hope their employees will exceed their expectations and take on tasks and responsibilities beyond what's required in the position, but avoid the temptation to include standards that don't currently apply to this job.
- **DON'T list excessive qualifications or experience.** If you include more than what is needed to competently perform the position, you will end up with bored, overqualified workers and you will limit your ability to place otherwise qualified candidates in the position.
- **DON'T include anything derogatory or specific about a person who previously held the position.** Job descriptions are not the place to air grievances or disappointments about individuals who previously held the position. You can use past experiences to help ensure all necessary information is included, but make sure you describe only the job.

Note: Adapted from HR Daily Newsletter (February 3, 2009).

III. Task 3: Identify and Assess Current Practices in Public Transportation

The diversity of transit systems based on system size and service delivery models requires a stratified approach in order to categorize transit systems for case study research and best practice identification. This diversity presents a wide spectrum of human resource challenges and does not allow for a “one size fits all” approach. Research, presentation of findings, and recommendations in the areas of managerial recruitment, development, and retention are best served using the following transit system categories:

- Large and mid-sized urban transit systems
- Small urban and rural transit systems

Although we recognize that there are some commonality of elements in the recruitment, development and retention of transit managers shared across these categories, we knew there would also be critical elements that are unique to a single category based on the widely disparate requirements and skills essential to success from one category to another. Approaching the study in this manner allowed our team to better meet the needs of transit systems and determine the specific impact of workforce changes and new functional requirements on skill requirements, identify best practices in addressing imminent workforce issues, and evaluate the feasibility of potential responses.

1. Collect Case Study Data

We conducted an in-depth case study of current practices by transit agencies in the recruitment, development and retention of transit managers. The case study protocol, categorization of agency types, a list of potential case study participants, a survey instrument, and proposed Web survey methodology, as well as a proposed method for recruiting survey participants were provided in the Interim Report and discussed during the Interim Meeting. Revisions reflecting the Panel’s feedback during the Interim Meeting were made. Per vote of the Panel, we excluded the web survey (Subtask 3.3) from the work plan. In place of the survey, we added an additional 8 agency case studies to the 12 case studies initially proposed in the work plan, to make a total of 20 agency case studies. In addition, the case study participant list was revised per the Panel’s feedback. Transit systems in Los Angeles and Washington, D.C. were excluded as case study candidates in order to focus on more small and mid-sized urban and rural agencies.

In June 2009, the ICF/BCG team contacted each Panel member who agreed to provide agency contacts such as Las Vegas, Lynchburg, and UMass Transit, and Pee Dee Regional Transportation Authority. These Panel members also agreed to encourage the participation of these individuals. The research team also took care to distribute the case studies throughout the

U.S., including rural and urban systems and targeting agencies in communities that have seasonal hiring to quickly accommodate swells of riders, as well as transit systems run by university students where the university does not have a transportation system. In addition, the research team was careful to identify transit systems that have recently received awards for their managerial recruitment, development, and retention practices. With these contacts, the ICF/BCG team created the first revised participant list shown in Exhibit III-1.

Exhibit III-1	
Revised Case Study Participant List	
Large and Mid-sized Urban Transit Systems	
Port Authority of Alleghany County, Pittsburgh, PA	
Capitol District Transportation Agency, Albany NY	
Mass Transportation Authority, Flint MI	
First Transit Paratransit Operation, Las Vegas, NV	
Golden Empire Transit District, Bakersfield, CA	
Small Urban and Rural Transit Systems	
Capital Transit, Juneau, AK	
Roaring Fork Transit, Aspen, CO	
Virginia Regional Transit, Purcellville, VA	
OCCK, Salina, KS	
OATS, Columbia, MO	
First Transit Operation, Lynchburg, VA	
First Transit Operation, University of Massachusetts	
Delmarva Community Services, Cambridge, MD	
Fairmont County Transit Authority, Fairmont, WV	
South Lane Wheels, Cottage Grove, OR	
Souris Basin Transportation, Minot, ND	
Kibois Area Transit, Stigler, OK	
Palace Transit, Mitchell, SD	
Coast Transit Authority, Gulfport, MS	
Atomic City Transit, Los Alamos, NM	

In addition to the Revised Case Study Participant List, the ICF/BCG team developed a list of backup case study interviewees. Exhibit III-2 provides our second revised list with 2 additional back-up contacts noted.

Exhibit III-2	
Revision 2 Case Study Participant List (with backup contacts)	
Large and Mid-sized Urban Transit Systems	
Port Authority of Alleghany County, Pittsburgh, PA	
Mass Transportation Authority, Flint MI	
Transfort, Fort Collins, CO	
Golden Empire Transit District, Bakersfield, CA	
Small Urban and Rural Transit Systems	
Virginia Regional Transit, Purcellville, VA	
OCCK, Salina, KS	

OATS, Columbia, MO
First Transit Operation, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA
Delmarva Community Services, Cambridge, MD
Souris Basin Transportation, Minot, ND
Palace Transit, Mitchell, SD
Coast Transit Authority, Gulfport, MS
Atomic City Transit, Los Alamos, NM
Havasu Area Transit, Lake Havasu City, AZ
Cache Valley Transit District, Logan UT
Jefferson Transit, Port Townsend, WA
South Lane Wheels, Cottage Grove, OR
Pee Dee Regional Transportation Authority, Florence, SC
AMTRAN, Altoona, PA
Capital Area Rural Transportation System, Austin, TX
Capital Transit, Juneau, AK
Cooperative Alliance for Seacoast Transportation, Dover, NH

The ICF/BCG team took care to lay the groundwork for the case studies. We prepared appropriate questions for the case study protocol, and per the Panel's feedback we integrated some questions from the excluded web survey into the case study protocol.

The team conducted all 20 case study interviews with transit system leaders as of 09/30/09. Exhibit III-3 provides the final list of all case study participants.

Exhibit III-3	
Final List of Case Study Participants	
Large and Mid-sized Urban Transit Systems	
Port Authority of Alleghany County, Pittsburgh, PA	
Mass Transportation Authority, Flint MI	
Transfort, Fort Collins, CO	
Golden Empire Transit District, Bakersfield, CA	
Small Urban and Rural Transit Systems	
Virginia Regional Transit, Purcellville, VA	
OCCK, Salina, KS	
OATS, Columbia, MO	
UMass Transit, Amherst, MA	
Delmarva Community Services, Cambridge, MD	
Souris Basin Transportation, Minot, ND	
Palace Transit, Mitchell, SD	
Coast Transit Authority, Gulfport, MS	
Atomic City Transit, Los Alamos, NM	
Havasu Area Transit, Lake Havasu City, AZ	
Cache Valley Transit District, Logan UT	
Jefferson Transit, Port Townsend, WA	
South Lane Wheels, Cottage Grove, OR	
Pee Dee Regional Transportation Authority, Florence, SC	
AMTRAN, Altoona, PA	
Capital Transit, Juneau, AK	

Case studies were conducted with large, mid-sized, and small, urban and rural, private and public transit agencies located throughout the U.S. As the research team conducted the 20 case studies, we ferreted out information about agency innovations and success stories. For the convenience of the case study participants, case studies were conducted over the phone. Each interview lasted approximately 60 minutes. A typist recorded notes during the interviews and we digitally recorded the interviews to ensure that pertinent details of the agencies' practices were not missed. Participants discussed their transit agency's recruitment, development, and retention challenges as well as strategies they have used to address their challenges. We also discussed the strengths and weaknesses of the strategies they use in their agencies to improve their management team. Each case study is presented in a brief summary report that is included in the appendices of the project F-14 Human Resource Management Guidebook. The case study summary reports include brief profiles of the system, the person(s) interviewed, and an overview of the effective strategies and practices in the areas of recruitment, development, and retention.

2. Identify Strengths and Weaknesses in Practices

During the interviews, we requested that participants describe the pros and cons of the techniques they have used in improving their management team along with the criteria they use to evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of a particular approach. We also asked them to identify programs or techniques that have worked well in addition to those which have not worked well. In the interviews, we discussed the factors specific to transit (and unique to fixed-route and paratransit services) which create additional challenges as well as opportunities to the implementation of specific recruitment, development, and retention initiatives.

3. Identify Components of Best Practices

Selecting the appropriate workforce management tool is a vital component of successfully responding to workforce shortages with management personnel. Departments lose vital resources, time, and money when administrators implement an approach that does not appropriately address the needs of their workforce. Tools that are effective for one organization may indeed be detrimental for another. This can lead to frustration at all levels of the organization; therefore, we identified the components (i.e., steps of implementation) of the program or initiative that allow it to be effective so that applicability across agencies of different size and service setting can easily be determined.

III. Task 4: Identify and Assess Current Practices in Related Industries

The related industry benchmarking portion of our study was a vital component of the research process. To identify effective practices in the recruitment, development and retention of managers across other industries, we reviewed existing benchmark data and conducted a benchmarking study of public and private sector organizations. A total of 63 organizations were represented based on existing data and data collected during these focus groups. This task identified and incorporated effective recruitment and management techniques, helped to better understand decision-making approaches used in other industries, and identified practice tools that may be applied by public transportation agencies to address the critical shortage of managers.

1. Review Existing Benchmark Data

The team reviewed data we hold from similar benchmarking studies (e.g., Fortune 500 companies; local and national member associations) on the recruitment, development and retention practices of management personnel. For example, ICF recently conducted a study for the American Society for Training & Development (ASTD), the world's largest association dedicated to workplace learning and performance professionals, to identify definitions and practices in executive development across a range of member organizations. ICF also recently collected benchmark data related to recruitment, development and retention to address workforce shortages for transportation construction jobs. Results from both studies were reviewed in the current effort.

2. Conduct a Benchmarking Study of Public and Private Sector Agencies

2.1 Identify Partners for our Sample

Selecting the appropriate benchmarking partners for the study was critical to ensure the applicability of the findings and relevance of our recommendations to fixed-route and paratransit agencies. To identify the partners for our sample, we identified public and private organizations with similar profiles to fixed-route and paratransit agencies in terms of their workforce challenges, demographics, organizational size and geographic location, since managerial skill development practices and recruitment and selection difficulties likely differ based these factors. We looked at agencies considered to be competitor organizations to many of the fixed-route and paratransit agencies. We also took into account that some of the fixed-route and paratransit agencies may face additional regulations, security considerations, emergency preparedness or labor market challenges. For example, agencies in a rural setting, operating near the border of another country may be faced with specific regulations with respect to border control matters.

Our sample had a representation of companies within each of the following categories:

- Urban setting
- Small (under 100 employees)
- Medium (100-1,000 employees)

- Large (over 1,000 employees)
- Public sector
- Private sector
- On each of the major coasts in the U.S.
- Northern U.S. (East, Central, West)

2.2 Benchmarking Study Methodology

The research team used a telephone focus group format to collect the recruitment, development, and retention data from our benchmarking partners. We chose the focus group interview for several reasons. First, the focus group itself served as an incentive for participation in the study. Conducting a focus group style study, rather than a one-on-one benchmarking interview, allowed participants to learn about the challenges and best practices of the other organizations in their group. The group nature of the study also stimulated dialogue about recruitment, development, and retention best practices among the participants. Further, the focus group format allowed the research team to collect information from several organizations within an hour, whereas using traditional interview formats would not allow for this.

In addition to the telephone conference call, participants were provided with access to Live Meeting for the duration of the call. Live Meeting is an online meeting space that allows users to meet and collaborate through the internet. Using Live Meeting allowed the participants to see the notes from their discussion as the facilitator recorded them and helped to facilitate dialogue among the participants. Live Meeting was an optional tool for participants who had access to a computer during the call.

The research team took care to ensure that all discussion points were captured. While the facilitator took broad notes about the topics that emerged from the interviews, another team member took more detailed notes to capture the context and specific points from each participant. The team was further assisted by recording each interview. The recordings would be useful for capturing all important points made by participants that may have been missed by the note taker and facilitator. All participants were made aware of the recording and agreed to its use by the research team for purposes of the benchmarking study. In addition, participant biographies were collected in advance of the call and disseminated among participants to assist in introducing the group members to one another.

Our goal was to recruit four to six participants in each focus group, and to conduct a total of four focus group interviews. The number of participants and diversity of characteristics in participants ensured that we had a representative mix of organizational types and geographical locations. Each interview lasted one hour. This timeframe allowed us to collect the relevant benchmarking data from our partners, while at the same time respecting our partners' demanding schedules and limited availability.

2.3 Construct Benchmarking Study Protocol

We used the existing benchmark data and the findings from the literature review to construct an interview protocol for the benchmarking study. The protocol consisted of 16

questions, including two introductory questions to familiarize participants with one another. Six questions concentrated on the recruitment, development, and retention challenges of organizations and the strategies organizations use to address those challenges. If time permitted, we included several follow-up questions to clarify answers and provide more detail about our partners' most effective practices. Appendix I contains the focus group interview protocol.

2.4 Recruitment of Partners for Interviews

Once our team had identified partners for our sample, determined the benchmarking study methodology, and constructed the benchmarking protocol, we turned our attention to recruiting partners to participate in the focus group interviews. One challenge to obtaining participation was to address confidentiality of participants. Another challenge was providing an adequate incentive for focus group participants to encourage participation. To address both of these challenges, focus group participants were offered a copy of a summary report that lists participant names, company affiliation, and presents the effective practices in aggregate form (without attributions of data to specific persons or organizations for the purpose of confidentiality).

Our recruitment strategy primarily consisted of calling our partners, explaining the purpose of the benchmarking study, explaining what was involved in participating, and describing the benefits of participating. However, the research team was unable to contact several potential participants via telephone after numerous attempts, so an email describing the study was sent to these partners. This study description can be found in Appendix G. If the partner was interested and able to participate we scheduled him or her for one of the focus groups and sent the individual a confirmation email. If the partner requested more time to consider the opportunity, we emailed him or her a more detailed description of the study and, if requested, we also emailed potential participants the study protocol.

The research team conducted a total of five focus groups interviews with participants from 15 organizations. Each focus group included employees from three to five organizations, and each interview lasted from one hour to one and a half hours. Our focus group participants included employees from the sectors and organizations indicated in Exhibit IV-1.

Exhibit IV-1 Benchmarking Partner Information		
Transportation Related		
Organization	Participant's Title	Organization Description
Alabama State Personnel Department, Transportation Team	Chief Industrial-Organizational Psychologist	The State Personnel Department was created by the State Merit System Act of 1939. The Department, under the State Director of Personnel, is charged with such responsibilities as: Preparing and recommending rules and regulations to administer the Merit System Law; Administering and executing classification and pay plans for the State service; Conducting tests, creating employment registers and certifying qualified persons for appointment; Devising and administering an employee performance evaluation program; and Approving all payrolls or other compensations for personal services.
Metro-North Commuter Railroad	Senior Manager of Employment	A subsidiary of New York State's Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Metro-North is recognized as one of the nation's preeminent railroads, winning the coveted American Public Transportation Association's Outstanding Achievement Award in 1993, 1998, and 1999. In 2008, MTA Metro-North Railroad had a system-wide on-time performance of 97.5%, attained a record ridership of over 84.2 million, and scored a record 94% customer satisfaction rating. The railroad also manages The Hudson Rail Link feeder bus service in the Bronx, and The Haverstraw-Ossining and Newburgh-Beacon ferries.
Public Sector		
Organization	Participant's Title	Organization Description
Charleston County Government	Director of Organizational Development	Charleston County government's mission is, "We will promote and protect the quality of life in Charleston County by delivering services of value to the community. " The Human Resources Department recruits, trains and supports the staff necessary for the basic operation of County government. The Department also supports the management staff of Charleston County toward its goal of effectively utilizing its most valuable resource, its employees. This effort includes organizing employment activities, developing policies and procedures, administering the County's benefits and compensation programs, providing training, coordinating award and recognition programs, as well as facilitating employee relations and interventions.
Pentagon, Headquarters Air Force	Special Appointment	The mission of the United States Air Force is to deliver sovereign options for the defense of the United States of America and its global interests- to fly and fight in air, space and cyberspace. The Department of the Air Force incorporates all elements of the U.S. Air Force. It is administered by a civilian secretary appointed by the president and is supervised by a military chief of staff. The Secretariat and Air Staff help the secretary and the chief of staff direct the Air Force mission.

Exhibit IV-1 Benchmarking Partner Information		
Private Sector		
Organization	Participant's Title	Organization Description
Hilton	General Manager	Hilton is the proud flagship brand of Hilton Hotels Corporation and the most recognized name in the global lodging industry. Conrad Hilton purchased his first hotel in Cisco, Texas back in 1919. Since that time we have grown to over 500 hotels in cities all over the world. "Be My Guest" is still the gracious and warm way we want our guests to feel at Hilton hotels and resorts whether it's at the grand Waldorf-Astoria, the Cavalieri Hilton in Rome, the Hilton Waikoloa Village or our brand new Hilton Omaha.
FedEx Express	Industrial Psychologist Advisor	FedEx provides customers and businesses worldwide with a broad portfolio of transportation, e-commerce and business services. We offer integrated business applications through operating companies competing collectively and managed collaboratively, under the respected FedEx brand. Consistently ranked among the world's most admired and trusted employers, FedEx inspires its more than 290,000 employees and contractors to remain absolutely, positively focused on safety, the highest ethical and professional standards and the needs of their customers and communities.
UPS Freight	Director of Workforce Planning	Founded in 1907 as a messenger company in the United States, UPS has grown into a \$49.7 billion corporation by clearly focusing on the goal of enabling commerce around the globe. Today UPS is a global company with one of the most recognized and admired brands in the world. We have become the world's largest package delivery company and a leading global provider of specialized transportation and logistics services. Every day, we manage the flow of goods, funds, and information in more than 200 countries and territories worldwide.
Raytheon	Vice President of Executive Leadership, Learning, and Organization Effectiveness	Throughout its more than 80-year history, Raytheon Company has been a leader in developing defense technologies and converting those technologies for use in commercial markets. From its early days as a maker of radio tubes, its adaptation of World War II radar technology to invent microwave cooking, and its development of the first guided missile, Raytheon has successfully built upon its pioneering tradition to become a global technology leader.
General Dynamics Information Technology	Senior Human Performance Analyst	At General Dynamics Information Technology, we are dedicated to providing the latest, highest-quality information technology (IT) services and resources our customers have come to expect. General Dynamics, a Fortune 100 company, has been serving the U.S. government for more than 50 years. IT has transformed the way the U.S. military fights and wins wars, so too has IT transformed General Dynamics. Once primarily known for providing tanks, ships and submarines to the Department of Defense, today General Dynamics has become a market leader in mission-critical information systems and technologies to agencies across the U.S. government and to allied nations around the world.

Exhibit IV-1 Benchmarking Partner Information		
Time Warner	Director of People Development	Time Warner Inc. is a leading media and entertainment company, whose businesses include interactive services, filmed entertainment, television networks and publishing. Whether measured by quality, popularity or financial results, our divisions are at the top of their categories. Time Warner's businesses strive to gain competitive advantage from opportunities for constructive collaboration. We are innovators in technology, products and services. Our digital products and services reinforce the company's industry-leading brands on all platforms with a focus on growth, engagement and monetization.
Embarq	Manager, Recruitment, Selection and Assessment	Embarq Corporation offers a complete suite of communications services. EMBARQ has operations in 18 states and is in the Fortune 500 list of America's largest corporations. For consumers, EMBARQ offers an innovative portfolio of services that includes reliable local and long distance home phone service, high-speed Internet, wireless, and satellite TV. For businesses, EMBARQ has a comprehensive range of flexible and integrated services designed to help businesses of all sizes be more productive and communicate with their customers. This service portfolio includes local voice and data services, long distance, High Speed Internet, wireless, satellite TV, enhanced data network services, voice and data communication equipment and managed network services.
Utilities		
Organization	Participant's Title	Organization Description
Metro Water District of Southern California	Strategic Program Manager, Human Resources	The Metropolitan Water District of Southern California is a consortium of 26 cities and water districts that provides 1.7 billion gallons of drinking water per day to nearly 19 million people in parts of Los Angeles, Orange, San Diego, Riverside, Ventura, and San Bernardino counties. The mission of the Metropolitan Water District of Southern California is to provide its service area with adequate and reliable supplies of high-quality water to meet present and future needs in an environmentally and responsible way.
Sempra Energy	Staffing Advisor	Sempra Energy was created in 1998 by a merger of parent companies of two long-established, and highly respected, investor-owned utilities with rich histories dating back more than 100 years. We were founded to capitalize on new opportunities in competitive energy markets. Our ongoing focus is to enhance shareholder value and meet customer needs by sustaining the financial strength, operational flexibility and skilled workforce needed to succeed in rapidly changing market conditions. We're a Fortune 500 energy services company, based in San Diego, California, that combines deep industry expertise with rigorous risk management when we evaluate market opportunities.
San Francisco Public Utilities Commission	Assistant Human Resources Director	The San Francisco Public Utilities Commission (SFPUC) is a department of the City and County of San Francisco that provides water, wastewater, and municipal power services to San Francisco. Under contractual agreement with 28 wholesale water agencies, the SFPUC also supplies water to 1.6 million additional customers within three Bay Area counties. The SFPUC system provides four distinct services: Regional Water, Local Water, Wastewater (collection, treatment, and disposal), and Power.

Exhibit IV-1 Benchmarking Partner Information		
Northwest Natural Gas	Manager, Employment & Employee/Labor Relations	We've been proud to serve the energy needs of our Northwest customers with clean, reliable, and efficient natural gas since 1859. We build, maintain and operate the local natural gas distribution system—that is, the pipes and related equipment that transport natural gas to homes and businesses. In recent years, NW Natural's growth rate has exceeded the national average for local distribution companies. This growth is due to strong customer preference for natural gas for space heating and water heating and the relative cost-efficiency of natural gas. NW Natural is committed to enhancing the quality of life in its service area through environmental protection.

2.5 Analysis of Benchmarking Data

Once the focus group interviews were complete, the research team made sure that the notes for each focus group interview were accurate, and then analyzed the data. The team listened to each interview recording and compared the recording to the notes taken during the interview. Any gaps or misunderstandings in the notes were rectified. We carefully reviewed the notes from each interview to identify the themes that emerged from participants' responses. Two members of the research team identified themes from the interviews, and noted overlap in themes. Where gaps did exist between researcher themes, the findings were discussed and consensus was reached for inclusion in this report.

2.6 Benchmarking Study Results

The participants in the five focus groups provided ample information about the challenges their organizations face and the approaches they use to manage those challenges. Results revealed that many of the related industry organizations tend to have the same challenges as those faced by transit agencies. Participants also provided our research team with a number of strategies that could be useful for recruiting, developing, and retaining managers in the transit industry.

2.6.1 Recruitment Challenges and Strategies

The following are two challenges that almost all organizations faced when recruiting managers.

- Cost of Recruitment. A majority of organizations cannot afford to pay for recruitment- this is especially true for participants working in government.
- Attracting Diverse Talent. Nearly all focus group participants agreed that they were having difficulty attracting and retaining diverse talent.

The following are several other challenges that organizations confront in recruiting for managerial positions:

- Geographic Location. The geographic location of the workplace poses a recruitment problem many organizations. Participants stated that their geographic location does not attract the strongest workers.
- Managerial Skill Gaps. Participants also noted that there is often a gap in technical and people skills appropriate for manager positions. For instance, one participant said, “The challenge is finding cross-functionally trained leaders with credible understanding of different functions... managers were put in place because of their technical skills, not managerial people skills.” Similarly, another participant stated how the lack of managerial skills hampers internal hiring, “We feel that internal talent is not creating a management development program that would allow us to bring a person in to get that entry level experience to develop from within.”
- Balancing Internal and External Talent. This challenge deals with balancing the need for internal technical knowledge of the organization with the need for leadership and managerial skills. There was a bit of controversy among participants about whether this is a challenge, which skills are most important to have, what skills can be most easily trained, and in what order the training should occur.
- Moving People in the Organization. Participants stated that one challenge of maintaining a succession planning program is moving people around in the organization, specifically at the senior levels. For example, there may be a skill loss in a department when the manager moves to another department and is replaced with a less experienced manager.
- Identifying Senior Managers. This is a challenge for many organizations, but it is particularly relevant for organizations that do not often promote from within. Participants stated that it was difficult to identify individuals for senior level positions from both internal and external applicant pools. There is also concern with developing the individuals in senior roles into the future leaders of an organization.

Despite these numerous recruitment challenges, organizations have found many creative strategies in the form of both internal and external approaches. Internal strategies including the following:

- Hire from Within. The idea behind hiring and promoting from within an organization is that managers will have risen through the ranks and, as a result, they understand many facets of their organization and their new position. Some participants noted that as many as 85-95% of their senior management/directors are internal promotions. One organization in particular sets hiring targets (e.g., 50% internal hires, 50% external hires) in order to have a mix of new talent with strong leadership skills and internal hires with strong technical skills.
- Change Traditional Management Development Model. Some participants suggested changing the traditional management development model (that of selecting managers based on technical skills and training the people skills) to a different model where managers are selected based on people skills and then trained on technical skills.

- This change would require restructuring training and development programs to focus on the skills necessary for success at various levels in an organization.
- Coordinate Hiring Managers with Recruitment Team. One organization has begun to emphasize having hiring managers and the recruiting team work closely together to recruit potential managers. The idea is that this collaboration ensures that the organization is sourcing, identifying, and hiring qualified and diverse talent. Another organization uses a managerial assessment process for entry level positions. This allows hiring managers to identify high potential applicants who could be future candidates for managerial positions.

Although the last two strategies deal with recruitment challenges were discussed as internal approaches in the focus groups, it is possible that they may also be used when organizations hire externally. Participants also identified other approaches for hiring external management talent:

- Recruit retired military. One transit-related organization recruited from the military for managerial positions. The organization partnered with a selection firm to select high potential candidates coming out of the military. In addition, this organization works with West Point to attract its graduates. The organization participates in employer panel discussions, conducts mock interviews, and explains how the graduates' military experience relates to positions within the organization.
- Use Trade Journals and the Internet. This strategy involves recruiting the readers of trade journals and individuals job seeking over the Internet using common job search websites such as Monster.com. Many participants stated that their organizations have sophisticated online application systems for applicants. However, most participants believed these systems were mainly used for hourly employees, not managers.
- Post jobs on Job Aggregator Websites. Some organizations have begun to use job aggregator websites instead of simpler job search websites to upload their job postings. Job aggregator websites collect job postings from other websites and aggregate them into one database. Job aggregators often include jobs from big-name job search websites (e.g., Monster.com, CareerBuilder.com) as well as other large and smaller job sites, and may even include jobs from employer websites. Examples of job aggregators include: Indeed.com, SimplyHired.com, and TheLadders.com which is specifically geared toward upper level managers and executives.
- Use Social Networking. A growing trend in recruiting is using social networking to recruit employees.
 - Relationships with Boards and Colleges. Virtually all of the participants mentioned establishing relationships with subject-diverse professional groups and colleges and universities in order to learn where talent is available. One participant indicated that her organization used aggressive mail- and web-based recruitment strategies that target professional organizations and colleagues in the industry.
 - Attend Professional Conferences. Participants stated that they sometimes partner with others in the same industry to market their industry and organizations at professional conferences. This could be an especially useful

way to attract applicants if an organization is recruiting from a specific field (e.g., engineering, accounting). One participant pointed out that his organization has partnered with the National Black MBA Association to recruit its members. Others noted the usefulness of partnering with minority associations to increase the diversity of applicants.

- Online Social Networks. Several participants stated that their organizations have begun to use, or are considering using, online social networks to recruit talent externally. Participants specifically mentioned LinkedIn, Facebook, MySpace, and Twitter as websites they use, or that they would like to use. They believe that establishing a presence on the Internet is important, and that online social networks are one answer, since communications on these websites now exceed the number of email communications in the past two years. One participant explained that she had uploaded a job posting for a director position on LinkedIn the day before our focus group, and she already had 23 candidates. Similar social networks could also be used internally, as in one organization that was part of a focus group. The participant stated that his organization established an internal social network to increase the visibility of opportunities to move within the organization. Employees voluntarily describe their career interests, geographical interests, and other factors, and the forum facilitates communication between employees and the organization about internal opportunities.

2.6.2 Training and Development Challenges and Strategies

The focus group participants reported the following training and development challenges:

- Cost of Training and Development. Participants said that the cost of training and development had been a major challenge for their organizations. Typically, organizations are faced with providing first-rate training and development on an extremely limited budget. Participants indicated that this is particularly difficult for developing individuals in executive and management roles who are expected to hit the ground running once they are hired.
- Process for Identifying/Preparing High Potentials. Some participants were looking for ways to identify and prepare their high potential employees for training and development processes.
- Applying Learned Knowledge and Skills. Participants also mentioned that getting managers to apply what they have learned in leadership training and development courses in their day-to-day activities is a challenge. There appears to be a disconnect between leadership courses and applicability to the job.

The study participants cited numerous strategies to train and develop their organizations' managers. These strategies are discussed below:

- Management and leadership training. Nearly all participants mentioned using some type of management or leadership training, although some participants stated that

their organizations offer little in terms of management training, as they tend to allocate most training money toward technical training (e.g., in one case, about 95% of their training is based on technical skills). Two participants mentioned formalized training programs for managers. One such program focuses on practices, leadership skills, coaching and mentoring, procedures and policies, in addition to a course specifically designed for incoming executives. Another organization offers four structured programs geared toward a manager's specific level of management (i.e., front line supervisors, managers, directors, and senior staff). One participant described how his organization integrated training and management selection/recruiting by offering employees a course that "helps them understand the role of a manager and provides them with feedback for whether or not they have the necessary skill sets to be a manager." For most of the leadership courses, a nomination from a manager or supervisor is required in order to enroll.

- **Offsite Training.** A couple of participants stated that the majority of their organization's training was conducted onsite. However, most participants believed their organizations were moving toward a more blended learning model. The blended learning model includes traditional face-to-face onsite and classroom training, along with offsite training, distance training, and e-training which occurs virtually.
- **E-training.** About half of the focus group participants specifically mentioned using e-training in their organizations. Organizations have created databases of tools and training opportunities for employees that make it convenient to find the tools and courses they need. The most common reason for using e-training was that it saves classroom expenses and that geographically dispersed employees can take the course more easily. Since it would be costly to get dispersed managers into a centralized location, organizations are budgeting for e-training and technology that allows them to interact with remote locations virtually. In addition, the training is available at all times of the day for employees with odd schedules, or if the training must be completed outside of work. Organizations often partner with educational institutions such as the Harvard Business Review in order to offer a wide range of managerial tutorials and training to managers.
- **Succession Planning.** Among the participating organizations, there was variation in whether and how they used succession planning. Often organizations use succession planning to create career paths and promote from within to fill vacant positions. Some organizations have formalized succession planning for more senior level positions, but more individualized development without an emphasis on career paths for lower level employees. Public sector organizations tended to operate within a merit system rather than using succession planning. In this case, the organization works to identify high potential individuals early on through Continuity of Operations Plans.
- **Job Rotation.** Almost all of the focus group participants, both public and private sector organizations, cited the use of job rotational programs within their organizations. Job rotation is a development approach where an individual is moved through a series of assignments or positions in order to give him or her learning experiences as well as broad exposure to the organization. Rotational assignments are often given to help prepare employees and managers for the responsibility of a higher level position. Many employees find these new challenges attractive because

it means their job responsibilities are constantly changing and they are gaining experience from different positions.

- **Mentoring/Coaching Programs.** Mentoring and coaching programs are another way organizations develop their high potential employees. The mentoring programs discussed in the focus groups varied from formal to informal. The formal mentoring programs are most often for the more junior level employees, but some organizations use formal mentoring programs for any level of employee who chooses to participate. Informal mentoring programs tend to focus on managerial staff. One participant described an informal program as one where the corporate leadership team is encouraged to mentor more junior managers. Although the process is informal, there is a commitment to teach the mentees. Another, more formal approach described by another participant is one where new executives are given a mentor/coach who works with the executive during the on-boarding process. Organizations that use both formal and informal mentoring practices either have different practices depending upon the level of the employees (e.g., managers have an informal mentoring program), or a formal mentoring relationship exists between a manager and a subordinate, and informal mentoring opportunities are also available with other upper level managers. In some cases, the mentee selects their mentor, while in other cases the supervisor of the mentee serves as the mentor.
- **Self-Coaching.** One organization reported using self-coaching. This organization has developed a self-coaching training course that allows participants to create their own career path, and ensures that they have the right tools and guidance to develop as they choose.

2.6.3 Retention Challenges and Strategies

Although most of the focus group participants described a reduction in turnover due to the weak economy, some reported retention challenges. Specifically, participants working in the public sector found that private sector attraction was a major retention challenge. Participants also cited different retention issues with employees depending upon their tenure, and the number of potential Baby Boomer retirements in the coming years. These challenges are discussed below:

- **Loss of Employees to the Private Sector.** Participants from public sector and public utilities tended to believe that the private sector was very attractive to their employees. They thought that the private sector promised better pay and more responsibility for similar experience in the public sector. These participants also stated that public sector organizations often lack the good branding often ascribed to private sector companies. As one participant noted, “We are working on employee branding opportunities to outreach, which will be great since most people do not know that [this] industry could be a career.”
- **Loss of Employees with Low Tenure.** In general, the participants believed that retention is not a problem among upper level managers with many years of service. Participants cited investment in retirement programs and incentives such as development programs as reasons managers tend to stay with an organization. On the

other hand, prior to the souring economy, employee turnover was high among younger and less tenured workers.

- Loss of Individuals to Retirement. Despite the poor economy, and often dwindling retirement packages and pension plans, some of the participants still see the potential number of Baby Boomer retirees as a challenge for their organizations. Because there is such a large number of potential retirees, organizations are concerned with the amount of institutional knowledge that will leave the company as individuals retire.

Participants reported various strategies to increase retention, or to deal with potential turnover. Most retention strategies centered on the following:

- Employee Engagement. Below are three employee engagement techniques organizations in our study used to increase retention:
 - Exit Surveys. One approach participants use to learn about why individuals leave an organization is to use an exit survey. An exit survey is a survey used by an employer to get feedback about why employees voluntarily leave an organization. This allows organizations to identify problems or trends in turnover and take action to resolve those problems.
 - Engagement Surveys. Unlike exit surveys that only assess employees when they leave an organization, engagement surveys are used by a few participants to determine how engaged current employees are in their jobs. Employee engagement surveys often measure organizational commitment, job satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behaviors to determine engagement. The results of this type of survey can identify areas in which the organization can improve and leaders can use this information to implement an action plan. One participant suggested that it may be useful to link engagement survey with an exit survey to establish whether actions have helped to decrease turnover. Similar to engagement surveys, one participant stated that her organization used a retention survey which was linked to a retention model to predict turnover. Her organization used this model to identify hotspots where people were thinking about leaving. This was a practice that executives loved because the organization could clearly see where improvements needed to be made to reduce turnover.
 - Create High Potential Workplace. As one participant stated, organizations should create a high potential workplace because the “end result is that people go home feeling better about contributing to the organization, and want to stay with the organization.” Establishing a work environment where people feel that they can contribute, that their voice is heard, and that they are working with other high potential employees, they will likely feel engaged with the organization which could decrease their likelihood of leaving. Creating a high potential workplace involves improving the organization as a whole through improvement of a variety of organizational systems including recruitment, selection, training, communication, decision-making, compensation, and performance appraisal.
- Compensation. Several participants mentioned that salary was an important factor in retaining managers. As mentioned above, some public sector organizations have a

- challenge retaining their employees because they move to the private sector which often offers higher salaries. In our study, both public and private organizations used salary surveys to determine how much employees in a particular job are typically paid. Salary surveys determine the median or average compensation paid to employees in a job using compensation data from several organizations. The data is analyzed to develop an understanding of the compensation paid to employees in one or more jobs, or in specific regions, industries, or employer sizes. One participant stated that her organization uses salary surveys to stay competitive.
- **Benefits.** The following are benefits were discussed as strategies to retain managers:
 - **Retirement Benefits.** A few of the study participants noted that upper managers tend to stay with an organization because they are invested in the organization, as they have typically been there for a number of years, and they are invested in the retirement system. In addition, having a defined retirement benefits plan was seen as desirable to managers and a way to recruit and retain them.
 - **Developmental Programs.** Several participants stated that their organization has trouble retaining younger workers and senior employees who have been passed up for promotion into managerial roles. The participants identified development programs and more transparent promote-from-within strategies to retaining these individuals. One development program emphasized the organization's promote from within culture. Employees bought into this culture as the organization showed them what their career trajectory could be and how they were capable of moving up over the course of eight to ten years. Another such program defined the type of leadership the organization wanted in top roles and then identified high potential junior level employees. These junior employees were then involved in a development program that involved a succession plan to clearly lay out their career paths. Again using junior employees, recent college graduates were used in another organization. The graduates were brought on board for a twelve-month rotational program through many of the organization's departments. At the end of the year, the graduates are promoted. Some individuals from the 2005 graduate class are now in managerial roles within the company. Other organizations focus less on succession plans, and more on an individual's current development needs. These informal development programs focus on addressing an individual's current strengths and weaknesses, and typically do not cover career goals or deal with a five- or ten-year career path.
 - **Knowledge Management.** With Baby Boomer retirements already happening or about to happen, organizations are attempting to capture the knowledge of these long tenured and high level managers before they retire. One participant said their organization used a variety of tools and systems to capture retiring managers' institutional knowledge. However, she said that each department was capturing this knowledge in a different way, so there was not comprehensive approach throughout the organization, which could later pose a problem if the departments attempt to consolidate this information. Another organization brought its senior level executives together for training and development exercises in order to share their knowledge with one another.

V. Task 5: Prepare Interim Report

The research team provided the SPO with the Interim Report, delivered in hard copy form, on May 8, 2009. The Interim Meeting was held on June 26, 2009 from 9:00am - 2:30pm in Washington, D.C. Interim Meeting notes with feedback from the Panel were provided on July 8, 2009.

Changes to the work plan that were agreed upon by the Panel in the Interim meeting have been incorporated into this Final Guidebook as well as the notes outlined by the SPO.

Phase II of TCRP Project F-14

VI. Task 6: Assess Opportunities and Barriers to Implementation

In completing this task, the research team considered the practical solutions and strategies developed from the literature review, other-industry focus groups and transit case studies and assessed the organizational factors which may facilitate or provide opportunities to implement these solutions for transit systems throughout the U.S. In addition to providing details about the types of strategies that could be implemented by agencies, the team outlined example reasons the strategy may be feasible or difficult for some agencies to implement (i.e., the barriers). Finally, to help transit systems recognize the benefits of the recommendation even under constraints, we provided alternative solutions that allow a system which faces many barriers and resource limitations to still implement some component of the strategic recommendation suggested. In each strategic recommendation, examples of facilitators to implementation were also identified by the case study participants were provided. The opportunities and barriers are included with each recommendation in the Guidebook.

The intent in identifying opportunities (i.e., facilitators) and barriers is to help systems consider these factors within their own organization and help to ensure the success of recruitment, development or retention initiatives (e.g., sound communication strategy) as well as those factors that can impede the success of a program.

VII. Task 7: Prepare Recommendations

The team prepared practical solutions and guidance for the recruitment, development, and retention of managers in the transit industry. Guidance was based on our analyses of data gathered in Tasks 1, 2, 3, and 4 of the study, the comments from the panel members at the interim meeting (Task 5), and the opportunities and barriers to implementation indicated in Task 6. For instance, if one of the recruitment recommendations was to attend professional training conferences, we briefly described the premise of the best practice, examples of these training conferences, and related organizational factors that may influence the ease of implementation of this recommendation. The impact of this practice on the recruitment, development and retention of managers was also discussed. Based on panel feedback from the Interim meeting, we provided tables approximately 1-2 pages in length for each strategy recommended and these overviews include a description of the strategy and outline some of the major steps agencies need to consider in implementing the recommendation. All recommendations are provided in the project F-14 Human Resource Management Guidebook for Transit System Managers.

VIII. Task 8: Prepare Final Report

In lieu of a final report, the final product from this research is a practical Guidebook, per the Panel's feedback in the Interim Meeting. This Guidebook recommends practices and strategies for recruiting, developing and retaining high-quality managers for bus fixed-route and paratransit systems. The Guidebook provides sufficient information to be informative and useful, but not so much detail that it is overwhelming and cumbersome. The Guidebook is provided in a simple user-friendly format that includes practical recommendations that managers can easily use to come up with solutions for their agencies. We incorporated a Table of Content and figures that help guide the reader through the Guidebook.

Although the research addressed factors that affect recruitment, development, and retention of transit managers (e.g., location, population density, economic conditions), the Guidebook is not restricted to only discussing solutions in the context of the current economy. We understand that, regardless of economic conditions, it remains important for transit systems to have effective practices and strategies for recruiting, developing, and retaining transit managers.

Project manager, Dr. Lance Anderson of ICF International may be contacted regarding additional questions about the research methodology. His contact information is: (703) 934-3674 or LAnderson@icfi.com

Appendix A

Literature Review Report

Literature Review Report

TCRP Project F-14

“Addressing Critical Shortfalls: Recruitment, Development, and Retention of High-Quality Managers for Public Transportation Systems”

1. Overview of Approach

The goal of the literature review was to develop a deeper understanding of the issues and proven solutions to hiring, developing and retaining highly competent managers. To achieve this goal, we conducted a comprehensive analysis of available literature, practices, methods and strategies employed by public transportation systems and non-transportation organizations in the areas of recruitment, development, and retention of middle and upper level managers.

We structured the literature review to identify and assemble information from published research, technical reports, conference presentations, and case studies on ways workforce challenges with management jobs have been addressed successfully. During our review, our team specifically addressed the following eight workforce issues:

- **Recruiting diverse management staff:** Describing new strategies for attracting new talent
- **Selection and placement:** Implementing efficient and job relevant hiring procedures; identify existing talent for promotional opportunities
- **Restructuring of benefits and policies:** Phased retirement and flexible arrangements for existing talent or policies that will attract new talent
- **Job classification and job design:** Restructuring and/or consolidating functions, allowing for job sharing or other new job structures
- **Retaining staff:** Determining productivity levels based on staff retention
- **Succession planning:** Identifying high potentials for key management and leadership roles
- **Educating, training and developing staff:** Formal internal and external management training and development (e.g., classroom instruction) and informal on-the-job development and training including coaching, mentoring, job assignments, job rotations, stretch assignments and performance appraisal.
- **Developing knowledge management systems:** Capturing critical institutional data; strategies to address need for new knowledges to respond to emerging innovations

2. Summary of Findings

We report our literature review results by each issue below. Our findings indicate that all eight topics are highly interrelated—success in one area impacts the others—which is reflected in our summary. For each issue, we provide potential challenges, best practices, and solutions supported by research and strategies for continued success.

2.1 Recruiting diverse management staff: The recruitment process is an essential aspect of human resource management as it starts the relationship that all staff have with an organization. It also plays a major role in determining the composition of an organization's staff. To bolster recruitment practices, organizations should:

- **Diversify recruiting techniques.** Utilizing a wide variety of recruiting techniques is an important element in building a deep and diverse applicant pool.
 - Broad reach advertising through radio or television spots can be used. There may also be an opportunity to use public service announcements which are often free (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - When recruiting, many agencies make use of local community colleges or trade schools that offer related programs (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - On-vehicle advertising, such as a sign on a transit agency's bus, is used by many agencies; it is also helpful to give drivers information about the positions and to have applications on the vehicle (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - The U.S. Class I railroad industry has found recent success partnering with or hiring from the U.S. Military and NARS. This is likely because the railroad industry and the military share similar job attributes such as 24/7 operations and operation of heavy equipment (Reinach, Stephen, Viale, Alex, 2007).
 - Job fairs, employment centers and workforce development programs, community bulletin boards and local newspapers geared toward special populations (e.g., seniors or retirees) have also been successful in transit organizations (TRB, 2008, KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Companies such as Wal-Mart have begun targeting seniors and retirees as potential applicants by connecting with the American Association for Retired Persons (AARP) (Breugh, 2008).
 - In looking for software engineers and marketing representatives, RightNow Technologies, a Montana-based company, discovered that job advertisements in major cities were ineffective so they began searching for individuals who had a local tie and found directly targeting of alumni from Montana State University was effective (Breugh, 2008).
 - Johnson & Johnson and Booz Allen Hamilton have established alumni programs and put a lot of effort into rehiring former employees (Breugh, 2008).
 - For higher management and executive level jobs, HR managers report using personal contacts and search firms which are not typically used for lower-level positions (Chapman and Webster, 2003).
 - Research also suggests making recruitment more than just HR's responsibility. It should be an organization wide effort. For example, at the

Santa Clara VTA, their HR leveraged the skills of the marketing division to create job advertisements for an upcoming job fair. Printed materials included: newspaper ads, exterior bus-boards, interior car-cards, on-board flyers, passenger newsletter, rail station posters, job fair event programs and promotional items (TRB, 2002).

- **Implement employee referral programs.** Employee referrals are one of the most reliable means of recruitment.
 - Systems that are having difficulty recruiting employees can investigate the feasibility of developing a formal employee referral program for recruitment including cash bonuses for successful referrals (Reinach, Stephen, Viale, Alex, 2007; Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
 - For example, Citibus in Lubbock, TX offers a \$400 incentive for new operator referrals after 6 months employment. It is also worthwhile to note that delaying the incentive encouraged the employee to mentor new hires (TRB, 2008).
 - Research shows that the use of employee referrals (i.e., referred by a friend) and unsolicited walk-in applications are linked to lower voluntary turnover and higher skilled applicants than recruitment means such as advertisements, school placement offices, or employment agency referrals (Breugh, 2008).

- **Improve organization and job information on agency website.** Company websites have been found to generate a large number of job applicants at a low cost to the company.
 - For websites, factors such as content (e.g., highlighting components of the job), aesthetics (e.g., pictures; font), and user-friendliness have been identified as important considerations by applicants (Breugh, 2008).
 - A research study found that applicants were more attracted to jobs that had a website which provided interactive information about the extent to which the person "fit" with the organization (Breugh, 2008).
 - As an illustration, the Internet has become a critical recruitment tool in the U.S. freight rail industry; prospective applicants are referred to a railroad's website and job seekers can find information about available jobs on a railroad's website, job placement sites, and railroad-related sites (Reinach, Stephen, Viale, Alex, 2007).

- **Deliberately design recruitment program.** Research suggests the following as important to consider in focusing recruitment efforts: 1) Job requirements and employee skills needed to perform them; 2) Number of applicants desired; 3) Technical or trade skills and certifications required; 4) Cost and cost-effectiveness of effort; 5) Human resources required for the effort; 6) Particulars of job that may be more attractive to certain populations; and 7) the audience for the effort (TRB, 2008c).
 - Additional components of the recruitment process include: 1) Strategy development (e.g., whom to recruit, where, time of recruitment activities, message to communicate, budget constraints); 2) The specific recruitment

- activities implemented (e.g., methods used, information conveyed, recruiters used, job offer); and 3) Measuring recruitment results (Breugh, 2008).
 - Factors/variables believed to moderate (intervene) between recruitment activities and recruitment results are applicant reactions or characteristics (e.g., applicant attention, message credibility, applicant interest/position attractiveness, applicant expectations of the job, applicant decision-making process) (Breugh, 2008).
 - Research has found that the way a recruiter treats an applicant impacts the applicant's perceptions of how he/she will be treated on the job.
 - Studies have found that applicants will change their mind and decide not to take a job they initially liked if the recruiter behaves negatively (Breugh, 2008).
- **Provide Realistic Job Previews (RJP).** RJPs provide applicants with an accurate description of both the positive and negative aspects of a job during the recruitment process.
- While RJPs may deter some applicants from applying for or accepting positions, research shows that RJPs reduce turnover for those applicants who receive them and except a job offer (Reinach, Stephen, Viale, Alex, 2007).
 - Well constructed RJPs might include an agency tour, participation in a simulation of the job, or viewing a video of a typical day (McEvoy and Cascio, 1985).
 - Work simulations also help to improve the accuracy of the applicant's expectations regarding a job and provide insight into the applicant's ability to do the job (Breugh, 2008).
 - Research shows that realistic job previews have a greater impact for jobs with lower visibility as opposed to jobs frequently seen in the public (e.g., manager positions) and in situations where the applicant has other job opportunities to consider (Breugh, 2008).
 - Realistic job previews should be provided early in the recruitment process because they have little effectiveness if provided after hiring (Breugh, 2008). As an example, The New York City Administration for Children's Services wanted to increase retention so they began advertising in subway cars with a realistic message about the job that reads "Wanted: men and women willing to walk into strange buildings in dangerous neighborhoods, be screamed at by unhinged individuals-perhaps in a language you do not understand- and, on occasion, forcibly remove a child...because the alternative could have tragic consequences." (Breugh, 2008).
 - Commonly used approaches for realistic job previews (RJPs) such as booklets and videos (one-way communications) may be less effective than two-way communication approaches which can gauge the relevance of the RJP to the applicant (Breugh, 2008).
 - Likewise, it is important not to overemphasize promotional opportunities and benefits in recruiting (exaggerating advancement opportunities). This will help to minimize cognitive dissonance experienced by entry managers; thus, reducing turnover (Mass, 1978).

- **Consider organization and job fit in the recruitment process.** Recruitment strategies that consider a person's personality fit with the organization are linked to reduced turnover (Johnson, Winter, Reio, Thompson, Petrosko, 2008).
 - Recruiters should include descriptions of the "ideal candidate's personality" in their media that match the job requirements so applicants with the best person-job or person-organization fit will pursue the job (e.g., jobs where high level of control is needed such as Director of Quality Control should advertise the "ideal candidate" as someone who likes large amounts of responsibility) (Johnson, Winter, Reio, Thompson, Petrosko, 2008).
 - The literature indicates there are 10 workplace attractors that influence an individual's decision to take a job as well as remain with the organization. These attractors can influence satisfaction with work and should be described during the recruitment process to the extent possible (Amundson, 2007).
 - The 10 workplace attractors are as follows: 1) Financial, physical safety, and position security; 2) Location; 3) Interactions and opportunity to build social relations with coworkers; 4) Appreciation and acknowledgement of work performed; 5) The individual's need to be engaged in meaningful work; 6) Extent to which skills and interests align with work requirements; 7) Perceived; 8) Challenging activities and training; 9) Autonomy; and 10) Involvement in activities that allow person to create new things (Amundson, 2007).
 - Younger workers want autonomy, responsibility, mentorship, recognition, and a deeper sense of community at work. These factors are especially important for younger workers because the family structure is more egalitarian but also broken by divorces and separation (Izzo & Withers, 2001; Amundson, 2007).
 - Older workers want to stay involved in work activities longer but also want to have a mix of leisure activities (Amundson, 2007).

2.2 Selection and placement: Selection and hiring of qualified employees is an essential function for the health of any organization. To bolster selection and placement practices, agencies should:

- **Develop comprehensive assessment process.** A comprehensive assessment process is a valuable tool in predicting job performance. As an illustration of a well designed process, the Division of Merit Recruitment and Selection (DMRS) in Wisconsin employs an integrated strategy for hiring that consists of four components: Entry Professional Program (EPP); Critical Recruitment Program (CRP); Walk-in Civil Service Testing; and JOBS (an automated job vacancy system) (Lavigna, 1996). More detail on this system is provided below:
 - The EPP is an automated hiring system shown to reduce adverse impact. It requires the agency to submit a comprehensive recruitment plan that identifies ways to attract women, minorities and persons with disabilities if the job classification is imbalanced. Once approved, the vacancy is announced in the

- state Current Employment Opportunities Bulletin that describes the desired qualifications of applicants (Lavigna, 1996).
- The second step in the EPP entails developing a valid, job-related strategy for evaluating applicants. Three common techniques in the strategy include: 1) Review of resumes or written transcripts and then sorting applicants into "qualified" and "unqualified" groupings; 2) For larger groupings of applicants, applicants are prioritized by "best-qualified", "well qualified" and "qualified"; and 3) Written multiple-choice exams are used for very large groups of applicants (Lavigna, 1996).
 - EPP allows agencies to interview a larger number of candidates than traditional civil service systems which allow only 5 to 10. All candidates for interviews receive equal consideration and the EPP system provides "designer registers" that include only candidates who meet specific agency needs and job descriptions. The EPP is efficient and sometimes produces lists of candidates to interview within 48 hours (Lavigna, 1996).
 - With the EPP, after a candidate is hired, the agency must report on recruitment techniques, candidate evaluation criteria, how long each recruitment step took, demographic characteristics of the applicants and hires, and overall satisfaction with the process (Lavigna, 1996).
 - CPR provides services to agencies only for positions that have attracted fewer than 10 qualified candidates in the past or have market data which demonstrates a shortage of candidates (Lavigna, 1996).
 - CPR entails using training and experience measures and job task checklists or academic crediting schedules instead of more time-consuming screening such as multiple-choice exams (Lavigna, 1996).
 - CPR interviews all applicants immediately so that time delay does not discourage applicants. For example, at Wisconsin Hospital applicants can walk-in and apply at the hospital at any time, be interviewed and evaluated and offered a job the same day (Lavigna, 1996). With walk-in civil service testing, applicants can go to a test site on any day and take the test and complete an application on the spot. They no longer have to wait six weeks to receive confirmation regarding submission of their responses (Lavigna, 1996).
 - JOBS provides immediate electronic vacancy information that is provided to the public (Lavigna, 1996).
- **Ensure hiring assessments are reliable and valid.** As indicated in other sections, all hiring assessments should be pilot tested and validated to ensure they are measuring intended applicant characteristics (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- For example, research recommends the use of behavioral-based interviewing that relies on candidate past behaviors as opposed to traditional interviewing which asks about hypothetical situations. (Based on the theory that past behavior is the best predictor of future behavior) (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
 - Likewise, at least 2 interviewers should always be used to reduce subjectivity in evaluating candidates (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).

- Prescreen tests should be job relevant and validated as such. Unqualified HR managers can often purchase assessments which should be interpreted by trained psychologists.
 - It is also critical to pay attention to established testing guidelines (e.g., Standards for Educational and Psychological Testing (APA), Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures, and the Principles for Validation and Use of Personnel Selection Procedures (SIOP)) (Russell, 2007).
 - Research has found the variance in unproctored test takers is greater than proctored test scores indicating test takers in unproctored settings may be at a disadvantage due to lack of control of the testing environment (Russell, 2007).
- **Invest in well-designed hiring system.** Using untested hiring technologies can be costly and ineffective if not properly aligned to the company's strategy. For example, one company made an expensive mistake in using an elaborate Internet system created to accept resumes which are typically not submitted by hourly applicants (their actual target group) and when hourly applicants (who tend to have less Internet experience) tried to submit resumes, the system would charge them for uploads (Russell, 2007).
- Internet recruiting can lead to more diversity than personal referrals which just encourage current diversity of organization. To ensure accessibility, HR can provide onsite computers dedicated to hiring, partner with community organizations that have connections with minority groups, and provide alternatives to apply (paper-pencil option) (Russell, 2007).
 - Researchers caution, however, that Internet recruitment and staffing can be costly due to expertise needed to manage system and software requirements (Russell, 2007).
 - To reduce large numbers of unqualified applicants, agencies should include job-relevant prescreens and work experience pre-employment assessments. A short questionnaire that highlights job requirements (e.g., willingness to submit background check) and outlines essential job functions eliminates 10-25% of unqualified applicants (Russell, 2007).
 - For initial screening decisions among mid and higher-level positions, HR managers reported using manual screening of applicants' materials, telephone screening and face-to-face screening interviews whereas for lower-level positions, HR managers primarily use traditional manual screening and face-to-face interviews (TRB, 2008)
 - Since resumes can be time consuming and often the most subjective part of the recruitment process, it is better to use objective prescreens that are validated instead of a subjective resume review process when possible (Russell, 2007).
 - One effective way to use the resume is to make it part of a structured interview and validate it as job relevant (Russell, 2007).
 - To minimize excessive costs, stakeholders should outline the organization's current hiring processes in detail, seek to understand what is not working well with the current process, and gather data about future user populations prior to issuing a request for proposals for new technology (Russell, 2007).

- For initial screening, research predicts a continued increase in computer-based keyword searches for resumes, computer-based scoring of standardized applications, tests (such as cognitive ability) and videoconferencing.
- **Design valid competency models for management positions.** To predict job performance, companies often use behavioral competencies. These competencies are developed through behavioral event interviews that include a discussion of critical incidents and decision-making processes employed by managers (Dainty, Cheng, Moore, 2005).
 - Team leadership and self-control were the two competencies which best predicted potential for superior performance of managers (Dainty, Cheng, Moore, 2005).

2.3 Restructuring of benefits and policies: Well-designed benefit packages and organizational policies play a vital role in employee recruitment and retention. To best restructure benefits and agency policies, decision makers should:

- **Create competitive compensation systems.** Recent research indicates that improving compensation practices such as the structure and timing of wages can increase employee retention (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Wage structures may include a wage progression that is tied to longevity and includes a step progression linked to employee milestones. This concept creates an incentive for employees to stay since their financial situation can improve over time (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Transportation systems should, where possible, adopt a grade and salary structure. This includes a grade structure, salary ranges for each grade, and a system for advancing employees through the salary range based on their increased value to the organization (Peterson, 2007).
- **Develop employee wellness programs.** Another retention strategy successfully used by organizations is the provision of wellness programs for employees.
 - Wellness programs are thought to work because: healthy employees are more productive and satisfied with their jobs, and the employer is able to save money through reduced medical, absenteeism, and turnover costs (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- **Create and inform applicants/employees of organizational benefits.** Research recommends creative benefit packages along with the development of materials that describes benefits to encourage applicant attraction and employee retention (TRB, 2002).
 - Step progression of accruing benefits such as insurance and leave over time also creates incentive to stay with the transit agency (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Highlighting benefits, flexible scheduling, and working with needy populations can motivate potential applicants to apply for positions (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).

- Participation in personal development which includes wellness and resource access (of self-development resources) can result in the accumulation of points, which result in eligibility for gift certificates to local merchants or savings bonds (TRB, 2002).

2.4 Job classification and job design: Valid job descriptions and sound job designs serve as a central component of many HR functions, including recruitment, retention, training, and development activities. To improve in this area, agencies should:

- **Develop accurate job descriptions.** Job descriptions should be comprehensive and list the requirements of the job.
 - Elements of the job description should include a job title, a brief job summary which includes primary job functions and general purpose of the job, essential job duties/tasks and responsibilities, required education and experience (i.e., job standards/specifications), knowledges, skills and abilities needed to perform job, equipment use required (e.g., computers, copiers, fax), and any additional job essential requirements (e.g., legally justifiable physical requirements). Special emphasis should be placed in the job description on the safety and security related responsibilities of the job, and on the need for the incumbent to perform in crisis or emergency situations.
 - Sound job descriptions can increase retention by encouraging the person with the right 'fit' to apply for the job, thus enabling recruiters to select that person (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
 - Job descriptions should be kept up to date by conducting a periodic job analysis of each job or job type (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- **Develop and maintain employee career paths.** Results of a recent study indicate that career paths improve job satisfaction, employee motivations, and employee commitment (Griffin, Kalnbach, Lantz, and Rodriguez, 2000).
 - One way to train managers for senior positions—particularly when they will be asked to address nontraditional issues in their roles—is to promote a wider range of job movement and experience (TRB, 2001).
 - Transit systems should consider making in-house recruiting a priority to promote from within and ensure that growth opportunities are available to employees (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Special or temporary assignments are one way to create opportunities for individuals to increase their level of responsibility and involvement. Special assignments can also be used as a way to reward an employee's excellent work (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - For instance, a recent study of transportation employees reveals that 60.0 percent would be less likely to quit their job with the addition of a career path (Griffin, Kalnbach, Lantz, and Rodriguez, 2000).

- Many transit professionals grow from the ranks and transit is unique in that growth opportunities are limited only by one's interest in them. However, should the potential for advancement not exist or not be made available, employees may not stay long or may become discouraged. Likewise, employees who are overlooked for a promotion in favor of an external candidate may also become discouraged (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Research does note that internal career paths should be fair with only qualified applicants considered, and in-house applicants should not expect or receive special considerations (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Managers who had been promoted are less likely to resign than non-promoted managers, but only if the promotion has occurred in the past 11 months (Lyness and Judiesch, 2001).
 - Promoted women managers are less likely to resign than promoted male managers (Lyness and Judiesch, 2001).
 - Findings suggest that organizational factors (e.g., career development opportunities) may take precedence over individual factors (e.g., turnover intentions, career goals, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction) in turnover decisions (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
- **Emphasize job enrichment.** Research has shown that job enrichment (i.e., redesigning the job to involve greater responsibility, meaningfulness, or autonomy) reduces turnover (McEvoy and Cascio, 1985).
- Research suggests that employees react positively to job enrichment (i.e., redesigning the job to involve greater responsibility, meaningfulness, or autonomy) (Griffin, Kalnbach, Lantz, and Rodriguez, 2000).

2.5 Retaining staff: Though there is no guaranteed way to keep employees from leaving, there are many practices that encourage employees to stay and develop loyalty to their agency including compensation, promotion opportunities, recognition, development, employee ownership, and the work environment (KFH Group, Inc., 2008). To bolster retention, organizations should:

- **Improve organizational commitment.** Research suggests that employers should focus on maintaining and enhancing work commitment of employees because their level of commitment affects their turnover intentions and actual turnover rates (Cooper-Hakim and Viswesvaran, 2005).
 - For example, analysis of nearly 1,000 retention studies found that when employees are strongly committed to an organization solely because leaving the organization would result in their not receiving needed money or benefits, they have lower turnover intentions (Cooper-Hakim and Viswesvaran, 2005).
 - Results from analyses of 21 turnover studies indicate that receiving promotions is related to less employee turnover (Carson, Carson, Griffeth, and Steel, 1994)
- **Focus on retention early.** Research has found a curvilinear relationship between company tenure and turnover such that turnover rates are high in employees' first year,

higher in years two and three, and turnover rates steadily decrease the longer an employee stays at an organization (Hom, Roberson, and Ellis, 2008).

- Community transportation systems without a formal new employee orientation program should consider implementing one, especially those agencies that experience high turnover (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
 - Orientation programs provide employees with information about benefits, job requirement and expectations, organizational policies, working conditions, and safety, and can help employees learn the ropes of the organization sooner and develop a sense of belonging (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- **Provide meaningful performance feedback.** Administrative and developmental performance reviews are an important component of employee retention as they help the employee determine his/her standing in the organization in terms of performance, compensation, development and promotion.
- The employee review process should take place at least annually, and the direct supervisor of each employee should conduct the reviews (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Performance reviews can also take place more frequently in the case of problem employees, probationary employees, and newly assigned employees (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Although performance reviews are typically conducted solely by an employee's supervisor, other approaches include opportunities for employee self-ratings and ratings from peers (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Performance areas reviewed should be clearly defined and relate to the job description (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Once the review has been completed, it should be presented to and discussed with the employee. This is a good opportunity to develop action plans for employee progression, improvement in weak areas, and directions for continued success (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
- **Recognize high performers in the organization.** Outwardly recognizing employees who perform at a high level can increase employee retention (KFH Group, Inc., 2008); thus, the structure of these programs should be carefully considered.
- Many transit agencies use programs that recognize and reward employees for longevity either in the form of wage scales, bonuses, or priority in selecting work or vacation schedules, choosing assignments, and choosing days off (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Goals for these types of awards must be realistic and accomplishable, the process for determining success must be fair and valid, rewards should be made in a timely manner, and the recognition should be public (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - Programs that reward employees for exemplary service are already implemented by many transit systems. These programs include Employee of the Month/Year, Safe Driver awards, and Customer Service awards (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).

- When high performers are not rewarded, or are not sufficiently rewarded, they tend to leave organizations (Griffeth, Hom, and Gaertner, 2000).
 - Research has shown that individually-based merit reward systems are important for retaining high performers while collective reward programs (i.e., team incentives) appear to stimulate greater exits among high performers (Griffeth, Hom, and Gaertner, 2000).
 - Programs vary and can include employee of the month programs, extra time off, or special items provided to high-performing individuals or teams (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- **Build a culture of employee ownership.** Developing trust and loyalty is essential to retaining good employees. Being involved in the management, direction, and success of the transit system builds a sense of ownership and pride among employees (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
- Organizational involvement improves everyone’s understanding of the organization, and often helps new programs succeed as employees develop a sense of responsibility (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
 - For smaller agencies, a simple approach is to establish groups of employees around topics or concerns such as a Safety Committee or Employee Recognition Committee (KFH Group, Inc., 2008).
- **Remove obstacles to employee growth.** Research indicates that removing barriers and distractions is an essential component of employee retention.
- For example, a recent study found that when employees have ‘hindrance stressors’ (i.e., job demands that employees view as obstacles to personal growth and work-related accomplishment) in their job, they are more likely to intend to leave an organization and have higher actual turnover rates (Podsakoff, LePine, and LePine, 2007).
 - Conversely, when employees have ‘challenge stressors’ (i.e., job demands that employees view as creating opportunity for personal development and achievement) in their job, they are less likely to have turnover intentions and they have lower actual turnover rates (Podsakoff, LePine, and LePine, 2007).
 - Building gender diversity within an organization can be difficult. Research indicates that females in professional and managerial positions quit their jobs at a 36.3 percent higher rate than did their male counterparts (Hom, Roberson, and Ellis, 2008). Additionally, men more readily leave their jobs when female concentration in jobs is high regardless of the job level, though women’s turnover rates did not fall when more women enter an occupation, regardless of the job level.
 - Many transit organizations single out improved training itself as key to workforce recruitment and—especially—retention (TRB, 2003).
- **Address areas of concern and promote areas of employee satisfaction.** Agencies should attempt to alleviate organizational issues that lower job satisfaction among managers and promote areas that are related to high job satisfaction to reduce turnover

- The Institute for Transportation Research and Education at NC State conducted a survey of retention of managers and directors at community transit agencies and found that among most of the managers who were highly satisfied, the reasons they like their jobs were: 1) Working with good people; 2) Having a diversity of activities; 3) Helping their community; 4) Seeing coworkers and staff do well as a team; and 5) Conducting planning activities (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
- Former directors who reported lower satisfaction indicated these reasons: 1) Excessive government bureaucracy and paperwork; 2) Relatively low salaries and benefits for themselves and their staff; 3) High stress due to deadlines and high work volume; 4) Lack of career advancement opportunities; and 5) Insufficient support from larger state DOT (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).

2.6 Succession planning: Succession planning is the process of identifying and preparing qualified employees through mentoring, training and job rotation opportunities to replace staff in key management positions. To bolster succession planning efforts, agencies should:

- **Align succession planning strategies with organizational goals.** Successful succession planning programs obtain alignment with interrelated organizational goals.
 - For example, succession planning efforts must obtain alignment between business strategy and diversity goals in order to ensure woman and minorities receive leadership opportunities.
 - Likewise, organizations should include diversity goals in performance evaluations of executives and managers if promoting woman and minorities is a priority (Greer and Virick, 2008).
- **Communicate essential elements of success plan to create buy-in.** In all succession planning efforts, it is critical to communicate the strategy and goals of the program (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - Organizations must establish a values basis for diverse succession planning efforts (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - Organizations must obtain commitment of top executives to personally mentor diverse successors (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - Succession planning initiatives should identify behavioral competencies for the future while recognizing that these may change (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - Succession planning methods should inform high potentials of their inclusion in succession plans and obtain their inputs (Greer and Virick, 2008).
- **Create a competency based succession plan.** Succession planning methods should include the development of behavioral competencies for training, development planning, and evaluations (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - Research suggests that succession planning efforts should also include the dissemination of specific behavioral competencies required for top positions so potential applicants can hone skills (Greer and Virick, 2008).
 - All succession planning programs should be framed as programs with emphasis on developing “high potentials” (Greer and Virick, 2008). For

example, the Washington Metropolitan Area Transit Authority (WMATA) has an explicit “Leadership Succession Planning Program” that targets ten key positions. Potential candidates for these positions are rigorously screened to become eligible for training, special projects, and rotational work assignments (TRB, 2001).

- Methods should also include valid objective testing where feasible to offset unconscious bias in assessment (Greer and Virick, 2008).
- Objective indicators of performance, competence, and potential are all important components of a sound competency-based succession plan (Greer and Virick, 2008).

2.7 Educating, training and developing staff: Formal internal and external management training and development (e.g., classroom instruction) and informal on-the-job development and training including coaching, mentoring, job assignments, job rotations, stretch assignments and performance appraisal. To improve manager training and transit organizations, agencies should:

- **Emphasize professional development for managers at all levels.** Professional development is an essential element of manager development and it can take on many forms.
 - Research suggests that successful private sector and federal agencies spend about 2 percent of salaries on training. This is four times more than the average transportation agency (TRB, 2003).
 - Formally recognizing the importance of training within an agency is critical to training success. For example, the Louisiana Department of Transportation and Development created a policy in 2001 that asserts training is key to developing qualified personnel and is crucial to the effective management of the transportation system (Paul, 2008).
 - In many organizations, new supervisor training is a requirement within the first months of a first-line management role. New supervisor training can include topics such as employment law, coaching, interpersonal skills, performance management, equal employment opportunity, diversity, change management, drug and alcohol programs, and policies and procedures (TRB, 2008).
 - Research suggests that the most frequent professional development activities for paratransit managers include training programs related to the development of interpersonal communication skills, presentation skills, team building, and supervisory/management and/or leadership skills (TRB, 2003).
 - A recent survey of paratransit managers found dealing with the media, computerized scheduling, safe driving practices, labor relations, working with boards, written communications, ethics, customer relations and affirmative action skills are also viewed as very important (TRB, 2002).
 - Transit agencies that desire to have quality managers must begin to view training as a business strategy and to focus more on interventions for 1) Connecting employee learning to business goals, 2) Improving employee

- performance, and 3) Helping trainers acquire new skills and capabilities needed to fulfill this changing role (TRB, 2008).
- In addition to skill training, transit leaders participate in the following development activities: the development and implementation of a new mission, creation of vision and values statement, top-level executive management reorganizations, national and regional leadership events, as well as executive retreats to revisit strategic plans and goals (TRB, 2003).
 - The Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) develops staff from within the organization. For example, a bus operator who is ready to move into supervision must participate in an internal 6-week training course—the Route Supervisor Program—before assuming the new responsibilities (TRB, 2008).
- **Utilize external educators, learning resources and associations.** External training agencies are already organized to provide training to large audiences and have the experience and expertise to deliver the curricula and training materials required to meet agency skill needs. Partnering with existing agencies leads to more efficient and effective training programs (TRB, 2003).
- As an example of partnership between transportation organizations and existing education entities, LTRC combines the resources of Louisiana's state university and Louisiana's DOT to provide training opportunities to transit organizations across the state (Paul, 2008).
 - The Central Ohio Transit Authority (COTA) sends leaders to outside organizations for training and development. For example, the American Public Transit Exams Institute administers tests and certifies COTA managers as being capable in the essential functions in supervisory and managerial roles (TRB, 2003).
 - To aid succession planning, the Volusia County Transportation Authority (VOTRAN) offers mentoring opportunities to develop management and leadership skills for its lower level technical staff to make sure they will be prepared for management positions when they become available (TRB, 2003).
 - The Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA), through a cooperative arrangement with a local community college, provides employees the opportunity to take college courses at VTA facilities that prepare them for upward mobility in a compressed timeframe (TRB, 2003).
 - The Port Authority of Allegheny County, Pennsylvania started a Deferred Retirement Option Plan for non-represented employees in 2001. The plan is the catalyst for the current development of the succession planning strategy. Under this plan, employees have a one-year window for eligibility and a five-year maximum of participation in the plan. Through the option plan, the agency will be able to do succession planning for a number of leadership positions for which incumbents are or soon will become eligible for retirement (TRB, 2003).
 - The Quebec Transit Authority held a competition with local colleges and universities to determine who should partner with the agency to develop and deliver their training. The winning university was chosen based on its experience in delivering business management programs and for its concern

with the transfer of skills from the academic setting to the workplace (TRB, 2008). Through this partnership, Quebec addresses the following five topics in its management training: 1) Labor relations; 2) Day-to-day management; 3) Defining the role of the front-line manager; 4) Communications skills; and 5) Change management (TRB, 2008).

- At the San Francisco Municipal Railway (Muni), career development and learning center activities for managers, in addition to the development and implementation of the new mission, vision, and values statement, receive intense attention (TRB, 2003).
- Working with a local community college, the San Francisco Municipal Railway (Muni) has designed a manager and supervisor training curriculum that focuses on their responsibilities for HR management. Using in-house staff, the agency teaches managers communication and facilitation skills that help them implement the mission and values statement approved by Muni leaders (TRB, 2003).
- Many Canadian and French transit agencies have partnerships in place with local colleges, universities, and high schools. These efforts are designed to promote development but also support recruitment and retention of skilled managers (TRB, 2008).
- During the mid-1980s, the Canadian Urban Transit Association (CUTA) acknowledged the need for offering leadership skills to transit inspectors (i.e., supervisors), and the Association staff began to develop management training for members agencies (TRB, 2008).
-
- **Offer tuition reimbursement.** Management and supervisory training can be provided by a combination of internal and external resources. Some agencies offer tuition-reimbursement programs that allow employees to take courses for enrichment or for college-degree programs and/or an in-house management training program (TRB, 2008).
 - The Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA) provides a tuition reimbursement program to employees who want to move into supervisory and management positions.
- **Work with labor unions to create mutually agreeable training programs.** Training is also one of the areas of particular interest to transit unions. Labor is especially interested in ensuring that training is provided imaginatively and regularly to existing workers as well as new recruits (TRB, 2003).
 - Transit agencies have begun to move away from seniority based union contracts to agreements that include growth, continued learning, and rewards for developing new skills, leading to advancement based on skills attainment. These contracts underscore the importance of effective training (TRB, 2003).
- **Offer creative training opportunities to managers to build competency.** Research suggests there are many innovative methods to develop competency among managers.
 - Some transportation organizations are partnering with the private sector to train their managers. For example, Metro Transit (in King County,

Washington) has sent its management staff to area-wide leadership training with Boeing, Nordstrom, and Microsoft. In addition, this organization has brought in Nordstrom managers as examples of progressive management for presentations. For instance, their annual management retreat frequently features presenters who challenge the status quo (e.g., managers from Pike Place Market and Nordstrom) (TRB, 2001).

- Research suggests that successful organizations use a range of techniques for training to keep training fresh, engaging, and to meet the needs of different learning styles (e.g., job rotation, on-the-job training, on-the-job coaching, special projects and assignments, self-directed learning (often technology-based), mentor relationships, and electronic learning technologies) (TRB, 2003).
 - Houston's Metro uses its overall strategic plan to set its training budget. It sets competency levels, then determines training budget by department on the basis of needed competency levels (TRB, 2001).
 - Southeastern Pennsylvania Transportation Authority (SEPTA) has held "customer expectations" trainings to improve employee attitudes and make staff more customer-focused (TRB, 2001).
 - Advancing technology offers an opportunity to increase the efficiency and effectiveness of training while also better engaging trainees. Using multiple technologies can help to engage more managers. For example, onsite instruction, videoconferencing, live web-based seminars, and stored web-based content can help to reach a broader audience (Paul, 2008).
 - Central training and development centers have been shown to increase the effective and efficient use of training dollars. For example, the Louisiana Transportation Research Center (LTRC) conducts short- and long-term research and provides technical assistance, training, continuing education, technology transfer, and problem solving services to the Louisiana Department of Transportation and Development (DOTD) and to the transportation community at large (Paul, 2008).
- **Emphasize follower development in manager training.** Research results indicate that leaders who receive transformational leadership training have a more positive impact on direct follower development and on indirect follower performance than leaders who receive traditional transactional training, which improves overall organizational effectiveness (Dvir, Eden, Avolio, Shamir, 2002).
 - While both styles can be effective, the leadership literature (Bass & Avolio, 1990) differentiates between transactional and transformational leaders.
 - Transactional leaders exert influence by setting goals, clarifying desired outcomes, providing feedback, and exchanging rewards for accomplishments (Dvir, Eden, Avolio, Shamir, 2002).
 - Transformational leaders exert additional influence beyond transactional leaders by assessing and expanding subordinate goals while at the same time, providing them with confidence to perform beyond the expectations (Dvir, Eden, Avolio, Shamir, 2002).

- Research states that manager development training is one resource for helping managers develop the skills they need to make their subordinates feel they are getting the support they need to perform their jobs well. This also promotes retention at all levels of the organization (TRB, 2008).
- **Provide meaningful performance feedback.** Performance feedback is useful in developing managers in several ways: 1) Allows agencies to assess individual as well as overall performance of staff; 2) Development feedback can be used for self-improvement efforts, 3) Allows the agency to target training efforts.
 - In order to conduct formal performance evaluation that will inform development, agencies must identify the specific success factors against which manager performance will be measured (TRB, 2001).
 - Manager development success factors should be developed and reinforced through performance appraisals from mid-level to senior managers in order to identify required professional development training and to ensure seamless promotions (TRB, 2001).
 - Training and development methods should be closely aligned and integrated with agency recruitment and retention strategies (TRB, 2001).
- **Create mentorship programs to develop young leaders.** Research suggests that mentoring programs are a highly effective and a low cost method for training and developing employees entering a new position (TRB, 2001).
 - Research recommends creating community mentorship programs for small agencies where agencies can help each other out by having more seasoned employees (i.e., directors) mentor new employees across agencies (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).
 - Research also recommends that small community transportation organizations should create listservs and online sharing capabilities so community transit agencies can share lessons learned on human resources (Cook and Lawrie, 2004).

2.8 Developing knowledge management systems: Capturing critical institutional data; strategies to address need for new knowledges to respond to emerging innovations

- **Create people-focused knowledge management systems.** During the past decade, the focus of knowledge management (KM) initiatives has shifted from a strategy of capturing data and explicit information in portals and databases to a strategy of promoting knowledge sharing among people (Cross, Parker, Prusak, & Borgatti, 2001; Davenport & Prusak, 1998; Parise, 2007).
 - KM initiatives should include strategic, process, and people components to achieve successful outcomes (Davenport, DeLong, & Beers, 1998). Examples of these components include top-manager support, changes in motivational practices, and recognition that knowledge is transferred through multiple channels including face-to-face interactions (Parise, 2007).

- Communities of practice (Cohen & Prusak, 2001; Wenger, 1998) is evidence of a shift to a more people-focused strategy, and it has become an increasingly popular KM initiative that emphasizes the connections among people with a common passion and interest area (Parise, 2007).
- The main advantage of a people-focused strategy is that it enables the sharing of more relevant inferred knowledge (Polanyi, 1983), such as employees' experiences, know-how, and other similar or complementary expertise that cannot be captured in documents (Parise, 2007).

References

- Amundson, N. (2007). The influence of workplace attraction on recruitment and retention. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 44(4), 154-162.
- Breaugh, J. A. (2008). Employee recruitment: Current knowledge and important areas for future research. *Human Resource Management Review*, 18(3), 103-118.
- Carson, P. P., Carson, K. D., Griffeth, R. W., & Steel, R. P. (1994). Promotion and employee turnover: Critique, meta-analysis, and implications. *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 8, 455-466.
- Chapman, D. S., Uggerslev, K. L., Carroll, S. A., Piasentin, K. A., & Jones, D. A. (2005). Applicant Attraction to Organizations and Job Choice: A Meta-Analytic Review of the Correlates of Recruiting Outcomes. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 90(5), 928-944.
- Chapman, D. S., & Webster, J. (2003). The use of technologies in the recruiting, screening, and selection processes for job candidates. *International Journal of Selection and Assessment*, 11(2), 113-120.
- Clarke, L., & Herrmann, G. (2007). Skill shortages, recruitment and retention in the house building sector. *Personnel Review*, 36(4), 509-527.
- Cook, T., & Lawrie, J. (2004). Recruitment, Selection, and Retention of Personnel at North Carolina Community Transportation Systems: Findings and Recommendations from a Study. *Transportation Research Record: Journal of the Transportation Research Board*, 1884(-1), 75-82.
- Cooper-Hakim, A., & Viswesvaran, C. (2005). The construct of work commitment: Testing an integrative framework. *Psychological Bulletin*, 131, 241-259.
- Dainty, A. R. J., Cheng, M., & Moore, D. R. (2005). Competency-based Model for Predicting Project Managers' Performance. Retrieved December 5, 2008, from zotero://attachment/12024/.
- Dvir, T., Eden, D., Avolio, B. J., & Shamir, B. (2002). Impact of transformational leadership on follower development and performance: A field experiment. *Academy of Management Journal*, 45(4), 735-744. doi: 10.2307/3069307.
- Greer, C. R., & Virick, M. (2008). Diverse succession planning: Lessons from the industry leaders. *Human Resource Management*, 47(2), 351-367. doi: 10.1002/hrm.20216.
- Griffeth, R. W., Hom, P. W., & Gaertner, S. (2000). A Meta-Analysis of Antecedents and Correlates of Employee Turnover: Update, Moderator Tests, and Research Implications for the Next Millennium. *Journal of Management*, 26, 463-488.
- Griffin, G., Kalnbach, L., Lantz, B., & Rodriguez, J. (2000). Driver retention strategy: The role of a career path. Upper Great Plains Institute, North Dakota State University.

- Hom, P. W., Roberson, L., & Ellis, A. D. (2008). Challenging conventional wisdom about who quits: Revelations from corporate America. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 93, 1-34.
- Johnson, A., Winter, P. A., Reio, T. G. J., Thompson, H. L., & Petrosko, J. M. (2008). Managerial recruitment: The influence of personality and ideal candidate characteristics. *Journal of Management Development*, 27(6), 631-648.
- KFH Group, Inc. (2008). Employee compensation guidelines for Transit Providers in rural and small urban areas. Transportation Research Board, Transit Cooperative Research Program.
- Lavigna, R. J. (1996). Innovation in recruiting and hiring: Attracting the best and brightest to Wisconsin state government. *Public Personnel Management*, 25(4), 423-437.
- Lyness, K. S., & Judiesch, M. K. (2001). Are female managers quitters? The relationships of gender, promotions, and family leaves of absence to voluntary turnover. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86(6), 1167-1178.
- Mass, N. J. (1978). Managerial recruitment and attrition: A policy analysis model. *Behavioral Science*, 23(1), 49-60. doi: 10.1002/bs.3830230108.
- McEvoy, G. M., & Cascio, W. F. (1985). Strategies for reducing employee turnover: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 70, 342-353.
- Parise, S. (2007). Knowledge management and human resource development: An application in social network analysis methods. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 9(3), 359-383. doi: 10.1177/1523422307304106.
- Paul, H. R. (. (2008, August). The Louisiana Model for Transportation Workforce Development. Integrating Technical Assistance, Structured Training, Continuing Education, and Technology Transfer. *TR News*, (257), 1-7.
- Peterson, S. L. (2007). Managerial turnover in US retail organizations. *Journal of Management Development*, 26(7/8), 770-789.
- Podsakoff, N. P., LePine, J. A., & LePine, M. A. (2007). Differential challenge stressor-hindrance relationships with job attitudes, turnover intentions, turnover, and withdrawal behavior: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 92, 438-454.
- Reinach, Stephen, Viale, Alex. (2007). An Examination of Employee Recruitment and Retention in the U.S. Railroad Industry. Retrieved November 25, 2008, from <http://www.fra.dot.gov/downloads/Recruitment%20and%20Retention%20Final%20Report%20August%202007.pdf>.
- Russell, D. P. (2007). Recruiting and staffing in the electronic age: A research-based perspective. *Consulting Psychology Journal: Practice and Research*, 59(2), 91-101.

Tett, R. P., & Meyer, J. P. (1993). Job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and turnover: Path analyses based on meta-analytic findings. *Personnel Psychology*, 46, 259-293.

TRB. (2007). Paratransit Manager's Skills, Qualifications, and Needs. Synthesis, Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Synthesis Report #71.

TRB. (2002). Managing Transit's Workforce in the New Millennium. Synthesis, Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Report #77.

TRB (2004). Public Transportation Operating Agencies as Employers of Choice, Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Report #103.

TRB. (2001). A Challenged Employment System: Hiring, Training, Performance Evaluation, and Retention of Bus Operators. TCRP Synthesis #40.

TRB. (2002). Identification of the Critical Workforce Development Issues in the Transit Industry. Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Research Results Digest #45.

TRB. (2003). The Workforce Challenge: Recruiting, Training, And Retaining Qualified Workers For Transportation And Transit Agencies. TRB Special Report #275.

TRB. (2003). Corporate Culture as the Driver Of Transit Leadership Practices. Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Synthesis #47.

TRB. (2007). Employee Compensation Guidelines for Transit Providers in Rural and Small Urban Areas. Transit Cooperative Research Program. TCRP Report #127.

TRB. (2008). Innovative Practices In Transit Workforce Development. International Transit Studies Program. Research Results Digest 88.

White, C., & Edner, S. (1987). Manager Retention and Job Change in the Transit Industry: A Survey of Manager Attitudes. Transportation Research Board.

White, C. R., Edner, S. M., & Ketcheson, K. (1986). Transit Agency Characteristics: An Industry Profile. Retrieved November 24, 2008, from <http://ntlsearch.bts.gov/tris/record/tris/00486518.html>.

Appendix B

Members of Each Job Title Cluster

Commonly Used Transit Position Titles Related to Job Description Guides

CEO/Executive Director/General Manager

- Chief Executive Officer
- Executive Director
- General Manager
- Transit Director
- Transit Manager
- Transportation Director

Director/Manager- Administration-Finance

- Chief Financial Officer
- Assistant General Manager-Administration and Finance
- Assistant General Manager-Administration
- Assistant General Manager-Finance
- Assistant Executive Director-Administration and Finance
- Assistant Executive Director-Administration
- Assistant Executive Director-Finance
- Director-Administration and Finance
- Director-Administration
- Director-Finance
- Manager-Administration

Director/Manager- Human Resources

- Assistant General Manager-Human Resources
- Assistant Executive Director-Human Resources
- Director-Human Resources
- Manager-Human Resources
- Director-Personnel

Director/Manager- Marketing/Public Relations

- Director-Marketing and Public Relations
- Director-Marketing
- Director-Public and Community Relations
- Manager-Marketing and Public Relations
- Manager-Marketing
- Manager-Public and Community Relations

Director/Manager- Operations/Transportation and Maintenance

- Chief Operating Officer
- Assistant General Manager-Operations
- Assistant Executive Director-Operations
- Assistant General Manager-Transportation and Maintenance
- Assistant Executive Director-Transportation and Maintenance
- Director-Operations
- Superintendent-Operations
- Director-Transportation and Maintenance
- Superintendent-Transportation and Maintenance
- Manager-Operations

Director/Manager- Planning/Transit Development

- Assistant General Manager-Planning and Transit Development
- Assistant General Manager-Planning
- Assistant General Manager-Transit Development
- Assistant General Manager-Business Development
- Assistant Executive Director-Planning and Transit Development
- Assistant Executive Director-Planning
- Assistant Executive Director-Transit Development
- Assistant Executive Director-Business Development
- Director-Planning and Transit Development
- Director-Planning
- Director-Transit Development
- Director-Business Development
- Manager-Planning and Transit Development
- Manager-Transit Development
- Manager-Business Development

Director/Manager- Information Technology

- Director-Information Technology
- Director-Information Systems
- Director-Information Management
- Manager-Information Technology
- Manager-Information Systems
- Manager-Information Management

Manager/Supervisor- Accounting/Payroll

- Manager-Accounting and Payroll
- Manager-Accounting
- Manager-Payroll
- Supervisor-Accounting and Payroll
- Supervisor-Accounting
- Supervisor-Payroll

Manager/Supervisor- Compliance

- Manager-Compliance
- Manager-Audit
- Manager-Compliance and Audit
- Supervisor-Compliance
- Supervisor-Audit
- Supervisor-Compliance and Audit

Manager/Supervisor- Customer Service

- Director-Customer Service
- Director-Customer Relations
- Manager-Customer Service
- Supervisor-Customer Service
- Manager-Customer Relations
- Supervisor-Customer Relations

Manager/Supervisor- Dispatching and Scheduling

- Manager-Dispatching and Scheduling
- Manager-Dispatch
- Manager-Scheduling
- Supervisor-Dispatching and Scheduling
- Supervisor-Dispatch
- Supervisor-Scheduling
- Manager-Operations Control Center
- Supervisor-Operations Control Center

Manager/Supervisor- Engineering and Capital Programs

- Director-Engineering and Capital Programs
- Director-Engineering
- Director-Capital Programs
- Manager-Engineering and Capital Programs
- Manager-Engineering
- Manager-Capital Programs
- Manager-Grants and Capital Projects
- Director-Design and Construction
- Manager-Design and Construction

Manager/Supervisor- Finance/Budget

- Manager-Finance and Budget
- Manager-Finance
- Manager-Budget
- Supervisor-Finance and Budget
- Supervisor-Finance

- Supervisor-Budget

Manager/Supervisor- Grants/Contract

- Director-Grants and Contract Administration
- Manager-Grants and Contract Administration
- Manager-Grants
- Manager-Contract Administration

Manager/Supervisor- Legislative Affairs

- Director-Public and Legislative Affairs
- Director-Legislative Affairs
- Manager-Public and Legislative Affairs
- Manager-Legislative Affairs

Manager/Supervisor- Marketing

- Manager-Marketing
- Manager-Marketing and Communications
- Manager-Marketing and Community Relations
- Supervisor-Marketing
- Supervisor-Marketing and Communications
- Supervisor-Marketing and Community Relations

Manager/Supervisor- Media and Community Relations

- Manager-Media Affairs
- Manager-Media Relations
- Manager-Media and Community Relations
- Supervisor-Media Affairs
- Supervisor-Media Relations
- Supervisor-Media and Community Relations

Manager/Supervisor- Mobility Management

- Mobility Manager
- Transportation Mobility Manager
- Transportation Resources Manager
- Transportation Resources Coordinator
- Supervisor-Mobility Management

Manager/Supervisor- Paratransit Services

- Director-Paratransit Services
- Manager-Paratransit Services
- Supervisor-Paratransit Services
- Director-Accessible Services
- Manager-Accessible Services
- Supervisor-Accessible Services
- Manager-ADA Services
- Supervisor-ADA Services

Manager/Supervisor- Personnel

- Manager-Personnel
- Supervisor-Personnel

Manager/Supervisor- Planning

- Manager-Planning
- Supervisor-Planning
- Transportation Planner

Manager/Supervisor- Procurement

- Director-Procurement
- Manager-Procurement
- Supervisor-Procurement

Manager/Supervisor- Risk Management

- Director-Risk Management
- Manager-Risk Management
- Supervisor-Risk Management

Manager/Supervisor- Service Design and Schedules

- Director-Service Design and Schedules
- Director-Service Design
- Manager-Service Design and Schedules
- Manager-Service Design
- Manager-Scheduling
- Supervisor-Service Design and Schedules
- Supervisor-Service Design
- Supervisor-Scheduling

Manager/Supervisor- Special Projects

- Director-Special Projects and Services
- Director-Special Projects
- Manager-Special Projects and Services
- Manager-Special Projects
- Supervisor-Special Projects and Services
- Supervisor-Special Projects

Manager/Supervisor- Training, Safety and Security

- Director-Training, Safety and Security
- Director-Training and Development
- Director-Training
- Director-Employee Development
- Director-Safety and Security
- Director-Safety
- Director-Security
- Training Administrator
- Training and Development Administrator
- Manager-Training, Safety and Security
- Manager-Training and Development
- Manager-Training
- Manager-Employee Development
- Manager-Safety and Security
- Manager-Safety
- Manager-Security
- Supervisor-Training, Safety and Security
- Supervisor-Training and Development
- Supervisor-Training
- Supervisor-Employee Development
- Supervisor-Safety and Security
- Supervisor-Safety
- Supervisor-Security
- Training, Safety and Security Officer
- Training Officer
- Safety and Security Officer
- Safety Officer
- Security Officer
- Manager-Safety and Loss Control
- Supervisor-Safety and Loss Control
- Supervisor-Transportation Training
- Supervisor-Maintenance Training

Manager/Supervisor- Vehicle Maintenance

- Chief Maintenance Officer
- Director-Maintenance
- Director-Vehicle Maintenance
- Director-Fleet Maintenance
- Superintendent-Maintenance
- Superintendent-Vehicle Maintenance
- Superintendent-Fleet Maintenance
- Manager-Maintenance
- Manager-Vehicle Maintenance
- Manager-Fleet Maintenance
- Supervisor-Maintenance
- Supervisor-Vehicle Maintenance
- Supervisor-Fleet Maintenance
- Foreman-Maintenance
- Foreman-Vehicle Maintenance
- Foreman-Fleet Maintenance
- Supervisor-Parts and Supplies

Manager/Supervisor- Facility Management and Maintenance

- Director-Facility Management
- Director-Facility Management and Maintenance
- Director-Facility Maintenance
- Manager-Facility Management
- Manager-Facility Management and Maintenance
- Manager-Facility Maintenance
- Supervisor-Facility Maintenance
- Supervisor-Facility Management
- Supervisor-Facility Management and Maintenance
- Foreman-Facility Maintenance

Manager/Supervisor- Compensation and Benefits

- Director-Compensation and Benefits
- Administrator-Compensation and Benefits
- Manager-Compensation and Benefits
- Manager-Compensation
- Manager-Benefits
- Supervisor-Compensation and Benefits
- Supervisor-Compensation
- Supervisor-Benefits

Manager/Supervisor- Employee and Labor Relations

- Labor Relations Officer
- Director-Employee and Labor Relations
- Director-Employee Relations
- Director-Labor Relations
- Manager-Employee and Labor Relations
- Manager-Employee Relations
- Manager-Labor Relations
- Supervisor-Employee and Labor Relations
- Supervisor-Employee Relations
- Supervisor-Labor Relations

Manager/Supervisor- Civil Rights

- Civil Rights Officer
- Civil Rights Administrator
- Equal Employment Opportunity Administrator
- Equal Employment Opportunity Officer
- Director-Civil Rights
- Director-Equal Employment Opportunity
- Manager-Civil Rights
- Manager-Equal Employment Opportunity
- Supervisor-Civil Rights
- Supervisor-Equal Employment Opportunity

Manager/Supervisor- Transportation

- Chief Transportation Officer
- Director-Transportation
- Superintendent-Transportation
- Manager-Transportation
- Transportation Coordinator
- Division Superintendent
- Division Manager
- Manager-Transportation Supervision
- Transit Supervisor
- Transportation Supervisor
- Street Supervisor
- Road Supervisor
- Field Supervisor

Appendix C

Method Used to Develop Job Description Guides

Method Used to Develop Job Description Guides

The research team developed the Job Description Guides through a series of steps informed by data from transit agencies, job descriptive information from a national database, job analysis research and practices, and our knowledge of the transit industry. These steps included:

- Developing an initial list of job titles that we expected to use to search for job descriptions. This list included job titles that, based on our experience with transit agencies, covered the gamut of management jobs. Most of this list was included in the amplified work plan. Some of the titles were specifically suggested by TCRP panel members. This list is provided in Exhibit 1.

■ EXHIBIT 1	
■ INITIAL LIST OF MANAGEMENT JOB TITLES FOR TRANSIT AGENCIES	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ General Manager/CEO ○ Transportation/Operations Manager ○ Maintenance Manager ○ Human Resource Manager ○ Financial Manager ○ Administrative Manager ○ Risk Manager/Safety Manager ○ Procurement Manager ○ Planning Manager ○ Marketing Manager ○ Security Manager/Emergency Preparedness Manager ○ Training Manager ○ Public Information Officer/Manager ○ Labor/Employee Relations Officer/Manager 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Contract Services Manager ○ Information Technology Manager ○ Scheduling and Dispatching Manager/Supervisor ○ Transportation/Operations Supervisor ○ Maintenance Foreman ○ Director of Scheduling & Service ○ Director of Accessible Services and Contract Compliance ○ Paratransit Administrator ○ Director of Paratransit Service ○ Regional Manager – Paratransit ○ Special Services Manager ○ Paratransit & Rideshare Director ○ Chief – Paratransit Operations

- Categorizing agencies by number of vehicles in service. The transit agencies listed in National Transit Database were sorted according to number of vehicles in service: small (1-25 vehicles); medium (26-100 vehicles); large (100+ vehicles). The purpose of these categories was to ensure that we obtained position descriptions across agencies of different sizes.
- Searching for three position descriptions (PDs) for each of the titles listed in Exhibit 1 for each of the different sized agencies. To locate the PDs we conducted a comprehensive search of all transit agency websites for position descriptions, conducted exhaustive Internet searches for transit agency management position announcements, searched our internal databases of job descriptions, and used public databases such as O*NET and the Dictionary of Occupational Titles. We also contacted transit agencies, used a job description online search tool, and examined job descriptions reference materials (JobDescriptionManager.com, 2009; Plachy & Plachy, 1998).
- Clustering like PDs. The PDs were sorted so that like positions were clustered together. Together, these clusters cover all management positions in public and private transit agencies. First-line supervisory positions were not included unless the position is the only management position at the agency. The

resulting job titles are listed in Appendix A along with the position titles they represent. Exhibit 2 shows applicability of the titles across types of organizations.

EXHIBIT 2					
APPLICABILITY OF JOB TITLES ACROSS TYPES OF ORGANIZATIONS					
Job Title	Organization Type				
	Small	Medium	Large	General Public Service	ADA Para-transit
1. CEO/Executive Director/General Manager	X	X	X	X	X
2. Director/Manager- Administration-Finance		X	X	X	
3. Director/Manager- Human Resources		X	X	X	
4. Director/Manager- Marketing/Public Relations		X	X	X	
5. Director/Manager- Operations/Transportation and Maintenance	X	X	X	X	X
6. Director/Manager- Planning/Transit Development		X	X	X	
7. Director/Manager- Information Technology		X	X	X	
8. Manager/Supervisor- Accounting/Payroll		X	X	X	
9. Manager/Supervisor- Compliance			X	X	
10. Manager/Supervisor- Customer Service	X	X	X	X	X
11. Manager/Supervisor- Dispatching and Scheduling	X	X	X	X	X
12. Manager/Supervisor- Engineering and Capital Programs			X	X	
13. Manager/Supervisor- Finance/Budget	X	X	X	X	X
14. Manager/Supervisor- Grants/Contract		X	X	X	
15. Manager/Supervisor- Legislative Affairs			X	X	
16. Manager/Supervisor- Marketing	X	X	X	X	
17. Manager/Supervisor- Media and Community Relations			X	X	
18. Manager/Supervisor- Mobility Management		X	X	X	
19. Manager/Supervisor- Paratransit Services		X	X		X
20. Manager/Supervisor- Personnel		X	X	X	X
21. Manager/Supervisor- Planning		X	X	X	
22. Manager/Supervisor- Procurement		X	X	X	
23. Manager/Supervisor- Risk Management		X	X	X	
24. Manager/Supervisor- Service Design and Schedules			X	X	
25. Manager/Supervisor- Special Projects			X	X	
26. Manager/Supervisor- Training, Safety and Security	X	X	X	X	X
27. Manager/Supervisor- Vehicle Maintenance	X	X	X	X	X
28. Manager/Supervisor- Facility Management and Maintenance		X	X	X	
29. Manager/Supervisor- Compensation and Benefits		X	X	X	
30. Manager/Supervisor- Employee and Labor Relations		X	X	X	
31. Manager/Supervisor- Civil Rights			X	X	
32. Manager/Supervisor- Transportation	X	X	X	X	X

- Identifying general duties, knowledges, skills, abilities and work context for each job. We did this by aggregating the information provided by each position description assigned to each job cluster. We validated and supplemented this information with data from the

Department of Labor's *Occupational Information Network (O*NET)* (2009) and the Office of Personnel Management's (2008) *Handbook of Occupational Groups and Families*.

While the 32 Job Description Guides provide an overview of the type of content that should be included in a specific job description, including a comprehensive listing of duties, knowledges, skills, abilities, and other characteristics (KSAOs), we strongly recommend that the job information be tailored based on the findings of a job analysis (c.f., Harvey, Anderson, Baranowski & Morath, 2007).

Transit agencies should take particular care in developing Minimum Qualifications. Minimum Qualifications (MQs) should be tied to specific KSAs needed on the first day of the job. Employers should avoid using general degree requirements (e.g., college degree required) as these requirements do not necessarily relate to the minimum competence required and may inadvertently discriminate against groups protected by Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA), the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990 and the ADA Amendments Act of 2008. MQs relating to education should cite specific types of coursework needed, and should state ways that experience can substitute for education.

REFERENCES

Harvey, J. L., Anderson, L. E., Baranowski, L. E., & Morath, R. (2007). Job analysis: Gathering job-specific information. In *Applied measurement: Industrial psychology in human resources management*. (pp. 57-86). New York, NY: Taylor & Francis Group/Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

JobDescriptionManager.com, Retrieved on February 3, 2009 from www.jobdescriptionmanger.com.

O*NET Resource Center. Retrieved January 15, 2009 from <http://www.onetcenter.org/>

Office of Personnel Management (2008). *Handbook of occupational groups and families*. Publisher: Washington, D.C.: Author.

Plachy, R. J., & Plachy, S. J. (1998). More Results-Oriented Job Descriptions: 226 Models to Use or Adapt -- With Guidelines for Creating Your Own. *New York: AMACOM American Management Association*.

Appendix D
Sample Job Descriptions

Job Description:

Manager/Supervisor- Transportation

(adapted from job information provided by an actual agency)

Employer Information

Organization Name: MET Transit

Organization Website: www.METTransit.org

About Our Organization: MET Transit is a large urban transit organization that takes people in the metropolitan region wherever they need to go. MET lines link 46 communities, including rail stations, industrial parks, colleges, hospitals, and major shopping malls. It opens up countless job opportunities for thousands – jobs that are miles from home are easy to get to with our buses and vans. Over the past two decades, MET has committed some \$40 million to restore and improve our fleet so that today it runs at unprecedented levels of efficiency. Employees at our agency work diligently to maintain high service and safety standards.

Job Reference #: 4567-09

Date Prepared: 02-02-2009

Job Location:

MET Transit Offices:
4356 28TH Street
Downtown, State 72727

Typical Hours/Week: 45 - 60 hours, 5 days per week. 2 days off per week. Weekend and on call work is required.

FLSA Status: Exempt

Starting Pay: \$75,850-\$84,000 per year

Benefits:

- MET offers three consumer-directed health care options to choose from that cover traditional medical and prescription expenses. Preventive care is covered 100% when you use network physicians.
- The MET education reimbursement program allows up to \$4,000 for continuing education each year.
- Employees are eligible for short-term disability after one year of state service and long-term disability after five years of service, both at no cost to employees.
- Employees receive 10 days of annual leave (vacation) and 10 days of sick leave, in addition to 11 paid holidays.

- Through community services leave, employees are allowed up to three days annually to volunteer in support of schools, communities, citizens and nonprofit organizations, or those wishing to mentor or tutor a student may receive one hour per week, up to 36 hours.
- Retirement planning (401K program). In addition, employees make automatic retirement contributions, matched at 8.14 percent and are vested after five years of service.

How to apply:**Submit resumes and/or request applications to:**

MET Transit
Attn: Resume Processing
4356 28TH Street
Downtown, State 72727
HRrecruiting@METTransit.com

Note: If preferred, applicants may be picked up and resumes drop off in person:

MET Transit Offices
4356 28TH Street
Downtown, State 72727

Applications may also be obtained via the Internet: www.METTransit.com/job_application or via phone: 617-555-9878.

A confirmation email or phone call will be provided immediately once your materials have been received. Please do not contact the agency regarding the status of your submission.

Job Description

General Overview:

- Plans, coordinates and manages the activities and staff of the agency transportation operations function. Supervises, assigns, reviews and evaluates the work of the transportation team including bus operators to meet all agency objectives.

Major Duties:

- Establishes the overall direction of the transportation function by determining priorities, setting goals and objectives, and managing the activities of the team including bus operators.
- Analyzes and evaluates agency operations procedures and work systems in order to maximize the effectiveness of services. Develops and recommends new and/or revised policies and operational regulations.
- Reviews and approves service schedules and work assignments; gives instructions and reviews and approves work. Participates in the selection, evaluation and discipline of employees.
- Monitors transportation employees to ensure they meet and respond to the agency customer service objectives standards and goals.
- Interprets the collective bargaining agreement and agency policies and procedures to ensure all actions are consistent in accordance with those policies, procedures and agreements.
- Maintains compliance with applicable local, State and Federal statutes, guidelines and regulations governing transit services.
- Supervises the development of the transportation budget and ensures that total expenses are within established targets.
- Makes recommendations concerning the establishment or expansion of bus services.
- Assists in developing specifications for new equipment and facilities.
- Presides over special projects and committees as required.
- Conducts studies, maintains records and prepares a variety of reports including financial reports.
- Responds to public inquiries and complaints that cannot be resolved at a lower staff level.
- Oversees the evaluation of employee performance and transportation employee related discipline including bus operators as may be required.

Knowledges:

- Knowledge of the principles, practices, and procedures of operating a public transportation system.
- Knowledge of the principles, practices and methodology of systems analysis.

- Knowledge of automated systems capabilities and programming techniques.
- Knowledge of basic transit vehicle maintenance procedures and requirements.
- Knowledge of the principles and practices of communications and public relations.
- Knowledge of related transportation related safety and security procedures and policies.
- Knowledge of labor relations and contract administration.
- Knowledge of the current trends and developments in field of transportation related information system technology.
- Knowledge of federal and state grant procedures.
- Knowledge of budget preparation and administration.
- Knowledge of the principles, practices, and procedures of operating a public transportation system.
- Knowledge of the principles, practices and methodology of systems analysis.
- Knowledge of automated systems capabilities and programming techniques.

Skills:

- Skill in understanding the implications of new information for both current and future problem-solving and decision-making.
- Skill in using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.
- Skill in monitoring/assessing performance of self, others, or organizations to make improvements or take corrective action.
- Skill in communicating effectively both orally and in writing as appropriate for the needs of the audience.
- Skill in considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions to choose the most appropriate one.
- Skill in determining how a transportation operating system should work and how changes in conditions, operations, and the environment will affect outcomes.
- Skill in identifying measures or indicators of transportation operating system performance and the actions needed to improve or correct performance, relative to the goals of the system.
- Skill in determining how money will be spent to get the work done, and accounting for these expenditures.
- Skill in obtaining and seeing to the appropriate use of equipment, facilities, and materials needed to do certain work.

- Skill in coaching, counseling, motivating, developing, and directing staff, including bus operators.
- Skill in using a computer application to enter, manipulate, and format text and numerical data; insert, delete, and manipulate cells, rows, and columns; and create and save worksheets, charts, and graphs.
- Skill in using a computer application to manage large amounts of information, including creating and editing simple databases, inputting data, retrieving specific records, and creating reports to communicate the information.

Abilities:

- Ability to plan, supervise and coordinate the activities of subordinates.
- Ability to communicate effectively both orally and in writing.
- Ability to analyze a variety of complex public transit administration and operational problems and to recommend solutions and prepare necessary working procedures.
- Ability to prepare and present budget proposals.
- Ability to manage the delivery of transportation services consistent with the requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)
- Ability to serve the public and fellow employees with honesty and integrity in full accord with the letter and spirit of Ethics and Conflict of Interest policies.
- Ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with the general public, co-workers, elected and appointed officials and members of diverse cultural and linguistic backgrounds regardless of race, color, religion, age, gender, ethnicity, disability, sexual orientation, marital status or political affiliation.

Work Context:

- Requires ability to respond to competitive pressures.
- Requires dealing with unpleasant, angry, or discourteous people.
- Requires making decisions that affect other people, the financial resources, and/or the image and reputation of the agency.
- Requires making decisions that impact the results of co-workers, customers or the agency.
- Requires being exact or highly accurate.
- Requires working indoors in a traditional office setting and outside on agency vehicles and in agency facilities.
- Requires meeting strict deadlines.
- Requires coordinating or leading others in accomplishing work activities.
- Requires work with external customers or the public.

- Requires work with others in a group or team.
- Includes responsibility for the health, safety and security of others.
- Includes opportunity to make decisions without supervision.
- Includes freedom to determine tasks, priorities, and goals.
- Includes exposure to noise and/or odor levels that are distracting or uncomfortable.

Tools

Technology:

- Computers
- Transportation management related software
- Mapping software
- AVL/GPS technology
- Scheduling and dispatch related software
- Radio and mobile data terminal communication systems

Minimum Qualifications

Education:

- Coursework in business administration, public administration, transportation or related field.

Years of Experience:

- 6-8 years of operational and administrative experience in the transportation field.
- At least two years of experience with transportation supervisory and/or management responsibilities is desirable.
- Relevant transportation experience may be substituted for the required education on a year for year basis.

Licenses and Certificates:

- Possession of a current CDL with passenger and airbrake endorsements.

Additional Requirements:

- All employees must comply with random drug and alcohol testing (in accordance with DOT/FTA regulations)
- Qualification for fidelity bond required

MET Transit is an Equal Opportunity Employer. It is our policy to make all personnel decisions without discriminating on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, sex, physical disability, mental disability, age, marital status, sexual orientation, citizenship status, national or ethnic origin, and any other protected status.

MET Transit is committed to hiring qualified persons with disabilities and fulfilling its responsibilities under the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and the ADA Amendments Act. The company will make every effort to make reasonable accommodations for persons in need.

Job Description:

Manager/Supervisor- Paratransit Services

(adapted from job information provided by an actual agency)

Employer Information

Organization Name: TACT Transit

Organization Website: www.TACTTransit.org

About Our Organization: TACT Transit is a large urban transit agency providing fixed route transportation services throughout Alpine City and County. TACT Transit also provides transportation services to individuals with disabilities that complement our fixed route operation. The TACT Transit Paratransit Mission is to expand mobility options by providing fully accessible, useable, and integrated public transportation. 2008 marked our 20th year of service to the Alpine region. During these two decades, we have been busy making mobility a reality and supporting everyone's freedom, independence and quality of life.

Job Reference #: 127-2009

Date Prepared: 01-30-2009

Job Location:

Headquarters:

359 Big Oak Street
Alpine, State 54321

Note: Employees are provided with free public transportation service through our fixed-route program.

Typical Hours/Week: 45 - 60 hours, 5 days per week. 2 days off per week. Saturday and Sunday work may occasionally be required. On call requirements.

FLSA Status: Exempt

Starting Pay: \$73,250-\$82,000 per year

Benefits:

- Employees can set aside money on a pre-tax basis to pay for qualifying medical and dependent care expenses
- Employees are eligible for short-term disability after one year of state service and long-term disability after five years of service, both at no cost to employees.
- Medical (PPO and HMO options), dental, prescription, and optional vision; Long-term disability; Life insurance
- Employees are granted free transportation services under fixed-route program
- Employees receive a minimum of 11 3/4 days of annual leave (vacation) and 12 days of sick leave, in addition to 11 paid holidays (12 if Christmas is on a Tuesday, Wednesday or Thursday).
- Through community services leave, employees are allowed up to three days annually to volunteer in support of schools, communities, citizens and nonprofit organizations, or those wishing to mentor or tutor a student may receive one hour per week, up to 36 hours.
- Retirement planning (401K program)

How to apply:

Contact (for internal use only- for training and HR questions):

TACT Transit

Attn: Jane Doe, Director of Personnel

HR@TACTTransit.org

512-626-0015

Submit resumes and/or request applications to:

TACT Transit

Attn: Resume Processing

579 Quarter Street

Smithville, State 01234

HRrecruiting@TACTTransit.com

Note: If preferred, applicants may be picked up and resumes drop off in person:

579 Quarter Street

Smithville, State 01234

Applications may also be obtained via the Internet: www.TACTTransit.com/job_application or via phone: 512-626-0012.

A confirmation email or phone call will be provided immediately once your materials have been received. Please do not contact the agency regarding the status of your submission.

Job Description

General Overview:

- Plans, coordinates, and directs the work of all Paratransit Division employees. This position manages and directs paratransit operations including supervision, training, coaching and on-board oversight. This position is responsible for all dispatch office functions, including responding to customer service matters.

Major Duties:

- Supervises, assigns, monitors and evaluates the work of Paratransit Operations Supervisors, Dispatchers, and clerical staff in a Division; and provides information and guidance to Bus Operators and other paratransit employees regarding problems that affect their work performance.
- Recommends personnel actions to the Transportation Director related to staffing and discipline.
- Plans, organizes, and manages the work of subordinate staff to ensure that the work is accomplished in a manner consistent with organizational requirements.
- Directs investigations to verify and resolve customer complaints.
- Supervises the conducting of evaluations of operator job performance.
- Implements schedule and policy changes.
- Collaborates with other managers and staff members to formulate and implement policies, procedures, goals, and objectives.
- Monitors operations to ensure that staff members comply with administrative policies and procedures, safety rules, union contracts, and government regulations.
- Promotes safe and secure work activities by conducting safety and security audits, attending company safety and security meetings, and meeting with individual staff members.
- Responds to public inquiries and complaints that cannot be resolved at a lower staff level.
- Supervises the investigation, documentation and analysis of all vehicular accidents and other incidents as required.

Knowledges:

- Knowledge of principles and processes for providing paratransit operational services. This includes customer needs assessment, meeting quality standards for services, and evaluation of customer satisfaction.
- Knowledge of business and management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, production methods, and coordination of people and resources.

- Knowledge of working within a collective bargaining environment.
- Knowledge of the paratransit scheduling and dispatching functions is necessary.

Skills:

- Skill in obtaining and seeing to the appropriate use of equipment, facilities, and materials needed to perform paratransit functions.
- Skill in using a computer application to manage large amounts of information, including creating and editing simple databases, inputting data, retrieving specific records, and creating reports to communicate the information.
- Skill in basic management techniques and customer service.
- Skill and sensitivity in serving individuals with various physical and cognitive disabilities.
- Skill in managing ones own time and the time of others.
- Skill in using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.
- Skill in effectively motivating and communicating.
- Skill in understanding the implications of new information for both current and future problem-solving and decision-making.
- Skill in budgeting and considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions.

Abilities:

- Ability to serve the public and fellow employees with honesty and integrity in full accord with the letter and spirit of Ethics and Conflict of Interest policies.
- Ability to organize and delegate work to subordinates.
- Ability to learn and apply principles of progressive discipline.
- Ability to exercise sound independent judgment.
- Ability to learn and apply applicable provisions of multiple Collective Bargaining Agreements.
- Ability to communicate effectively both orally and in writing.
- Ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with employees at all levels using principles of good customer service.
- Ability to quickly analyze a situation and provide timely solutions.

Work Context:

- Requires observing, receiving, and otherwise obtaining information from all relevant sources.

- Requires analyzing information and evaluating results to choose the best solution and solve problems.
- Requires keeping up-to-date technically and applying new knowledge to your job.
- Requires providing information to supervisors, co-workers, and subordinates by telephone, in written form, e-mail, or in person.
- Requires communicating with people outside the organization, representing the organization to customers, the public, government, and other external sources.
- Requires using relevant information and individual judgment to determine whether events or processes comply with laws, regulations, or standards.
- Requires scheduling services, programs, and activities, as well as the work of others.
- Requires developing specific goals and plans to prioritize, organize, and accomplish your work.
- Reports to the Transportation Director.
- Includes exposure to noise and odor levels that are distracting or uncomfortable.
- May include working non-standard hours as required

Tools

Technology:

- Proficiency in Microsoft Office applications
- Data base user interface and query software
- Paratransit scheduling and dispatch software
- Radio and mobile data terminal communication equipment

Minimum Qualifications

Coursework and Training:

- Coursework in Business Administration or another related Management field.
- Accident investigation training (preferred)
- Transit leadership training (preferred)

Years of Experience:

- Equivalent to five (5) years in transportation industry including two (2) verifiable years in an operational supervisory capacity, and/or as a dispatcher.

- Relevant experience may be substituted for the required education on a year for year basis.

Licenses and Certificates:

- Class B Commercial Driver License with Passenger Endorsement-with air brake restriction lifted and current medical certification (required)

Additional Requirements:

- All employees must comply with random drug and alcohol testing (in accordance with DOT/FTA regulations)
- Managers must qualify for fidelity bond

TACT Transit is an Equal Opportunity Employer. It is our policy to make all personnel decisions without discriminating on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, sex, physical disability, mental disability, age, marital status, sexual orientation, citizenship status, national or ethnic origin, and any other protected status.

TACT Transit is committed to hiring qualified persons with disabilities and fulfilling its responsibilities under the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and the ADA Amendments Act. The company will make every effort to make reasonable accommodations for persons in need.

Job Description:**Manager/Supervisor- Dispatching and Scheduling**

(adapted from job information provided by an actual agency)

Employer Information

Organization Name: CAD Transit

Organization Website: www.CADTransit.org

About Our Organization: CAD Transit is a medium sized transit agency with currently 53 vehicles in operation. Our company has been providing top quality service to our community for over 50 years. We provide fixed route public transportation services to a community of over 50,000 residents. While predominantly an urban setting, our city is surrounded on all sides by rural communities. For our disabled community members, we also provide paratransit services through a contract with a local company. Our paratransit service provides door-to-door pick-up and drop-off services for registered customers. All of our services are offered Monday through Saturday. We pride ourselves on being active members of the community and well-respected by our riders. We strive to keep our employees satisfied because we firmly believe this translates to happy customers. We consider ourselves a flat organization in that while we have three primary levels of management, we believe that even our top managers should be actively involved in our operations and work directly with maintenance, bus operators and even sometimes our riders. We provide job rotations upon the first six months of hire to expose of our staff to all of our business operations. These rotations include experience riding on our buses, observing maintenance procedures and working in an office setting. Our goal is to continue to grow the strong reputation which has enabled us to have a very successful 50 years!

Job Reference #: 005-2009

Date Prepared: 01-29-2009

Job Location:Headquarters:

579 Quarter Street
Smithville, State 01234

Note: Employees are provided with free public transportation service through our fixed-route program.

Typical Hours/Week: 45-60 hours, 5 days per week. 2 days off per week, Saturday and Sunday work may occasionally be required. On call requirements.

FLSA Status: Exempt

Starting Pay: \$50,000-\$60,000 per year

Benefits:

- Medical (PPO and HMO options), dental, prescription, and optional vision; Long-term disability; Life insurance percentage match
- Opportunity to obtain funding support for approved Management Training courses
- Flexible work arrangements: One week per month, may select the preferred 2 days off.
- Employees are granted free transportation services under fixed-route program
- Retirement planning (401K program)
- Family support policies: FMLA guidelines are respected; Employees may exhaust sick time when on FMLA leave; Bereavement leave (based on supervisor approval)
- Scholarship program offered to support children with special needs
- National holidays provided (except when transit services offered in the case of a special event); Accrued vacation up to 2 weeks per year; Sick leave up to 2 weeks per year; Leave Without Pay provided in exceptional circumstances

How to apply:

Contact (for internal use only- for training and HR questions):

CAD Transit

Attn: Jane Doe, Director of Personnel

HR@CADTransit.org

512-626-0015

Submit resumes and/or request applications to:

CAD Transit

Attn: Resume Processing

579 Quarter Street

Smithville, State 01234

HRrecruiting@CADTransit.com

Note: If preferred, applicants may be picked up and resumes drop off in person:

579 Quarter Street

Smithville, State 01234

Applications may also be obtained via the internet: www.CADTransit.com/job_application or via phone: 512-626-0012.

A confirmation email or phone call will be provided immediately once your materials have been received. Please do not contact the agency regarding the status of your submission.

Job Description

General Overview:

- Plans, coordinates, and directs the work of division operating and office employees. This position will rotate in the duties of supervising and directing the operations including training, coaching and on-board oversight and will provide assistance in the field. This position is directly responsible for all dispatch office functions, including responding to customer service matters.

Major Duties:

- Supervises, assigns, monitors and evaluates the work of Dispatchers and clerical staff in a Division; and provides information and guidance to Bus Operators and office employees regarding problems that affect their work performance.
- Recommends personnel actions to the Transportation Director related to staffing and discipline.
- Plans, organizes, and manages the work of subordinate staff to ensure that the work is accomplished in a manner consistent with organizational requirements.
- Directs investigations to verify and resolve customer complaints and notify the police when intervention is required.
- Conducts evaluations of operator job performance through on-board observation and the collection of customer input.
- Implements schedule and policy changes.
- Collaborates with other managers and staff members to formulate and implement policies, procedures, goals, and objectives.
- Monitors operations to ensure that staff members comply with administrative policies and procedures, safety rules, union contracts, and government regulations.
- Promotes safe and secure work activities by conducting safety and security audits, attending company safety and security meetings, and meeting with individual staff members.
- Responds to public inquiries and complaints that cannot be resolved at a lower staff level.
- Provides back up and relief to the dispatcher position and serves as back-up to Transportation Director during absences or emergencies.
- Dispatches operators to job sites in order to provide service to customers.
- Communicates daily work assignments and changes in routes of services in order to maintain flow of service.
- Supervises the operation of two-way radio to direct bus operators and monitor scheduling.

- Supervises the maintenance of dispatcher diary of missed trips, accidents and unusual occurrences in order to have detailed documentation of all possible operations issues.

Knowledges:

- Knowledge of principles and policies for providing customer transit services. This includes customer needs assessment, meeting quality standards for services, and evaluation of customer satisfaction.
- Knowledge of operational principles and methods for moving people via buses and vans, including the relative costs and benefits.
- Knowledge of business and management principles involved in strategic planning, resource allocation, human resources modeling, leadership technique, production methods, and coordination of people and resources.
- Knowledge of transit scheduling and dispatching functions.
- Knowledge of DOT/FTA drug and alcohol regulations.
- Knowledge of union/management agreements and processes.

Skills:

- Skill in obtaining and seeing to the appropriate use of equipment, facilities, and materials needed to do certain work.
- Skill in using a computer application to manage large amounts of information, including creating and editing simple databases, inputting data, retrieving specific records, and creating reports to communicate the information.
- Skill in using transit scheduling and dispatch software.
- Skill in basic transit management and customer service.
- Skill in providing customer service to individuals with various physical and cognitive disabilities.
- Skill in managing ones own time and the time of others.
- Skill in using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.
- Skill in supervising and mentoring staff for the purposes of professional growth and teambuilding.
- Skill in selecting and using training/instructional methods and procedures appropriate for the situation when learning or teaching new things.
- Skill in budgeting and considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions.

Abilities:

- Ability to maintain detailed records including trip logs for reporting purposes.

- Ability to serve the public and fellow employees with honesty and integrity in full accord with the letter and spirit of Ethics and Conflict of Interest policies.
- Ability to organize and delegate work to subordinates.
- Ability to learn and apply principles of progressive discipline.
- Ability to exercise sound independent judgment.
- Ability to learn and apply applicable provisions of Collective Bargaining Agreements.
- Ability to communicate effectively both orally and in writing.
- Ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with employees at all levels using principles of good employee relations.
- Ability to quickly analyze a situation and provide timely solutions.
- Ability to identify and resolve problems related to scheduling, dispatching or operations.
- Ability to evaluate employee performance using validated, job relevant criteria.
- Ability to work with external entities including private industry, governmental agencies and the general public.

Work Context:

- Requires observing, receiving, and otherwise obtaining information from all relevant sources.
- Requires analyzing information and evaluating results to choose the best solution and solve problems.
- Requires keeping up-to-date technically and applying new knowledge to your job.
- Requires providing information to supervisors, co-workers, and subordinates by telephone, in written form, e-mail, or in person.
- Requires communicating with people outside the organization, representing the organization to customers, the public, government, and other external sources.
- Requires using relevant information and individual judgment to determine whether events or processes comply with laws, regulations, or standards.
- Requires scheduling service, programs, and activities, as well as the work of others.
- Requires developing specific goals and plans to prioritize, organize, and accomplish your work.
- Requires working indoors, outdoors and on-board vehicles.
- Requires working in a nontraditional office setting in a garage facility.
- Reports to the Transportation Director.

- Includes exposure to odors and noise levels that are distracting or uncomfortable.
- May include working non-standard hours as required

Tools

Technology:

- Proficiency in Microsoft Word and Excel applications
- Data base user interface and query software
- Transit scheduling and dispatching software
- Two-way radio and mobile data terminal communication equipment

Minimum Qualifications

Coursework and Training Experience:

- Supervisory or leadership experience, or supervisory or leadership training.
- Training in two-way radio/ data terminal communications

Years of Experience:

- Equivalent to five (5) years in transportation industry including two (2) verifiable years in a transit operational supervisory capacity, and/or as a dispatcher.
- Relevant experience may be substituted for the required education on a year for year basis.

Licenses and Certificates:

- Class B Commercial Driver License with Passenger Endorsement-with air brake restriction lifted and current medical certification (required)

Additional Requirements:

- All employees must comply with random drug and alcohol testing (in accordance with DOT/FTA regulations)
- Managers must qualify for fidelity bond

CAD Transit is an Equal Opportunity Employer. It is our policy to make all personnel decisions without discriminating on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, sex, physical disability, mental disability, age, marital status, sexual orientation, citizenship status, national or ethnic origin, and any other protected status.

CAD Transit is committed to hiring qualified persons with disabilities and fulfilling its responsibilities under the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and the ADA Amendments Act. The company will make every effort to make reasonable accommodations for persons in need.

Job Description:**Manager/Supervisor- Vehicle Maintenance****Employer Information**

Organization Name: Tarrant Agency Transit Authority (TATA)

Organization Website: www.tatamoves.org

About Our Organization: Tarrant Agency Transit Authority (TATA) is a medium sized transit agency. Our company just celebrated its 40 year anniversary. We provide services to a small urban city and surrounding areas with a population of approximately 80,000. TATA provides both fixed-route and ADA paratransit services and we operate a fleet of 60 vehicles. Our service is in operation six days per week; closed on Sunday. Our agency has been voted as “Best Place to Work” by “Working Mother” magazine for the past 2 years! We believe in offering state-of-the art training and development opportunities to all of our employees. Our agency has a very team-based environment and we consider our employees the reason for our great success.

Job Reference #: 013-2009

Date Prepared: 02-02-2009

Job Location:

TATA Maintenance Facility
1200 North Street
Leestown, State 01482

Typical Hours/Week: 45-55 hours, 5 days per week. 2 days off per week, overtime and weekend work may be required when extra maintenance work is needed. Work hours are not flexible as the position requires continuous oversight of two specified work shifts per day.

FLSA Status: Exempt

Starting Pay: \$58,000-\$65,000 per year

Benefits:

- Medical (PPO and HMO options), dental, and optional vision; Long-term and short-term disability; Life insurance
- Professional development courses available as part of paid work hours; tuition reimbursement for relevant trade specific coursework
- Federal holidays recognized (except when transit services offered in the case of a special event)
- Family support policies: FMLA guidelines are respected for maternity and paternity leave; Employees may use up to 4 weeks of sick time when on FMLA leave; Bereavement leave (based on supervisor approval)
- Accrued personal days up to 3 weeks per year (may be used for sick or other personal reasons); Leave Without Pay provided in exceptional circumstances
- Retirement planning (401K)

- Commuter discounts/ reimbursements available
- Families-Ride-Free Program: One Saturday each month

How to apply:

Contact

TATA
Attn: Jane Doe, Personnel Manager
JDoe@TATAmoves.org
418-555-2213

Submit resumes and/or request applications to:

TATA Transit
Attn: Resume Processing
152 Christoff Street
Leestown, State 01482
Resumes@TATAmoves.org

Note: If preferred, applications may be picked up and resumes dropped off in person:
152 Christoff Street
Leestown, State 01482

Applications are also available at the maintenance facility on North Street. If preferred, applications may be obtained via the Internet: www.TATAmoves.com/job_application or via phone: 418-555-2225.

A confirmation email or phone call will be provided immediately once your materials have been received. Please do not contact the agency regarding the status of your submission.

Job Description

General Overview:

- Manages the daily activities involved in all TATA vehicle and facilities maintenance. Coordinates all vehicle, vehicle parts and supplies purchasing for the agency. Directs maintenance activities focused on servicing, inspection, and repair of vehicles to ensure that all equipment meets safety, efficiency and cleanliness standards for the agency in the most cost-effective manner. Has responsibility for upkeep and repair of all TATA facilities.

Major Duties:

- Oversees daily activities of the maintenance division in order to maintain efficient and timely operations.
- Manages and prioritizes the scheduling of work activities in coordination with transit operation requirements.
- Oversees vehicle preventative maintenance and corrective maintenance activities including the scheduling of routine inspections, state safety inspections and daily vehicle repairs.
- Serves as representative of the agency on safety and maintenance concerns to include serving on maintenance committees, attending transit industry meetings and conferences, and responding to public inquiry on maintenance issues as deemed appropriate.
- Maintains and updates all service manuals, repair records, inventory records, and vehicle inspection reports.
- Participates in the purchasing of vehicles and parts by meeting with multiple vehicle manufacturers, testing available alternatives by performing cost/benefit analyses of relative durability and utility, negotiating technical specifications, selecting and ordering vehicles, inspecting production, and resolving issues.
- Participates in the writing or modification of technical specifications for proposed revenue vehicles, non-revenue vehicles, and other electronic and mechanical products supplied by outside vendors.
- Monitors or performs final inspection of delivered vehicles, and authorizes buses and other revenue and non-revenue vehicles for service.
- Maintains agency compliance with all environmental and public health safety standards by making recommendations for policy changes as needed.
- Oversees the upkeep and maintenance of all agency administrative, transportation, maintenance, and transfer center facilities.
- Prepares reports and makes presentations that include findings and recommendations to agency General Manager.
- Participates in decision making regarding personnel issues for all maintenance employees.

- Monitors staff adherence to agency policies, as well as state and federal rules and regulations.
- Participates in the review and analysis of all vehicle accident reports by performing failure analyses, recommending maintenance solutions to prevent reoccurrence, and following up as needed to ensure that preventive measures have been implemented.
- Maintains maintenance related databases mandated by the Federal Transportation Authority (FTA) and the state.
- Regularly monitors emissions measurements such as opacity, particulate matter, and nitrogen oxides.
- Manages maintenance documentation and prepares required federal and state reports.
- Oversees training and professional development activities for all maintenance staff.

Knowledges:

- Knowledge of heavy duty vehicle maintenance procedures and requirements including diesel engines, automatic transmission, drive train systems, air brake systems, electrical systems, and air conditioning systems.
- Knowledge of purchasing and maintaining a transit vehicle inventory.
- Knowledge of maintenance related safety procedures and policies.
- Knowledge of the current trends and developments in the field of maintenance related information system technology and computerized vehicle maintenance record keeping systems.
- Knowledge of hazardous material management.
- Knowledge of basic and effective facility maintenance practices.
- Knowledge of Federal Transit Administration (FTA) fleet procurement and contract management guidelines and the rules under FTA.
- Knowledge of maintenance-related business and management practices
- Knowledge of leadership, performance evaluation, motivation, team building, and conflict resolution
- Knowledge of budget development and administration.
- Knowledge of database application development

Skills:

- Skill in interpreting vehicle maintenance manuals and related system schematics to direct maintenance activities.
- Skill in understanding the implications of new vehicle and maintenance information for both current and future problem-solving and decision-making.

- Skill in using logic and reasoning to identify the strengths and weaknesses of alternative solutions, conclusions or approaches to problems.
- Skill in monitoring/assessing performance of self, others, or organizations to make improvements or take corrective action.
- Skill in communicating orally both in technical and non-technical terms to various audiences.
- Skill in communicating in writing to prepare memos, briefings, reports and various correspondence as appropriate for the needs of the audience.
- Skill in considering the relative costs and benefits of potential actions to choose the most appropriate one.
- Skill in determining how vehicle and facility maintenance functions should work and how changes in conditions, operations, and the environment will affect outcomes.
- Skill in obtaining and overseeing the appropriate use of equipment, facilities, and materials needed to do certain work.
- Skill in using a computer application to manage large amounts of information, including creating and editing simple databases, inputting data, retrieving specific records, and creating reports to communicate the information.

Abilities:

- Ability to coordinate staff across work shifts to ensure adequate availability of workers at any given time.
- Ability to ensure vehicle mechanics are trained on agency fleet as needed.
- Ability to ensure facility maintenance workers are trained in facility upkeep and repair as needed.
- Ability to prepare and present budget proposals and assist in grant activities.
- Ability to solve complex problems independently.
- Ability to plan and direct the day-to-day activities of vehicle and facility maintenance staff.
- Ability to conduct cost benefit analysis to evaluate the financial impact and technical feasibility of maintenance projects.
- Ability to produce technically correct contracts, vouchers and reports.
- Ability to effectively organize, manage, and monitor internal staff, consultants, and manufacturer representatives in regard to maintenance, repair, and warranty issues.
- Ability to research agency vehicle and equipment needs and recommend alternatives based on cost-benefit analysis.
- Ability to compile and analyze data and information related to technical specifications and warranty requirements.

- Ability to develop recommendations in the writing of maintenance reports.
- Ability to maintain or monitor the maintenance of a wide variety of databases to protect integrity of data, including road calls, cost-per-mile calculations, emissions, warranty, fleet distribution, equipment testing, fueling systems, and vehicle counts.
- Ability to coordinate maintenance unit activities with the strategic needs of other agency functions.
- Ability to develop effective and collaborative working relationships with subordinate staff, co-workers, and supervisors using principles of good customer service.
- Ability to operate a commercial vehicle as needed for testing.

Work Context:

- Requires making decisions that impact the results of co-workers, customers or the agency.
- Requires lifting objects up to 60 pounds for inventory control and vehicle and facility maintenance purposes.
- Requires high accuracy to maintain safety of vehicles and facilities.
- Requires a combination of working in an office setting, in a maintenance shop, and outside on agency vehicles, service areas, or other agency facility locations.
- Requires coordinating or leading others in accomplishing work activities.
- Requires working with others in a group or team.
- Includes responsibility for the health, safety and security of others.
- Includes exposure to noise and odor levels that may be distracting or uncomfortable.
- May require travel to any point within the agency service area on short notice and other long distance travel with more advanced notice as may be necessary.
- Requires working outside regular business hours to attend workshops, conferences, or meetings as a representative of the agency, as required.
- May include exposure to occasional build-up of diesel exhaust fumes.
- May require performance of maintenance functions as necessary outside under various weather conditions with temperature extremes.

Requires briefing and reporting to the General Manager.

Tools**Technology:**

- Computers

- Heavy duty transit vehicles, vans and supervisor vehicles
- Fork lifts
- Analytical or scientific software
- Data base user interface and query software
- Vehicle maintenance and record keeping software
- Gauges or inspection fixtures
- Scanners
- Speed sensors
- Wheel alignment equipment
- Welding equipment
- Vehicle lifts, hoists, and jacks
- Bench grinders
- Drill presses
- Impact wrenches
- Air conditioning service equipment
- Vehicle washing equipment
- Tire changing and regrooving equipment
- Oil/water separator
- A wide range of standard hand tools, vehicle and facility maintenance tools, testing and repair equipment
- Radio and mobile data terminal communication systems

Minimum Qualifications

Coursework and Training Experience:

- Training in heavy duty vehicle maintenance.
- Vocational training in diesel engines, transmissions, drive trains, brake systems, air conditioning, electrical systems and other special transit vehicle systems.

Work Experience:

- 5 years transit or diesel maintenance experience, or an equivalent combination.
- At least 2 years of maintenance supervisory experience is desirable.

- Experience in facility maintenance is desirable
- Relevant experience may be substituted for the required education on a year for year basis.

Licenses and Certificates:

- Possession of a current CDL with passenger and air brake endorsements.

Additional Requirements:

- All employees must comply with random drug and alcohol testing (in accordance with DOT/FTA regulations)

ABC Company is an Equal Opportunity Employer. It is our policy to make all personnel decisions without discriminating on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, sex, physical disability, mental disability, age, marital status, sexual orientation, citizenship status, national or ethnic origin, and any other protected status.

ABC Company is committed to hiring qualified persons with disabilities and fulfilling its responsibilities under the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and the ADA Amendments Act. The company will make every effort to make reasonable accommodations for persons in need.

Job Description:**Transit Director**

(adapted from job information provided by an actual agency)

Employer Information

Organization Name: REV Transit

Organization Website: www.REVTransit.org

About Our Organization: REV Transit is a small rural transit organization that offers general public transportation services in Jefferson, Clinton, and Lincoln Counties. REV Transit offers various transportation services. Express Services offer riders opportunities to travel between Spencer, Ellettsville, and Bloomington Monday through Friday. County Routes offer round-trip service between specific points in the counties one to five times weekly. County Sweeps offer service throughout each county Monday through Friday. Please call 24 hours or more in advance of your trip on weekdays if possible. Same day service provided if time is available.

Job Reference #: 210-09

Date Prepared: 02-02-2009

Job Location:

REV Transit Offices:

10 Willow Drive
Plains, State 22454

Typical Hours/Week: 50-60 hours, 5 days per week. 2 days off per week. Saturday and Sunday work may occasionally be required.

FLSA Status: Exempt

Starting Pay: \$45,850-\$55,000 per year

Benefits:

- Medical Insurance: Blue Shield: PPO (Preferred Provider Organization) or HMO (Health Maintenance Organization)
- Employee Assistance Program- Services for employees and their dependents include free short-term counseling, legal consultations, financial counseling, child care referrals
- Vision insurance- Exams, contacts, lenses and frames all generously covered.
- Flexible Spending Accounts- Includes Health Spending Account, Dependent Care Account and Qualified Trans Benefit.
- Short Term Disability Insurance coverage provided at approximately 100% of normal of salary. Long-term Disability coverage provided at 66 of salary.

- Dental insurance-80% coverage
- Retirement planning (401K program).
- Employees receive 10 days of annual leave (vacation) and 10 days of sick leave, in addition to 11 paid holidays.
- Life Insurance- Automatic coverage at 2 times annual salary.

How to apply:Submit resumes and/or request applications to:

REV Transit
Attn: Resume Processing
10 Willow Drive
Plains, State 22454
Personnel@REVTransit.com

Note: If preferred, applicants may be picked up and resumes drop off in person:

REV Transit offices
10 Willow Drive
Plains, State 22454

Applications may also be obtained via the Internet: www.REVTransit.com/job_application or via phone: 215-555-9980.

A confirmation email or phone call will be provided immediately once your materials have been received. Please do not contact the agency regarding the status of your submission.

Job Description

General Overview:

- Directs and coordinates activities related to the transportation agency, including operational service delivery, vehicle and facility maintenance, regional mobility, and administrative/budgetary concerns. Facilitates a high level of collaboration and interconnected service provision among all functions within the organization, leads policy development across the organization, and implements the mission, goals, and objectives of the organization as outlined by the governing board.

Major Duties:

- Establishes the overall direction of the transit agency by determining priorities, setting goals and objectives, and managing the activities of the agency team.
- Identifies and makes improvement recommendations of management systems, processes, and measurement techniques to improve agency operational effectiveness and implements approved plans.
- Directs subordinates to include: prioritizing and assigning work; conducting performance evaluations; ensuring that employees follow policies and procedures; and, overseeing hiring, termination, and disciplinary decisions and recommendations.
- Provides agency leadership to ensure agency operations, services and activities are aligned with legal requirements and established agency mission, goals and objectives.
- Directs the operation, maintenance, and promotion of the transit system in an efficient manner providing safe, secure, efficient, and effective service to the public.
- Monitors and evaluates the performance of all agency functions against established objectives.
- Reviews results with responsible parties and takes or directs corrective action as necessary.
- Develops objectives, plans, programs and policies for the transit agency.
- Provides staff support to the Transit Board and receives requests and assignments from the Board as a result of Board action or through its Chairperson and initiates appropriate action based on requests or assignments.
- Provides leadership in personnel policies and initiatives, wage and benefit administration, recruitment and selection, discipline and wage levels.
- Directs the fiscal management including the development and monitoring of accounting procedures, internal auditing, preparation of financial documents, and budget preparation and control.
- Provides the Transit Board with detailed oral and written information concerning agency operations, services and activities; makes presentations regarding the current status of projects and programs; provides updates regarding the agency's financial condition and issues affecting services and programs.

- Represents the agency and the Board with local, regional, state and federal agencies, community groups, and other interested parties providing information on matters pertaining to programs and services of the agency.
- Attends, chairs and conducts a variety of meetings for the agency; serves on committees as requested; represents the agency and makes oral presentations at meetings, conferences and other events.

Knowledges:

- Knowledge of the principles, practices, and procedures of operating a public transportation system.
- Knowledge of state, municipal and local governmental operations.
- Knowledge of the principles, practices, and methods of human resource management, budgeting, program planning, and administration, and the ability to apply them.
- Knowledge of missions, responsibilities, policies, and directives of Local and Regional Emergency Management functions.
- Knowledge of Police, Fire and Rescue, and Emergency Response.
- Knowledge of public administration principles, including basic principles of organization, management, and budget preparation and statistical analyses.
- Knowledge of strategic, short and long-range planning principles.
- Knowledge of the application of technology practices in a joint operational setting.
- Knowledge of laws, ordinances and regulations underlying a public sector organization.
- Knowledge of transit operations and maintenance, and vehicle and facilities management.

Skills:

- Skill in monitoring and evaluating subordinate staff.
- Skill in facilitating group decision-making.
- Skill in reading, analyzing, and interpreting complex documents.
- Skill in responding effectively to sensitive inquiries or complaints.
- Skill in making effective and persuasive presentations on controversial or complex topics to staff, public groups, and/or boards of directors.
- Skill in planning, organizing, coordinating and providing direction and leadership for a transit agency.
- Skill in delegating responsibility and authority to agency staff.

- Skill in representing the agency to legislators, civic groups, regulatory agencies and others in the community.
- Skill in monitoring and overseeing the agency's budget process and major capital projects.
- Skill in developing effective work plans, goals and objectives.
- Skill in communications as applied to interaction with Board members, elected officials, coworkers and subordinates, and the general public sufficient to exchange or convey information and to receive work direction.
- Skill in communicating and serving seniors and individuals with disabilities in a sensitive and effective manner.

Abilities:

- Ability to plan, supervise and coordinate the activities of subordinates.
- Ability to interpret and apply Federal, State, and County laws, regional agreements and regulations affecting public safety, transportation, and public service.
- Ability to understand the content of agreements and practices.
- Ability to work with and coordinate between internal agency functions and external governmental entities to meet goals and objectives.
- Ability to analyze policy and technical issues and exercise sound judgment in decision making.
- Ability to analyze and interpret regulations, policies and procedures to individuals and groups in order to gain compliance, cooperation, and understanding.
- Ability to manage budgets and expenses, and track costs and revenues.
- Ability to analyze data and draw sound conclusions.
- Ability to effectively manage and motivate employees.
- Ability to plan, direct, and coordinate the work of staff.
- Ability to develop and maintain effective working relationships with staff, appointed and elected government officials, colleagues, employees, community organizations, the media, and the general public including the ability to develop consensus, which accommodates conflicting interests and viewpoints.

Work Context:

- Requires the ability to effectively respond to competitive pressures.
- Requires making decisions that affect other people, the financial resources, and/or the image and reputation of the organization.
- Requires being exact or highly accurate.

- Requires working indoors in a traditional office setting and outside on agency vehicles and in agency facilities.
- Requires meeting strict deadlines.
- Requires coordinating or leading others in accomplishing work activities.
- Requires working with community, region, state, and national stakeholders.
- Requires work with external customers or the public.
- Requires work with others in a group or team.
- Includes opportunity to make decisions without supervision.
- Includes freedom to determine tasks, priorities, and goals.

Tools

Technology:

- Computers
- Accounting software
- Project management software
- Scheduling and dispatch software
- Radio and mobile data terminal communication systems

Minimum Qualifications

Education:

- Coursework in public administration, business administration or related field.

Years of Experience:

- 5 years of management or supervisory experience.
- Experience in the operation of a transportation agency is desirable.
- Proven record of job advancement.
- Progressively responsible transportation management experience may be substituted for education requirement.

Licenses and Certificates:

- Possession of a valid driver's license.

Additional Requirements:

- All employees must comply with random drug and alcohol testing (in accordance with DOT/FTA regulations)
- Qualification for fidelity bond required

REV Transit is an Equal Opportunity Employer. It is our policy to make all personnel decisions without discriminating on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, sex, physical disability, mental disability, age, marital status, sexual orientation, citizenship status, national or ethnic origin, and any other protected status.

REV Transit is committed to hiring qualified persons with disabilities and fulfilling its responsibilities under the Rehabilitation Act, the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), and the ADA Amendments Act. The company will make every effort to make reasonable accommodations for persons in need.

Appendix E

How to Use Job Description Guides

HOW TO USE JOB DESCRIPTION GUIDES

Job descriptions are useful for a variety of human resources management functions including: recruiting, development, compensation, succession planning, clarifying worker roles, and structuring work among several workers.

To assist transit agencies in preparing job descriptions, we have provided 32 Job Description Guides. The Job Description Guides provide a structure for job descriptions, guidance on each part of the job description, and examples of the content that would likely be found in each section of the job description. To demonstrate how the Job Description Guide can be used, we prepared 5 Sample Job Descriptions based on real jobs within agencies that we know intimately. These samples are provided as illustrations of what agencies would want their final product to look like (after a job analysis). We created sample job descriptions for 2 large agencies, 2 medium sized agencies and 1 small agency.

The Job Description Guides should be used as a framework by transit agencies to organize the job information they collect through a job analysis. The agency, based on its own characteristics, services, and job requirements, will have to customize the job descriptions to fit their respective agency and the specific position of interest. To effectively use these Job Description Guides we suggest that users:

- Select the Job Description Guide that best matches the content of the job for which you want to have an agency specific job description.
- Review the Job Description Guide to identify the types of information you will need to gather on the job of interest
- Gather data on the job of interest by observing the job, reviewing past job descriptions, interviewing job incumbents or stakeholders, or conducting a variety of job analysis techniques. (For more guidance on job analysis, see Harvey, Anderson, Baranowski, & Morath, 2007.)
- Use the guidance provided in each section of the Job Description Guide to develop specific information relevant to the organization and the job of interest.

The main source of content for the job description should be the content of the job as obtained through a job analysis. Extraneous information in a job description such as the type of person the company would like to hire can be distracting and worse yet, legally challenged by applicants if the information leads to discrimination. While two agencies may have jobs with similar titles, the type of information provided in each of their job descriptions may vary based on the services of that agency, the resources of the agency (e.g., compensation offered) and

number of staff, which in turn, impact the job duties and knowledge, skills and abilities required to perform the work. Exhibit 1 provides a list of tips for developing job descriptions.

EXHIBIT 1

TIPS FOR DEVELOPING JOB DESCRIPTIONS

1. DO give specifics. For example, rather than stating that a maintenance worker "keeps up equipment," it is better to spell out the position's requirements, which might include performing routine maintenance on assembly machines, including adjusting settings; cleaning and lubricating shafts, gears, and bearings; and dismantling and replacing defective parts.
2. Use result oriented language. As an aid in communicating performance expectations, job descriptions should be results-oriented. Results-oriented job descriptions include: 1.) the outcome/results to be accomplished; and 2.) the tasks/duties that must be performed to accomplish those duties.
3. DO use accurate adjectives. Include adjectives that describe the pace of work ("deadline-driven," "fast-paced") or the work environment ("enclosed area," "noisy setting"), but avoid flowery and overly long descriptions ("cozy but comfortable work environment that encourages creativity").
4. DON'T use subjective terms. Avoid using words that are subject to differing interpretations. Instead of saying you seek a certain attitude, cooperation, or initiative, describe expected outputs, different constituencies with whom this position interacts, and the nature of those relationships (such as "reports to," "provides support to," "supervises").
5. DON'T rely on abbreviations or jargon. A job description should be clear to applicants and employees. Abbreviations and jargon that are specific to your organization, and not to your industry, should be avoided or explained.
6. DON'T use words that raise a question of discrimination. Avoid language that would be questionable in a job listing. For example, don't use words such as "youthful" or "able-bodied."
7. DON'T list unreasonable expectations. Most managers hope their employees will exceed their expectations and take on tasks and responsibilities beyond what's required in the position, but avoid the temptation to include standards that don't currently apply to this job.
8. DON'T list excessive qualifications or experience. If you include more than what is needed to competently perform the position, you will end up with bored, overqualified workers and you will limit your ability to place otherwise qualified candidates in the position.
9. DON'T include anything derogatory or specific about a person who previously held the position. Job descriptions are not the place to air grievances or disappointments about individuals who previously held the position. You can use past experiences to help ensure all necessary information is included, but make sure you describe only the job.

Note: Adapted from HR Daily Newsletter (February 3, 2009).

Agencies should take particular care in developing Minimum Qualifications. Minimum Qualifications (MQs) should be tied to specific KSAs needed on the first day of the job. Employers should avoid using general degree requirements (e.g., college degree required) as these requirements do not necessarily relate to the minimum competence required and may inadvertently discriminate against groups protected by Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, the Age Discrimination in Employment Act (ADEA), the Rehabilitation Act of 1973 and the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) of 1990 and the ADA Amendments Act of 2008. MQs

relating to education should cite specific types of coursework needed, and should state ways that experience can substitute for education.

REFERENCES

HR Daily Advisor BLR Newsletter. 8 Do's and Don'ts for Job Descriptions in '09. Retrieved on February 3, 2009 from HRDailyAdvisor@mail55.subscribermail.com

Harvey, J. L., Anderson, L. E., Baranowski, L. E., & Morath, R. (2007). Job analysis: Gathering job-specific information. In *Applied measurement: Industrial psychology in human resources management*. (pp. 57-86). New York, NY: Taylor & Francis Group/Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Appendix F
Case Study Protocol

Case Study Protocol

TCRP Project F-14: Addressing Critical Workforce Shortages in Management

Good Morning/Afternoon, my name is Candace Cronin/Ream Lazaro and I work for ICF International/Boyd, Caton, & Grant Transportation Group. On behalf of the Transit Cooperative Research Program (TCRP), we are currently conducting a case study of transit organizations such as yours to identify recruitment, development and retention challenges and solutions specific to management jobs. Your transit system stood out to us as one implementing best practices to recruit, develop and retain managers. One of our panel members ___ suggested you would be an excellent source for information about the practices your transit system has implemented to address workforce shortages for management positions. Thank you for taking the time to speak with us today. We estimate this interview will last approximately 90 minutes.

Our goal in speaking with you is to better understand the unique challenges your organization faces in staffing management positions. Our questions also focus on identifying the techniques your agency uses to recruit, retain and develop its managers. As a result of the data we collect, we will identify innovative and best practices for addressing critical manager workforce shortages.

We would also like to let you know that a recorder will be taking detailed notes of our conversation today just for our review purposes as we prepare the report. While we would like to recognize your agency when we list best practices, we will not attribute any comments you make about challenges to you or your organization. Is this okay with you?

Finally, the data will be combined by our analysis team to identify successful strategies implemented by agency type and challenge. In appreciation for your participation, we will provide you with a summary of our findings across 20 case studies.

[Interviewer note: You may find it necessary to clarify that for this study, we are primarily focused on managerial staff. Those are the senior level individuals in the top-level roles of the organization. These questions do not refer to general supervisory staff who may reside at all levels of the organization.]

I. Background information on participants

1. Please briefly describe your position and responsibilities.
2. Please briefly describe the legal structure of your organization and the service delivery models you utilize, e.g., fixed route, deviated fixed route, ADA paratransit, and general public demand response (serve all populations; non-ADA specific).
3. Please describe the size of your organization in terms of personnel and vehicles.
4. Generally, how would you describe the employee demographics of your agency?

- a. Younger vs. Older workforce?
- b. Male/Female ratio?
- c. Ethnic diversity?

II. Recruitment practices

Transition: Now that I have a better sense for the composition of your transit system, I would like to ask you some questions to help me better understand your human resource practices especially your recruitment challenges and practices.

5. Who is responsible for the human resource functions (e.g., recruitment; hiring; training) within your transit system?
 - a. Is there a specific Human Resource division?
 - b. Is there a designated recruiter(s) or are non-HR employees tasked with recruitment?
 - c. How are decisions made about who is hired as a manager? Who are the key decision-makers about whether to hire someone?

6. What are two of the greatest challenges your transit system has had to overcome in recruiting and selecting for manager jobs? (*note: possible examples listed-only mention if participant needs help*)
 - Geographic location (getting people to relocate here)
 - Dealing with unions
 - Recruitment budget
 - Finding managers who have technical skills
 - Finding managers who have people management skills
 - Finding managers who can manage multiple functions within our organization
 - Internal recruitment (promoting from within your agency)
 - External recruitment (identifying new talent from outside your agency)
 - Competition from other transportation agencies
 - Competition from other industries
 - Reaching an ethnically diverse applicant pool
 - Reaching female applicants
 - Changing stereotypes about the industry (making it look appealing)
 - Reaching a younger population

7. How did your organization address these challenges?
 - a. What approach/strategies were used? (*Note: Possible examples listed*)
 - Social networking sites (e.g., Facebook, Twitter, MySpace, etc)
 - Your organization's website
 - National Transportation Association(s)
 - Local Transportation Association(s)
 - Minority Association(s) and conference(s)
 - Advertisement in trade journals and/or magazines
 - Targeting talent inside our organization
 - Target talent at other transportation agencies
 - Target talent in other industries
 - Target retirees
 - Target military veterans
 - Build partnerships between hiring managers and recruiters
 - Align recruitment practices with other organizational processes

- Job boards (e.g., Monster.com, HotJobs.com, CareerBuilder.com)
 - Job Aggregators (e.g., Indeed.com)
 - Partner with community colleges
 - Partner with universities that offer courses in transit
 - Identify universities that have a student-run bus system
- b. What were the steps you took to implement this practice?
 - c. Were partnerships formed?/Which ones? (e.g., partnering with minority membership associations)
 - d. What resources were needed?
8. In the past 2-3 years which management positions have been filled at your transit agency?
[make a list]
 - a. Would you please describe the process used to both recruit and then select for each of these managerial positions?
 - b. Please share how you filled each of these positions. (e.g., through internal promotion or through recruitment of a new employee)
 9. From which labor sources does your organization most commonly seek applicants for manager jobs? (e.g., other transit agencies, other non-transit public or private sector organizations; internal talent)
 - a. Which of these sources tend to produce the highest quality applicants (with relevant skill sets)?
 10. Please describe your agency's methods for marketing manager opportunities to potential candidates.
 - e.g., use of newspapers, media ads in industry publications, through transit associations, social networking sites (MySpace, LinkedIn, Facebook), job crawler sites (Indeed; Simply Hired))
 11. Who are your competitors for manager candidates?
 - a. What is it about those systems/industries that make them competitive in recruiting candidates?
 12. What mix of external and internal recruiting does your agency use to fill manager jobs?
 - a. How do you balance the need for technical transit knowledge and skills with the need for generic leadership/management/interpersonal knowledge and skills?
 - b. Does your agency use any formal or informal assessment process to identify internal talent for potential advancement?
 13. Please describe your organization's applicant assessment process once you have identified potential recruits.
 - a. What methods does your organization use to screen applicants?
 - b. What selection methods do you use to identify the best candidates and ultimately make job offers?
 14. Please describe any challenges your transit system has faced in maintaining diversity in the workforce?

- a. What are some possible solutions to these challenges? (e.g, partnerships with associations?)
15. What trends has your transit system experienced in recruitment in the last 3 years?
- a. Has anything changed over the last 6 months?
 - b. How have you responded to changes?
 - c. How have recent economic changes both nationally and locally impacted your recruitment efforts?

III. Training & Development

Transition: I would like to move us into discussing the training and development of managers now.

16. Please start by describing how your organization is structured to execute your manager training and development initiatives.
- a. For example, which departments or individuals have organizational responsibility for the design, delivery and evaluation of your agency's training and development programs?
 - b. Who typically conducts the training?
 - c. To what extent are trainings developed in-house or bought from an external source?
17. What are two of the greatest challenges your organization has faced and successfully addressed in the training and development of managers?
- Small training budget
 - Make v. buy decisions
 - Finding time to training managers
 - Conducting on-the-job training
 - Compensating for training participation
 - Transfer of training (from the class to the job)
 - Dealing with unions
 - Identify high potentials
 - Losing high potential managers to other transportation agencies
 - Losing high potential managers to other industries
 - Developing ethnically diverse managers
 - Developing female managers
 - Lack of succession planning strategy within your organization
 - Lack of support for manager development by senior leaders
 - Finding the optimal balance of technical and leadership training
18. How did your organization address these challenges?
- a. Please describe the steps you took to implement new training and development (T&D) practices.
 - b. Please describe the type of training and development implemented.
 - c. What are some challenges you encountered in implementing this new approach or type of T&D training?
19. Which training and development initiatives have proved most successful for equipping managers with the appropriate knowledge, skills and abilities? *Please be specific about*

why those initiatives have succeeded and what your organization did to make that happen.

- In-house classroom training
- External classroom training
- In-house web trainings
- Web trainings development by external vendors
- Professional Development (PD) provided by National Transportation Association(s)
- PD provided by Local Transportation Association(s)
- PD provided by other industries
- Succession planning strategies
- Aligning performance measures with development goals
- Administering training needs assessments
- Partner with community colleges
- Partner with universities
- Networking internally to identify high potentials
- Networking with other organizations to identify high potentials
- Monetary incentives
- Recommending reading to managers
- Providing defined career paths
- Job rotations
- Knowledge management systems to pass on intellectual capital
- Formal mentor and/or coaching programs
- Informal mentor and/or coaching programs

- a. For your transit system, what are the key objectives for individual participants in any managerial training programs they are assigned to attend?
 - i. What skills are the primary focus of most training and development offered to managers? (technical v. leadership)
- b. What does your transit system do to help managers apply what they have learned during training back to the actual job?

20. Please describe the approach your transit system typically uses to train and develop its managers (new hires as well as current employees).

- a. How is training delivered (Onsite: virtual v. classroom)?
- b. Is it conducted in-house or contracted to an education provider?
- c. Do you send managers to offsite training opportunities? If so, what type?
- d. Do you use a mentorship program? If so, please describe?
- e. Describe the degree of formality of programs (training courses to informal mentoring).
- f. Do you utilize a job rotation program?
- g. Do you have a formal succession planning program? If so, how does it work?

21. Would you please describe the extent to which manager training and development initiatives are aligned with other key organizational practices in your agency?

- a. Specified career paths?
- b. Performance appraisals/ Individual development plans (IDPs)?
- c. Core competencies?
- d. Succession planning?
- e. Recruitment and/or retention strategies?

22. How is participation in manager training and development initiatives encouraged?
 - a. To what extent is training and development mandatory?
 - b. How are opportunities communicated throughout the organization?
23. How is the decision made about who should participate in managerial training and development?
 - a. What percentage of newly hired or experienced managers participate in training and development opportunities each year?
 - b. What are the highest and lowest levels in your organization who are included in manager training and development programs?

IV. Retention Practices

Transition: Now that we have discussed your recruitment, training and development practices, I would like to gather some information on retention and turnover of managers at your system.

24. Would you please provide me data on turnover and years of employment for your managers, by position?
25. What are the major factors that contribute to retention of managers in your organization?
 - a. What components of the job and/or organization are most important to managers?
 - b. What factors of the job/organization seem to promote organizational commitment/tenure?
 - c. If people leave, what are the main reasons?
26. What are some practices your organization has changed or recently implemented due to their impact on manager retention? (*lessons learned*)
27. When managers leave your transit system for other employment where do they tend to go? (i.e., what types of positions and employers.)
28. What approaches has your agency implemented to help retain managers?
 - Modifying/adopting new salary and benefit packages?
 - Adapting work arrangements (flexible scheduling; telework; phased retirement)?
 - New training and career advancement opportunities?
29. What techniques does your organization use to study trends in manager turnover?
 - a. To what extent does your system use exit interviews, engagement surveys or other survey instruments?
 - b. What metrics does your organization use to measure manager turnover?
30. What trends has your agency experienced in retention in the last 3 years?
 - a. To what extent has there been a change in turnover rates from year to year? Why do you think this change has occurred?
 - b. What has changed over the last 6 months due to the impact of the national or local economy?
 - c. How have you responded to these changes?

V. Additional Effective Practices in Manager Workforce Development

31. What are some of the lessons learned/ advice you would give to another transit organization to help enhance their recruitment, development and retention of managers?
 - a. Please briefly describe some successful programs or initiatives that your transit agency tried in order to meet recruitment, development or retention challenges, and why they did work.
 - b. Please briefly describe some programs or initiatives that your transit agency tried that did not work so well and why they did not work.

32. What are some of your transit agency's future strategic goals and objectives as they relate to recruiting, developing and retaining qualified managers?

That concludes our key questions. Thank you for your time today.

Do you have anything else you would like to share with us regarding approaches to staffing management positions?

We are scheduled to complete this project in [month] at which time we will provide you with a summary of our findings. In the meantime, if you have any questions, feel free to contact Dr. Candace Blair Cronin (512-388-3387 or ccronin@icfi.com).

Appendix G

Focus Group Study Description

Description of TCRP Study for Potential Participants

Quick Overview: We would like to ask you to participate in a 1-hour focus group with other senior-level professionals (e.g., HR directors; senior managers; personnel/training coordinators) to discuss recruitment, retention and development practices implemented by your organization to fill manager positions.

Purpose of Study: We are conducting a benchmarking study for the Transit Cooperative Research Program (TCRP), an arm of the Transportation Research Board, that provides research and resources to all types of transit agencies throughout the United States. The focus of the study is on recruitment, retention and development of individuals into management positions (middle and upper management). They would like us to identify best practices from other industries in addressing workforce shortages, filling positions, recruiting, retaining, and developing managers. We are identifying prospective companies based on: 1.) similarity of services to transit agencies (e.g., managing a large fleet like USPS; Fed Ex), 2.) similarity of job types (e.g., police do substantial dispatching so their best practices will be relevant to Manager of Dispatch/Scheduling in transit agencies), and 3.) having a representation of public and private sector (the panel specifically requested we collect data from private sector).

Specifically, you have been selected to participate in this study based on some of the effective practices your organization has implemented in these areas. We invite you to join a telephone-based focus group where you will have an opportunity to share best practices of your company with other industry leaders. The focus group format will encourage an open dialogue and allow you to identify effective personnel practices implemented by other organizations.

What is Required to Participate?: We ask that you contribute one hour of your time to participate in this focus group. The focus group will be conducted over the phone using a 1-800 conference call line. We will also send you a link to a simple-to-use Live Meeting platform which will allow you to view notes recorded throughout the meeting. The facilitator will send out simple instructions prior to the meeting so you can access Live Meeting if you wish. If you do not have access to a computer or the Internet, Live Meeting use is not required. It is simply provided as a resource to you.

Benefit of Participation: In addition to meeting other individuals in similar positions within a variety of public and private sector companies, you will hear examples of best practices that you may use as a benchmark for refining your own company's personnel practices. Furthermore, we will provide you with a summary report that outlines the findings from all of our focus groups, not just the one in which you participate. This report is essentially equivalent to a full benchmarking study which will be provided to you for the cost of 1 hour of your time to participate in the group. We intend to feature each company who participates in the report. To address confidentiality concerns, we will present best practices in aggregate form and ensure specific responses are non-attributable.

When Can I Participate?: Here are some date options. We encourage you to choose from one of the first two options. If those do not work, we have provided alternate options.

Thursday March 19: 2:00-3:00pm EST

Tuesday March 24: 3:00-4:00pm EST

Alternate dates:

Wednesday March 25: 3:00-4:00pm EST

Thursday March 26: 12:00-1:00pm EST

Please RVSP to Michelle Pohl at MPohl@icfi.com or (703) 934-3672

Questions about the study? Contact Candace Blair Cronin, Ph.D. at (512) 388-3387 or ccronin@icfi.com

Thank you for your consideration of this opportunity. We hope you can join us!
Candace

Appendix H
Focus Group Confirmation Email

Focus Group Confirmation Email

Dear x,

Thank you for agreeing to participate in our focus group to discuss the recruitment, retention, and development of managers. You will be participating in the focus group on **March x, from x - x PM (EST)**. The conference call number for the discussion is **1-800-###-####**; you will be prompted to enter an **Access Code which is #####**. You will receive a subsequent email with the Live Meeting access information. If you have access to a computer during the call, you may use the Live Meeting access link to see the notes from our discussion as the facilitator records them. It is not required you access Live Meeting to participate in the focus group.

To facilitate participant introductions, we are requesting a bio from each participant prior to the focus group. Your bio should be a paragraph or two and include information about your current position, your areas of expertise, and any other information you think will be useful for focus group members to know. In addition, if you have any documents from your organization that pertain to recruitment, retention, or development practices of managers that would supplement comments you will share in the focus group, please email them along with your bio to mpohl@icfi.com by **March x**.

Thanks again for your participation. We think you will find this to be a valuable study. We look forward to speaking with you!

Appendix I

Benchmarking Focus Group Protocol

Benchmarking Focus Group Protocol
TCRP Project F-14: Addressing Critical Workforce Shortages in
Management
DRAFT: 3-9-09

ICF International

I. Background information on participants

1. Please share your name (first name only is fine) and the name of the company you represent. [Note to facilitator: We anticipate collecting participant bios in advance- that include title and responsibilities- and will share with all participants prior to the meeting.]
2. Please briefly describe the size of your organization and types of services provided by your organization.

II. Recruitment practices

3. What challenges does your organization and companies in your industry face in recruiting and selecting managers?
4. Please describe the strategies and methods your company uses to address some of these challenges.

Additional questions (if time permits- ranked in order of importance):

5. What processes does your company use to identify the appropriate (rightly skilled) candidates for management jobs?
6. How are human resource functions (e.g., recruitment activities) organized within your company?

III. Training & Development

7. What challenges does your organization and companies in your industry face in the areas of training?
8. Please describe how your company typically trains and develops its managers (new hires as well as current employees).

Additional questions (if time permits- ranked in order of importance):

9. Which training and development initiatives have proved most successful for equipping managers with the appropriate knowledge, skills and abilities? Please be specific about why those initiatives have succeeded and what your organization did to make that happen.

10. Please describe how participation in manager training and development initiatives is determined.

IV. Retention Practices

11. What challenges does your organization and companies in your industry face in the areas of retention?
12. What are the major factors that contribute to retention of managers in your organization?
 - a. What components of the job and/or organization are most important to managers?
 - b. What factors of the job/organization seem to promote organizational commitment/tenure? Which seem to lead to turnover?
 - c. What are some practices your organization has changed due to their impact on manager retention? (*lessons learned*)

Additional questions (if time permits- ranked in order of importance):

13. What techniques does your organization use to study trends in manager turnover?
 - a. e.g., Exit interviews?
 - b. What metrics does your organization use to measure manager turnover?

V. Additional Effective Practices in Manager Workforce Development

14. What are some of the lessons learned/ advice you would give to another organizations struggling with manager workforce shortages?
15. Has anything changed in your recruitment, development, training and retention practices over the last 6 months due to the economy (e.g., practices; processes; challenges)?

Additional question if time permits:

16. What are some of your company's future strategic goals and objectives as they pertain to addressing shortages in qualified managers?